

# JOINT REVIEW MISSION REPORT

of the

## International Fund for Agricultural Development



*The Bondas of Malkangiri in Orissa, a Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Group, with their finest dress*

Country:	<b>India</b>
Programme:	<b>Orissa Tribal Empowerment &amp; Livelihoods Programme</b>
Date:	<b>November 2-17, 2009</b>
Report No.	<b>2151-IN</b>

INTERNATIONAL  
FUND FOR  
AGRICULTURAL  
DEVELOPMENT

FONDS  
INTERNATIONAL  
DE DÉVELOPPEMENT  
AGRICOLE

FONDO  
INTERNACIONAL  
DE DESARROLLO  
AGRICOLA

الصندوق  
الدولي للتنمية  
الزراعية

## Table of Contents

SI No	Topics	Page No
1	Currency equivalents and Weights & Measures	3
2	Abbreviations	3
3	Map of Orissa showing the programme areas	5
4	A. Introduction	6
5	B. Overall Assessment of Project Implementation Progress	6
6	1. Physical achievements since the previous JRM	6
7	2. Key areas of concern	7
8	3. Gender focus	7
9	4. Poverty focus	8
10	5. Effectiveness of targeting	8
11	6. Action taken on recommendations of previous JRM	8
12	C. Outputs and Outcomes by Components	9
13	1. CBOs, Empowerment and Technical Capacity Building	10
14	2. Village Development and Livelihoods Plan	10
15	3. Livelihoods System Enhancement	11
16	D. Project Implementation Performance	15
17	E. Fiduciary Aspects	17
18	F. Sustainability	19
19	G. Impacts	20
20	H. Conclusion	21
21	Appendix 1: Summary of Project Status and Ratings	25
22	Appendix 2: Progress against previous mission recommendations	30
23	Appendix 3: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; Disbursement by category and by component	41
24	Appendix 4: Compliance with financing agreement covenants: status of implementation	44
25	Appendix 5: Physical progress measured against AWPB	54
26	Appendix 6: RIMS table	62
27	Appendix 7: Knowledge Management: Learning and Innovation	66
28	Appendix 8: Audit Log	69
30	Appendix 9: Supervision mission schedule and persons met	75
	<b>Annex I: Technical Reports</b>	
31	Annex I A: Community Development, Institution Building & Micro-finance	77
32	Annex I B: Financial Management & Procurement	85
33	Annex I C: Rural Microfinance and Gender	91
34	Annex I D: Natural Resources Management & Livelihoods	96
35	Annex I E: Tribal Development & Empowerment	109
36	Annex I F: Climate Change	115
37	Annex I G: ICRISAT-IFAD Grant Fund Interventions	123
38	<b>Annex II: Additional annexure determined by the Mission</b>	
39	Annex II A: Consolidated agreed actions and dates	126
40	Annex II B: Proceeding of the Stakeholders Meeting	128

### **Currency Equivalents**

Currency Unit	=	Indian Rupee (INR)
USD 1.00	=	INR 47
INR 1.00	=	USD 0.021

### **Weights and Measures**

1 kilogram (kg)	=	2.204 pounds (lb)
1000 kg	=	1 metric tonne (t)
1 kilometre (km)	=	0.62 miles (mi)
1 metre (m)	=	1.09 yards (yd)
1 square metre (m <sup>2</sup> )	=	10.76 square feet (ft <sup>2</sup> )
1 acre (ac)	=	0.405 ha
1 hectare (ha)	=	2.47 acres
1 Lakh	=	100,000

### **Acronyms & Glossary**

AR	Appraisal Report
ATMA	Agriculture Technology Management Agency
AWPB	Annual Work Plan and Budget
BAIF	BAIF Development Research Foundation
BDP	Business Development Plan
BPL	Below Poverty Line
BRGF	Backward Area Grant Fund
CBO	Community Based Organization
CES	Consulting Engineering Services
CHV	Community Health Volunteer
CIF	Community Infrastructure Fund
CIG	Common Interest Group
CM	Community Mobiliser
CTCRI	Central Tuber Crop Research Institute
DEA	Department of Economic Affairs
DIF	Development Initiative Fund
DFID	Department for International Development
DGPS	Digital Geographic Positioning System
DPMC	District Planning and Monitoring Committee
ETS	Earth Total Station
FFS	Farmers Field School
FNGO	Facilitating Non Governmental Organization
FO	Field Office
FRA	Forest Rights Act
FRC	Forest Rights Committee
FY	Financial Year / Fiscal Year
GoO	Government of Orissa
ICRISAT	International Centre for Research in Semi-Arid Tropics
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IGA	Income Generating Activity
INM	Integrated Nutrient Management
INR	Indian Rupee
IPM	Integrated Pest Management

ITDA	Integrated Tribal Development Agency
JFM	Joint Forest Management
JRM	Joint Review Mission
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
MIS	Management Information System
MT	Matric Ton
MTR	Mid Term Review
MWS	Micro Watershed
NABARD	National Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NREGS	National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme
NRHM	National Rural Health Mission
NRLM	National Rural Livelihood Mission
NTFP	Non-Timber Forest Produce
OAS	Orissa Administrative Service
OCTMP	Orissa Community Tank Management Project
OGLSR	Orissa Government Land Settlement Rule
OPLEA	Orissa Prevention of Land Encroachment Act
OTELP	Orissa Tribal Empowerment and Livelihoods Programme
PD	Programme Director
PESA	Panchayati Raj Extension to Scheduled Areas Act
PFM	Participatory Forest Management
PLA	Programme Loan Agreement
<i>Podu</i>	Shifting Cultivation
PO(PME)	Programme Officer (Planning, Monitoring & Evaluation)
PRA	Participatory Rural Appraisal
PRADAN	Professional Assistance for Development Action
PRI	Panchayati Raj Institution
PST	Procurement Support Team
PSU	Programme Support Unit
PVC	Poly Vinyl Chloride
PTG	Primitive Tribe Group
RFS	Rural Financial Service
RO-AWPB	Result Oriented Annual Work Plan and Budget
SALT	Sloping Agricultural Land Technology
SC	Scheduled Caste
SCA	Special Central Assistance
SCAMPIS	A Project on Productive Sanitation
SGSY	Swarnajayanti Gram Swarajgar Yojana
SHG	Self Help Group
SMI	System of Millet Intensification
SMS	Subject Matter Specialist
SOE	Statement of Expenditure
SPS	<i>Samaj Pragati Sahyog</i>
SRI	System of Rice Intensification
ST	Scheduled Tribe
ST/SCDD	Schedule Tribes & Scheduled Castes Development Department
SWEET	Sloping Watershed Environment and Engineering Technology
TA	Technical Assistance
TRIPTI	Targeted Rural Initiative for Poverty Termination and Infrastructure
UC	Utilization Certificate
UG	User Group
VDA	Village Development Association
VDC	Village Development Committee
VDF	Village Development Fund

VDLP	Village Development and Livelihoods Plan
VEC	Village Education Committee
VLSAFSC	Village Level Social Audit & Financial Sub Committee
VLSC	Village Level Sub Committee
VSS	<i>Van Sakrakshan Samiti</i>
VV	Village Volunteers
<i>Wadi</i>	Orchard on agro-forestry model
WASSAN	Watershed Support Services and Activities Network
WDC	Watershed Development Committee
WDT	Watershed Development Team
WFP	World Food Programme
WOTR	Watershed Organization Trust
WSC	Watershed Sub-Committee

**Map of Orissa showing the programme areas**



## INDIA

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme - IN-585

Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009

### Aide-mémoire

#### A. Introduction<sup>1</sup>

1. IFAD fielded a mission to jointly review the performance of the Orissa Tribal Empowerment and Livelihoods Programme (OTELP) and its achievements since the previous JRM in November 2008. The team (in three different groups) visited a total of 43 villages (9 Phase I and 34 Phase II villages in 29 blocks) covering all seven project districts, viz. Gajapati, Koraput, Kalahandi, Kandhamal, Malkangiri, Nabarangpur and Rayagada. The Mission particularly focused on capacity building for empowerment, livelihood enhancement, support for policy initiatives, development initiatives fund, project management and fiduciary aspects besides issues of convergence, rural financial services, tribal development and climate change as requested by the project.

2. The Mission met with senior staff at the PSU, concerned ITDAs and FNGOs to ascertain their assessment of progress and identify areas of concern. It reviewed the detailed Progress Report from the PSU for the period November 2008–September 2009. Presentations were made by respective consultants and RNGOs on implementation of strategies for gender mainstreaming, communication, collective marketing and rural financial services. Upon conclusion of field visits the Mission members participated in a day-long stakeholders workshop attended by the Principal Secretary to the Government of Orissa in the Scheduled Tribes and Scheduled Castes Development Department, staff from PSU, concerned ITDAs, FNGOs, RNGOs and project consultants. Besides debriefing by the Mission, presentations were made at the workshop on preliminary results from studies on Impact Assessment, Exit Strategy and scaling up the Solar Electrification Initiative.

#### B. Overall Assessment of Project Implementation Progress

##### Physical Achievements since the Previous JRM

3. The project has been extended to 11 blocks in three new districts, namely, Malkangiri, Nabarangpur and Rayagada since the previous JRM, bringing on board 11 FNGOs. With this, the project is now fully operational, covering 1,034 villages in 358 micro-watersheds in 30 blocks across seven districts. Of these 390 villages in 135 micro watersheds are from Phase I of the project and would now begin the consolidation phase. Almost 80 percent of the 56,180 households served by the project are from Scheduled Tribes and another 15 percent from Scheduled Castes.

4. Since the previous JRM, 328 more villages have been covered where 214 VDCs, 561 VLSCs and 1,282 SHGs have been formed and 87 SHGs have been linked with

---

<sup>1</sup>/Mr. Deep C. Joshi (Community & Rural Institution Development & Team Leader), Mr. Ganesh Neelam (Natural Resource Management & Livelihoods), Dr. K.S. Murali (Climate Change), Ms Sandhya Tamrakar (Rural Financial Services & Gender), Mr. Sudhir Muralidharan (Financial Management), Dr. G.J. Patra (ICRISAT consultant), Ms. Supriya Patnaik (DFID, India), and Mr. Vincent Darlong (Tribal Development). WFP officials in respective districts participated in the mission while Dr. Virinder Sharma, DFID India participated in the stakeholders' workshop. Mr. Basant Bal, State Director, WDP participated in the wrap up meeting with the GoO. The JRM gratefully acknowledges the active participation and contributions made to this review by Mr. Deepak Mohanty, PD, OTELP, and senior staff from OTELP, ITDA and FNGOs.

banks, securing Rs 170 lakh (USD 365,000) as loans. The project constructed 651 water bodies, creating additional irrigation potential of 2,222 ha that would benefit 3,043 households.

5. The project organised 3,939 training events for communities and CBOs and 1,466 training events for individuals, including vocational training for youth since the previous JRM. In the same period, it imparted training to 214 personnel from FNGOs and line departments. Using DFID Technical Assistance through the PST, the project contracted consultants to seek inputs on issues such as gender mainstreaming, communication and documentation, project's impact, rural financial services, exit strategy, etc.

### **Key Areas of Concern**

6. Literacy in project villages is very low, especially among women, with most people able to converse only in dialects specific to the respective tribes, not spoken by outsiders. This poses great challenges in communication, leave alone record keeping and accounting by CBOs. The quality of personnel working in villages, in terms of sensitivity, motivation and experience is therefore critical and is a matter of concern. Sustained efforts are needed to mitigate this through continued training, review and reflection.

7. As spelt out in the Appraisal Report, the project is broadly following what came to be known as the 'watershed plus' approach, combining interventions for 'safe disposal of runoff', use of available water sources for irrigation and various on- and off-farm livelihood activities. While there are significant variations in the nature of the terrain and micro-climate across project villages, all are in highly vulnerable ecologies. Inappropriate management systems in the past by very poor communities trying to eke out a living in a conflict-ridden resource ownership regime have wrought in significant resource degradation. Needed therefore are integrated and comprehensive resource management strategies that are ecologically regenerative as well as economically remunerative for the inhabitants. This is in tune with the emerging perspective that watershed development is about managing hydrologically bounded landscapes to sustainably enhance livelihoods. The Mission recommends bringing on board, through sustained expert inputs and exposure, the latest perspective, knowledge and know-how on integrated natural resource management strategies to foster economic growth with ecological security.

8. The project has broken new ground by reaching the hitherto isolated and unreached, kindled hope and generated excitement among people so far on the fringes and has mobilised civil society on a significant scale. Longer engagement and larger investments would, however, be needed to lead these communities on a path of self-sustaining growth and integration with the mainstream with dignity. With this perspective, as recommended by the previous JRM, convergence of government programmes, such as NREGS, BRGF, ATMA, Article 275 transfers, etc. calls for focused and systematic efforts.

9. DFID's funding beyond March 2010 is unlikely. DFID's representative in the JRM clarified that DFID is yet to formally respond to the request of the Government of Orissa in this regard. It would therefore be prudent to explore alternative financial arrangements, anticipating non-continuation of DFID's funding beyond March 2010.

10. Unspent balances outstanding with VDCs and VLSCs out of funds released by the PSU are not fully represented by the bank balances available with them; the difference is approximately Rs 210 lakh or USD 450,000. This needs to be urgently reconciled.

### **Gender Focus**

11. Almost all women in project villages have been organised into SHGs; those left out are women in recently nucleated families and the newly married. Women's

participation in various community forums and CBOs is universal, though men almost always constitute a majority by one (10 out of 19 and so on) in executive bodies. Formal leadership of CBOs other than SHGs is most often male, in some cases, as the women explained during interaction, due to ignorance that they too could be chosen for these positions, and in others because of the literacy bias among project staff. Distinctly lower literacy among women, besides blocking their induction into leadership of mixed forums, also leaves them utterly dependent on men book keepers.

12. While women in formal leadership roles were vocal and articulate, the majority generally remained mute during interactions with the Mission. Rotational leadership among SHGs would enhance broader participation.

13. Women in some villages have successfully fought against rampant drinking and brewing of liquor; others have successfully advocated moderation in traditional revelry during festivals which often adversely affects economic activity, especially wage earning.

14. Village volunteers are mostly men, as are personnel in FNGOs, ITDAs and the PSU. Previous JRMs too have pointed this out. There seems no reason not to have women as village volunteers, especially as much of their work is with women.

15. Gender issues need to be systematically incorporated into village planning – in setting priorities and making choices – as well as in reporting. Innovations like drinking water, sanitation and smokeless *chulhas* that reduce drudgery for women need to be disseminated and taken up across watersheds through the planning process.

### **Poverty Focus**

16. The project works with very poor people, including the PTGs. While there clearly are differences across villages and even within villages, overall the project has a clear poverty focus. The presence of Scheduled Tribes, Castes, landless and BPL households is a key criterion in watershed selection. Overall ST and SC constitute over 95 percent of the population and 75 percent of the project households are listed as BPL, of which 8 percent are absolutely landless and 70 percent own less than 1 standard acre of land.

### **Effectiveness of Targeting**

17. The project provides for seeking out and working with the most vulnerable. Its translation on the ground, however, depends on the processes followed. As the entire population is very poor, there is a danger that the most vulnerable might escape attention. The Mission came across instances of widows not borrowing from SHGs even as others had borrowed; a person afflicted with leprosy not being attended; another with a cleft lip not sought out, etc. Without facilitation, SHGs, VDCs and VLSCs may not seek out the most vulnerable. Also, since the priority and focus of the majority is on the large investments the project brings for physical works, the question of seeking out the most vulnerable can fall through the cracks unless specifically highlighted. Finally, widespread illiteracy and the resultant language barrier inhibit project personnel from interacting with the poorest as they are least likely to speak Oriya and generally stay in the shadows. The Mission recommends that special attention be paid to this issue not only in quantitative monitoring but also while training personnel, volunteers and CBO leaders.

### **Action Taken on Recommendations of Previous JRM**

18. Action has been taken in varying degrees on most of the recommendations of the previous JRM. Specifically:

- i. Meetings at the highest levels have recently been held to facilitate systematic convergence of government programmes. Concrete strategies are yet to be worked out and convergence remains sporadic, dependent on the pro-action of local officials.

- ii. Progress has been made in implementing the FRA<sup>2</sup> through active involvement of the FNGOs. This is still work-in-progress and issues remain regarding the area allotted, allocation of Reserve Forest land in some districts, allocation of land for common usage and exclusion of people resident in neighbouring villages.
- iii. Involvement of the Forest Department remains low. While Vana Suraksa Samities have been formed in several villages, work on forest areas is sporadic and marginal.
- iv. While micro-watersheds in the second phase have been taken in contiguous patches, coverage of entire Gram Panchayats is rare.
- v. Placement of OAS staff in ITDAs has improved. Since the PA (ITDA) and PO (PME) play a critical role in project management, careful selection and continuity of these functionaries needs continued attention of the Government.
- vi. Attempts have been made to improve coordination with banks though bank linkages remain marginal.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
1. Review quality of personnel engaged in villages and enhance quality through periodic capacity building	PSU, ITDA, NGOs	By Mar 2010
2. Seek expert inputs on Integrated Natural Resource Management strategies	PSU, ITDA, NGOs	By Jun 2010
3. Introduce systematic convergence with various government schemes	GoO, PSU, ITDA	By Mar 2010

### C. Outputs and Outcomes, by Component

19. The project seeks to organise tribal people into sustainable CBOs and link them to mainstream institutions like government agencies, banks and fair markets. Providing land to the landless under existing laws and schemes, sustainably enhancing the productivity of available natural resources, creating additional livelihoods for households without adequate land and fostering a favourable policy environment are also part of the project strategy. Considerable progress has been made in settling land in favour of the landless though the quantum of land so settled remains modest and in most cases inadequate to support a family. The Mission recommends a review of land ownership once the current process of land distribution and recording of rights is completed.

20. Land productivity depends *inter alia* on soil moisture. Since widespread irrigation is not feasible in the project area and rainfall, though high, occurs mainly during the three monsoon months, reducing rainwater run-off from every inch of land through *in-situ* measures is the key to enhancing the moisture regime across the terrain. *In-situ* rainwater harvesting extends soil moisture beyond the rainy season and makes production of useful bio-mass feasible. This is not being paid adequate attention as the focus is on discrete structures to harvest run-off and utilise water from springs and streams and needs to be systematically incorporated in village level planning processes.

21. Focused attention is also needed on enhancing productivity of various farming systems, especially agriculture, livestock rearing and the use of homesteads. This needs to be incorporated in the annual planning process at all levels in the project.

22. Opportunities for non-farm enterprises and skill based employment are limited in the project area given a largely agrarian and subsistence-oriented economy. Opportunities exist in rearing small ruminants, especially goats as sources of livelihoods for the landless and need to be developed systematically as enterprises.

<sup>2</sup> The Scheduled Tribes and Other Traditional Forest Dwellers (Recognition of Forest Rights) Act, 2006.

Processing of farm and forest produce is another, though more modest, livelihood source that can be developed.

### **CBOs, Empowerment & Capacity Building**

23. The project has so far formed 349 VDCs, 846 VLSCs and 777 Village Level Financial and Social Audit Sub-Committees across project villages; 248 VDCs now registered are eligible to receive project funds. The project has promoted or adopted 3,732 SHGs, mostly of women, and 6,789 Users' Groups.

24. The Mission witnessed high level of excitement among the people it met in villages. Regular government presence being thin in these remote villages, many said this was their first experience of government as a development agency. A few in the CBOs were articulate and knowledgeable about the project but many stayed in the background.

25. As the CBOs have to carry out project-related tasks and report on the same and the WDT members are mostly not conversant with local dialects, there is a tendency to promote the literate as leaders and volunteers, through whom interaction occurs with the community. This can unwittingly create gate-keepers, introduce differentiation in hitherto homogenous communities, inhibit transparency and eventually hurt post-project sustainability of the CBOs. In this respect the recommendation of the previous JRM about introduction of rotational leadership remains relevant and needs to be pursued and continually monitored. Simultaneously, training needs to be imparted on issues of democratic governance in CBOs and inclusion of the most marginal and least vocal.

26. Low levels of literacy in project villages inhibit proper record keeping and may affect transparency with regard to financial transactions. In this context, the recommendation of the previous JRM to introduce literacy remains relevant and needs to be pursued.

27. The quality of WDT personnel is highly variable and generally poor. Very few are engineers and agriculture/veterinary science graduates. Most lack diagnostic and design capability and can hardly be called experts; they can at best promote known recipes/ solutions. The fixed composition of the WDT including the disciplines of engineering, agriculture, micro-finance, livestock, forestry and capacity building needs re-examining. Ideally, the team should comprise of agriculture engineers, agriculture graduates and persons trained/experienced in Community Development. Of course, everyone working in villages must be able to engage sensitively and empathetically with poor people and such orientation can be imparted through training. The Mission recommends a review of this situation, especially in the Phase II areas.

28. There is a large contingent of village level workers, mostly local youth, educated till 8<sup>th</sup> to 12<sup>th</sup> standard. There is one Community Mobiliser (CM) at a VDC reporting to the FNGO, a Secretary for each VDC nominally reporting to the VDC and six Village Volunteers (VVs) for each VDC (1 to 3 villages). The CM is paid Rs 2,000 a month, the Secretary Rs 750 and the VVs Rs 300. While they serve as links between the WDT and the village community, their effectiveness as change makers and accountability to village communities is questionable. Extension and community mobilisation work in villages ought to be done by WDT members and village functionaries/volunteer(s)/community resource person(s) be chosen by the people, including the level and mode of payment of remuneration, if any, as and when the need arises. The Mission recommends a review of this arrangement, especially in Phase II areas.

### **Village Development & Livelihoods Plan (VDLP)**

29. Entry Point Activities have been completed in Phase II villages. VDLPs have been prepared in all 113 Phase II villages in the old districts and initiated in the new districts. While planning is participatory, the content of plans is largely driven by a

menu of pre-set activities, such as water diversion structures, boulder checks, etc. WDTs have limited capacity to guide village communities to develop comprehensive natural resource development and livelihood plans, combining a diagnosis of the ground situation with people's vision/aspirations to address the needs of all. Several NGOs in the past had assisted district administrations, including in Orissa in planning under BRGF. The project might commission their services to build the capacity of WDTs in perspective planning.

30. Though the VDLPs are supposed to be perspective plans for the villages/watersheds without regard to sources of funds and services, and while the needs are in some cases identified, concrete plans largely focus on what can be done with the project funds. Since other government departments are not involved and have their own allocation and implementation procedures, it is not possible to bring about convergence.

31. ITDAs transfer project funds as per the AWPB to the account of the VDC operated by the President, Secretary and Treasurer. While the Secretary maintains detailed VDC accounts, low literacy in the project villages hampers transparency.

### **Livelihoods Enhancement**

32. **Land and Water Management:** Soil and water conservation has been the key project focus, bringing 3,558 ha of non-arable land into cultivation through land development and creating 9,203 ha of irrigation potential to benefit 10,701 households by building 4,065 water harvesting structures. Significant reduction in shifting cultivation (*Podu*) has been reported. Generally seen as a positive development, its effect on human nutrition needs to be studied since *Podu* produces millets, a key source of nutrition for tribal people. Land levelling and terracing technique seems faulty as the slopes are being cut too straight and might lead to scouring or slides. With crop intensification, managing soil nutrition needs attention. Irrigation and land preparation techniques need to be improved to reduce soil erosion. Care needs to be exercised in siting water harvesting structures, incorporating geological considerations. User Groups need to be strengthened and formalised, with suitable norms for usage charges and linkages with the VLSC/VDC for sustainability.

33. **Agriculture Development:** Agriculture development is a weak link presently and needs considerable attention. The positive results of demonstrations need to be spread across all project villages to enhance productivity of the main crops, such as paddy, millets and niger. SRI has nearly doubled paddy yield and needs to be promoted in a campaign mode through exposure, farmers' training and other support, such as supply of weeders. SRI principles have been adopted in millets (as SMI) in other parts of the country and could be brought on board. Given the terrain and the nutritional importance of millets in the region, their systematic promotion is strongly recommended with better seeds and farming practices, such as SMI. Vegetable cultivation has picked up with irrigation and new vegetables are being introduced. Selected women, rather than SHGs, could be trained as nursery entrepreneurs to produce and sell quality saplings. Also attention needed to improve cultivation of creeper based vegetables and tubers. LEISA technologies need to be promoted for vegetables through appropriate training and extension. Low cost drip irrigation for vegetable cultivation should be demonstrated under Development Initiative Fund. Composting needs to be vigorously promoted. Care needs to be taken to ensure that this naturally organic region does not begin using chemicals. Therefore, promotion of bio-pesticides and composting needs to be taken up in earnest.

34. Trials are being conducted on groundnut with ICRISAT's participation. It is a cash crop needing expensive inputs and may not be suited to the tribal economy at this juncture. Instead, various pulses like black gram and lentils, oilseeds like sesame and mustard, various local beans and millets, and tuber crops need to be given the pride of place in research, trials, extension and publicity.

**35. Horticulture Development:** Horticulture plantation in an area of 266 ha using 32,000 seedlings is performing well. Summer irrigation would be critical for success and the pitcher technique could be used for the same. Plantations on slopes need to be protected against soil erosion. The team should visit the Wadi programme of BAIF in South Gujarat in similar hilly terrain. The linkage with NABARD to promote horticulture under their Tribal Development Fund is a good development and a few FNGOs have already tied up with the programme. As this is a long term scheme, OTELP could play a strong role to link all FNGOs with the programme as part of the sustainability strategy. Intercropping with legumes like black gram and organic mulching should be integrated with horticulture.

**36. Livestock and Aquaculture Development:** Animal health camps and vaccination have been taken up across projects and have proven useful. Breed improvement was initiated a year ago. Goat rearing and poultry have been taken up with 600 landless households leading to average household income increases of about Rs 2,000. Goat rearing is popular and the project needs to develop a comprehensive model, incorporating issues like proper housing, veterinary care, credit, insurance, feeding and marketing. Lack of robust preventive veterinary care system can wreak havoc as villages are inaccessible. The present system is rudimentary as the para vets promoted under the project need much handholding and grooming. New goat (Sirohi) and poultry (Banjara) breeds are being promoted in the project but no attempt has been made to improve the productivity of local breeds. The Black Bengal breed of goats might be more suitable here than Sirohi and needs to be tried. Fodder promotion, especially tree forage for goats needs focused attention for livestock rearing to become a significant livelihood, especially for the landless. Fishery has been taken up with SHGs in tanks constructed for the purpose. The same needs to be tried in natural water bodies, including those created by the project.

**37. Joint Forest Management and FRA:** The project villages are mostly surrounded by forests with nearly 20-30 percent watershed area under forest. So far 211 *Van Suraksha Samitis* (VSS) have been formed to protect 27,600 ha forest and 211 forest development micro-plans have been approved and are being implemented. The forest department needs to be more involved, providing the VSS an effective role in management as provided in PESA. The JFM committees now play no role in species selection in forest plantations and other matters pertaining to the management of forests.

38. Recording of rights under the FRA is underway with mixed reactions from the people. Many are yet to receive their titles even when the documents had been submitted long back, for example in Kalahandi. The demarcation and allocation of Reserve Forest has not been done in many places and the land area given is not adequate to make a living in many cases. The project needs to take up focused work for the development of land assigned under FRA to bring about livelihood enhancement with ecological security.

**39. Nutrition and Health:** Promotion of drinking water and sanitation in a few project villages is to be applauded as it would significantly improve community health and reduce drudgery for women and girl children. This needs to be taken up in all watersheds through convergence with the Rural Water Supply and Sanitation scheme. Promotion of vegetables on homestead land and overall better utilisation of the same needs more focused attention as it would contribute to nutrition security. The agriculture programme needs to pay attention to crops that presently make the food basket of the people.

<b>Agreed action</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Agreed date</b>
1. Induction of efficient water use techniques like low cost drip & formalising norms for User Groups	PSU, ITDA, NGO	Jun 2010
2. Use of only PVC pipes in flow irrigation systems and conversion of earthen channels into PVC as far as practical	PSU, ITDA, NGO	On going
3. Promotion of SRI, SMI and LEISA as a campaign	PSU, ITDA, NGOs	Jun 2010
4. Linkages with NABARD, NHM, Horticulture Department to promote horticulture in all villages	PSU, ITDA, NGO	Jun 2010
5. Tree forage and fodder promotion	PSU, ITDA, NGO	Jun 2010
6. Intensive Homestead Development	ITDA, NGOs	Jun 2010

### **Rural Financial Services**

40. Bank linkages among groups are few and far between. In many cases the groups have idle cash. The utilisation of RFS also is variable across SHGs. Low literacy levels coupled with limited capacities of NGO staff seem to be the contributing factors. There is an urgent need to review and redress the issue of low credit utilisation among groups.

41. Major differences were observed between the records in member passbooks and Minutes/loan books of the SHGs. Book keeping is currently being done by the CMs who are engaged and paid by the FNGOs. Only in a few instances have SHGs paid from their own savings. There is further need for capacity building in record keeping. Rotational leadership recommended by the previous JRM has not yet begun even in Phase I villages.

42. Collective marketing has improved the decision making processes at the group level as community members are involved at each step. It was observed that income accrued to SHGs through different income generating activities is not being distributed to members and is merged with the group fund. The SHGs are also not clear whether the benefits should be shared among members. Internal auditing, recommended by the previous JRM is yet to be institutionalised.

<b>Agreed action</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Agreed date</b>
1. Further need based training for IGAs and exposure visits for the SHGs; benefit sharing of interest earned by SHG.	PSU, ITDA, NGO	On going
2. Rotational leadership among SHG and other CBO on priority basis.	PSU, ITDA, NGO	Jun 2010

### **Development Initiative Fund**

43. The previous JRM had recommended setting aside 25 percent of the DIF for initiatives to assist vulnerable families. This has been done, proposals from the field for the use of the fund have been invited and initiatives such as providing assistance for home improvements and drinking water and sanitation have begun. The Mission recommends increasing this allocation to 50 percent so that meaningful livelihoods can be promoted for the landless as they do not benefit from land and water resource development activities where the allocation per family is of the order of Rs 50,000. The Mission also recommends development of model livelihood projects for the landless, such as goat rearing units, leaf plate making units, etc. Convergence of the fund with other government schemes for the landless and other vulnerable groups must be explored.

44. The guidelines for the use of Community Infrastructure Fund now require that the communities contribute 50 percent towards construction of common infrastructure, such as buildings for the storage of WFP food grains (used later for other purposes by

the community). Since such infrastructure is often created in the beginning of the project when full rapport is yet to be built with the community, getting such contribution is difficult in new project villages. The Mission recommends that such contribution be reduced to 15 percent as was generally the case in Phase I villages.

### **Convergence**

45. The activities initiated and investments being made by the project can at best be a beginning in the long road to socioeconomic transformation of the target population and ecological security of the region. The previous JRM had made a strong plea for systematic convergence of the project with government schemes like NREGS, BRGF, etc. Convergence remains sporadic and dependent on the initiatives of individual district officials. For instance, in the villages visited NREGS had provided wages for only 10 to 20 days and nowhere was it focused on land and water resource development.

46. The Mission recommends systematic efforts to bring about convergence. Since most government schemes are implemented at the Gram Panchayat (GP) level, the Mission recommends that the arrangements with the FNGO partners be extended to neighbouring micro watersheds not covered by the project to cover entire GPs.

### **Policy Initiatives**

47. As per present policy, the VDCs have to pay revenue for stones and sand collected to construct physical assets under the project, such as diversion weirs, boulder checks, community buildings, etc. It seems an unnecessary imposition where the materials are being collected for own use by the inhabitants. The Mission recommends a review of this policy, at least to grant exemption in the project area if not abolish it altogether.

48. The WFP rice is kept at Rs 10 for 3 kg whereas rice is sold to BPL families at Rs 2 a kg (over 75 percent of the project beneficiaries are BPL) with a limit of 25 kg per family per month. However, the project beneficiaries have a choice to take their entire wages in cash and not to buy the WFP rice.

### **Tribal & PTGs Development**

49. *Achieving empowerment and enhancing livelihoods are the core aspects of tribal development in the present programme. The action areas for empowerment are inclusion of socially excluded disadvantaged groups such as the landless, women-headed households and the PTGs/PVTGs; socio-economic development, natural resource development, gender equity and empowerment, participation in Local Self Government and implementation of various Constitutional provisions such as those envisaged in PESA, NREGA, RTI, FRA as well as allotment of land to the landless under the provisions of the various land Acts and schemes of the Government of Orissa (such as OPLEA, OGLSR, Vasundhara and Mo Jami Mo Dhia). Evidence of political empowerment is seen in the process of participation of members from VDCs, SHGs, etc. in the Palli Sabha and statutory Panchayats, thereby strengthening PESA. Resources need to be mobilized from NREGS, BRGF, NHM, NRLM, etc. for substantially. These processes can be further strengthened by expanding coverage of SHGs and federating them, mobilizing and converging resources from government schemes at the Panchayat, ensuring 100 days' employment under NREGS to every eligible individual (against current average of 20-30 days only), ensuring timely land *pattas* under FRA to all the eligible families, ensuring job cards for all, securing social welfare schemes (eg. old age pension) for all the eligible elders and networking the various service providers and volunteers in and across villages. Also, more specialised attention is needed for the PTGs along with convergence of specialised agencies such as the Bonda Development Agency.*

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
1. Ensuring land <i>pattas</i> under FRA, OPLEA, etc. to all eligible households among the target groups in all Phase I villages & at least 50% in Phase II villages	PSU, ITDAs, NGOs	Sep 2010
2. Ensuring 100 days' employment under NREGS at least in 50% of Phase I villages	ITDAs, NGOs, VDCs	Jun 2010
3. Specialised action plan prepared for the PTGs like the Bonda in consultation with State Level Organisation (e.g. Bonda Development Agency) for reorienting their special empowerment and development needs.	PSU, ITDA, NGO	Jun 2010

## Climate Change

50. Issues of climate change, though originally not a component of OTELP, need to be addressed by the project with clear priorities and attention. Adaptation to climate change to build more climate resilient communities needs to be brought into focus with urgency. Climate change would impact the poor, such as those in the project areas, more than others. Climate change variables could contribute to increasing uncertainties and risks for the tribal and other rural poor households. Climate risks and uncertainties associated with unpredictable and untimely rains, higher intensity of drought and/or floods, increased pests and diseases for crops and livestock could have far reaching consequences for rural poverty.

51. Field experiences showed that some project activities are already addressing many of the issues relating to climate change. While some of these activities are climate mitigative in nature such as promotion of vermicompost, solar lamps and tree plantations, while other activities such as promotion of dry land crops, leguminous crops, and tuber crops could be broadly considered as climate change adaptation actions. The SCAMPIS project being implemented in OTELP along with IDE for productive sanitation, micro-irrigation and use of organic manure as well as ICRISAT-IFAD grant project promoting legume crops could all address issues of climate change. Overall, there is the need for increasing awareness and appropriate actions on climate change among the communities, project staff and NGOs.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
1. Awareness training on various aspects of climate change for the project staff, NGOs and communities (at least key leaders) with a training manual prepared.	PSU, ITDA, NGO, VDC	Jun 2010
2. Promotion of minor cereals like millets, sorghum and tuber crops.	PSU, ITDA, NGO	Jun 2010

## D. Project Implementation Performance

### Project Management Performance

52. The eight member team at the ITDA is headed by the PO (PME) and includes seven Subject Matter Specialists (SMS) in Agriculture, Engineering, Micro Finance, Community Mobilisation, Forestry, MIS and Finance. It was envisaged that the team would provide thematic support to the WDTs and assist in bringing about convergence and networking with resources institutions. Presently much of the team's time is spent in approving specific projects and reporting. The two broad areas of work of the team are project management (with largely an inward focus) and providing thematic support to the WDT (with a largely outward focus). While Finance and MIS primarily serve the first function, the others primarily serve the second function. There is a need to review the composition and the *modus operandi* of the team. Community Development and Organisation, Agriculture and Agriculture/Natural Resource Engineering are the key knowledge areas in this project and may be strengthened so that effective thematic support can be provided to WDTs. Also, the three knowledge streams must be able to work in an integrated way.

53. A District Planning and Monitoring Committee (DPMC) chaired by the Collector has been created to facilitate coordination with other government agencies. It does not seem to be functioning uniformly across districts. The Collector in any case chairs several such committees in a district. A more effective problem solving mechanism would be quarterly review by the Collector with the PA (ITDA), the PO (PME) and all the SMSs so that coordination issues receive the Collector's focused attention to initiate corrective action with the concerned agencies. The PA (ITDA) may chair a similar review at the block.

54. There are anomalies in the remuneration and administrative arrangements at various levels, which the mission recommends for immediate attention and review.

- i. The remuneration of the SMSs recruited on contract varies across disciplines, ranging from Rs 15,000 to Rs 25,000. It is fixed for a position regardless of prior experience and longevity in service. This cannot be conducive to team building and motivation.
- ii. The remuneration for contracted support staff working at ITDA and PSU has not been revised and seems well below that offered to those deputed from the government and for similar work in the open market.
- iii. There is no difference in either the remuneration or the designation of SMSs between the PSU and the ITDA even though the former is expected to play an integrating role.
- iv. There is an overlap between the roles played by the PME function and the MIS function as both deals with project information flowing from the field.
- v. The remuneration of the WDT has not been revised and is grossly inadequate to attract quality professionals. This is also grossly out of line with other similar projects being implemented by the government, such as TRIPTI and OCTMP.
- vi. NGOs do not receive any support for infrastructure and administration (they have been provided a computer without accessories). Since these are Charities that depend on donations and funded projects, it is out of place to expect that they would have an establishment to support a funded project.

55. Selection of FNGOs for the second phase has thrown up issues about the selection methodology as was brought up by several NGOs in the course of the JRM. A few NGOs also made a representation to the Mission to this effect. It seems some of the stronger and better known NGOs with relevant experience have either not been selected or are playing limited role while some with limited prior relevant experience have been chosen. Some NGOs have been allocated more than one block while others reportedly were told that only one block can be allocated to one NGO. Several NGOs have been allotted villages where they had no prior work even as some were not allotted villages where they had been working on similar activities earlier. Overall, very few NGOs in the project have strong prior experience of natural resource development, a key component in this project. Apparently the selection was based on submissions made by NGOs without field verification of their work. While the selection is now complete, the process should be critically reviewed as the lessons would be useful for other projects in future.

56. Land and water development activities can be taken up under NREGS, BRGF, etc. while there may not be schemes in other sectors such as livestock development. The Mission recommends that flexibility be introduced in the use of project funds meant for land and water development for other sectoral activities to the extent that land and water development activities are taken up through convergence with NREGS and BRGF.

### **Monitoring and Evaluation**

57. Data entry into the computerised M&E software, earlier delayed due to the resignation of the MIS Manager, has been resumed and is progressing well. Data

entered into a Spreadsheet is now being uploaded into the software. The previous JRM had recommended that arrangements be made with the software developer for maintenance support and updating of the software. The same would be done once data has been fully uploaded and the software has been tested.

### Knowledge Management: Learning and Innovation

58. Knowledge Management (KM) activities are building up in the project through formal and informal systems. The PST supported under the DFID TA facilitated the development of a number of subject matter publications and strategy papers including newsletters, CDs, manuals, guidelines as required by the project. All these constitute the formal KM systems within the project. Informal systems of knowledge management within the communities include learning through FFS, exposure visits, on-field support, group interactions through meetings, SHGs fairs at different levels, street plays, *kala jatha* and theme based video shows. Further learning also comes in the form of training provided by WFP in the techniques of food storage and by ICRISAT on legume and groundnut farming technologies. Systematic interactions among NGOs and exchange experiences through periodic workshops and cross-visits are suggested as KM practice.

### Partnerships

59. The PST set up under the DFID TA has assisted the PSU to bring on board a range of expert inputs to develop the Sustainability Strategy, Strategy for Rural Financial Services, Gender Mainstreaming etc. The DFID TA comes to a close in January 2010 though almost 75 percent of the TA funds remain unspent.

60. The Project would continue to need expert support, especially in areas like natural resource management, community and CBO development, capacity building and developing sustainability and growth strategies. The Mission recommends that provision be made for this by re-allocation of budgets to make up for the withdrawal of DFID TA.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
1. Review the remuneration structure at all levels and support given to NGOs and remove the anomalies	GoO & PSU	Jan 2010
2. Review the WDT composition and placement of other village level workers to enhance quality of personnel working in villages	PSU, ITDA, NGOs	Jan 2010
3. Review the district-level coordination mechanism to enhance convergence	PSU, ITDA	Jan 2010
4. Allow flexibility in the use of funds between land & water development & others sectors where funds for the former are provided drawn through convergence	IFAD, PSU	Mar 2010
5. Re-allocate budgets to provide for continued TA support in the event of withdrawal of DFID TA	IFAD, PSU	Jun 2010

### E. Fiduciary Aspects

61. **VDC & VLSC Balances:** ITDAs transfer funds to VDCs and the latter to VLSCs as per the AWPB. However, these funds are not fully spent in the period budgeted for and accumulate over time. The cumulative balance of VDCs and VLSCs as on 31 March 2009 is Rs 24,08,85,461 or USD 5.125 million. This represents over 25 percent of the IFAD loan and 9 percent of the total project cost. The balance has not changed materially on 30 September 2009. This amount is not fully represented by the bank balances available with VDCs and VLSCs, difference being to the tune of approximately Rs 210 lakh or USD 450,000. The PSU pointed out that there has been an expenditure of Rs 13.50 crore since March 2009 and additional release of Rs 13.33 in September 2009.

62. **FNGO Advances:** ITDAs release funds to FNGOs for capacity building, training and exposure visits and their implementation costs. Implementation costs are being released on a yearly budget basis since 2008 onwards, while other items are released on a quarterly basis. The cumulative balance with FNGOs of Rs 2,09,40,151 (USD 450,000 approx) as on 31 March 2009 has increased to Rs 2,87,89,192 (USD 612,500).

63. **VDF Deposits:** VDCs/VLSCs deduct a fixed amount against WFP food towards VDF, to be deposited in a separate VDF bank account maintained by the VLSC. The Mission observed that these amounts were not deposited or deposited late in most cases.

64. **Audit Report:** The audit report for 2008-9 was not of acceptable quality. The auditors have made no observations on the following areas mentioned in the Audit TOR.

- i. Use of IFAD funds as per provisions of the PLA
- ii. Timely release and proper utilization of counterpart funds
- iii. Procurement of goods and services as per provisions of the PLA
- iv. Adequacy of fixed asset records maintained by the project and regularity of physical verification of assets
- v. Proper accounting of food grain assistance received from WFP
- vi. Adequacy of supporting documentation as evidence of project expenditure
- vii. Reconciliation between IFAD/GoO disbursements and amount received by the Project
- viii. Eligibility of expenditure claimed through SoEs.

65. The auditors did not highlight the fact that VDC balances as per ITDA books were not reconciled with balances as per VDC/VLSC Cash Books and bank Pass Books. This justifies a qualified opinion while the auditors have given an unqualified audit opinion.

66. IFAD places a high degree of reliance on programme audit reports and a poorly drawn up audit report can seriously impact IFAD's assessment of the programme financial management capacity. The Mission therefore recommends that selection of auditors be made judiciously, taking into account both quality and cost parameters.

67. **Audit Log:** Audit log for 2007-8 was presented to the Mission while the same for 2008-9 is not yet ready.

68. **Internal Audit:** The Project has recently appointed internal auditors for all Phase I ITDAs. Prior to this appointment, internal audit was conducted by ITDA FOs. The Mission found their reports highlighted some important issues which need to be timely addressed by Project Management.

### **Withdrawal Applications**

69. The Mission verified the reimbursement claim aggregating Rs 13,35,48,752 for the period from April-September 2009. This claim was prepared on the basis of expenditure recorded in the books of accounts maintained by the PSU and ITDAs on the basis of Monthly Progress Reports and did not include advances made to various project parties.

70. IFAD's India Office has rejected 2 Withdrawal Applications (for the period from 1 April 2008 to 31 October 2008 and from 1 November 2008 to 31 March 2009) submitted by the Project in 2008-9 as they included advances made to project parties. IFAD reimburses only project expenditure and not advances. The Project has resubmitted the claim for period from 1 November 2008 to 31 March 2009 as the Government has informed them that the WA from 1 April 2008 to 31 March 2008 has already been submitted to IFAD and cannot be withdrawn. As on date, neither of these claims has been processed by IFAD. The auditors have pointed out that the claim is

less by Rs 14,92,00,767, of which Rs 5,87,55,029 pertains to beneficiary contribution and Rs 3,64,88,569 pertains to payables.

71. The Project used to claim amounts released by the PSU to other project parties as expenditure up to 31 March 2008. As recommended by the MTR, IFAD used to reimburse the same. IFAD changed the procedure in 2008-9, requiring that only actual expenditure be claimed. However, the excess amount claimed in earlier years is estimated at Rs 12,50,26,683 or USD 2.660 million.

### Compliance with Loan Covenants

72. The Mission observed the following non compliances with loan covenants.

- i. **Section 3.02 (b)**: As per this section, the PSU was required to submit a draft AWPB for 2009-10 for approval of the Fund on or before 1 February 2009. The draft AWPB was submitted for approval of the Fund in March 2009.
- ii. **Section 4.01 and Clause 16 of Schedule 3**: As per this section, the PSU is required to establish and maintain an appropriate information management system within 180 days of loan effectiveness. As per information provided by the PSU this was done in August 2008.
- iii. **Section 5.01**: As per this clause, the PSU has to deliver unaudited financial statements to the Fund within 4 months of the end of the financial year. This was not done, though audited statements have been furnished within 6 months as required.
- iv. **Section 5.02 (b)**: Under this section, the PSU is required to submit an audit report to the Fund containing a separate opinion on certified SoEs and other matters mentioned in Section 9.03 of the General Conditions. The audit report did not specifically report on the eligibility of the expenditure.
- v. **Section 11.6 of Schedule 3**: Under this section, the ITDA is responsible for final inspection of infrastructure works and for preparation of BoQ. The approval and certification for assets worth Rs 100,000 and less has been delegated to the FNGO.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
1. Urgent steps need to be taken to reconcile the VDC/ VLSC balances against ITDA books as per VDC/VLSC Cash Books and bank statements through external firms of CAs engaged by ITDAs as internal auditors.	PSU & ITDAs	By 31 Mar 2010
2. Pending VDF deposits must be identified VLSC-wise and deposited in VDF account	PSU & ITDAs	By 31 Jan 2010
3. A refresher training must be conducted about IFAD's Procurement Guidelines at all levels	PSU & ITDAs	By 31 Mar 2010
4. The Project is advised to appoint Statutory Auditors for 2009-10 through a fair and competitive process using the QCBS method. CFO must certify the completeness of audit report as per approved TOR prior to payment.	PSU	By 30 Apr 2010
5. ICO official dealing with finance and procurement must visit the Project and review the relevant procedures to further strengthen and streamline IFAD procedures	IFAD India Office	By 31 Mar 2010

### F. Sustainability

73. **Institutional Sustainability.** Internal cohesion among members, participatory and transparent systems of governance and management are necessary prerequisites for institutional sustainability. While members of various CBOs, especially the SHGs seem to have developed a sense of stake in these bodies, widespread illiteracy is an impediment in fostering transparency with respect to records and financial transactions. The literate younger members need to be encouraged and incentivised to promote literacy among members.

74. To remain relevant, the CBOs must continue to play a meaningful role in the lives of their constituent members. In case of SHGs, this would require continued and growing access to credit for which they need to have access to banks. The VDCs similarly need to have access to finances to continue their development activities beyond the project period. As highlighted elsewhere, convergence with other mainstream government development programmes and various welfare schemes and integration with the Gram Panchayat would facilitate this.

75. **Social Sustainability (Empowerment).** Women in several villages have taken up issues affecting them and the wellbeing of their families, such as ban on brewing and sale of liquor in villages. SHGs and initiatives like collective marketing have enhanced women's self-confidence. In some project villages the VDA members have taken pledges to foster the development of the entire community, such as "no one in our village will remain hungry", "no one will migrate in search of manual labour", etc. These experiences need to be extended across project villages and wider collectives through federations of CBOs need to be fostered.

76. **Economic and Financial Sustainability.** The CBOs promoted by the project represent significant social capital but would need continued handholding and nurturing support. Towards this the recommendation regarding convergence needs reiteration. Further, attempts need to be made to create secondary and tertiary associations of the CBOs.

77. **Technical Sustainability.** The activities being promoted by the project would need services, such as in agriculture, livestock rearing, book keeping, etc. The arrangement of village volunteers promoted for this purpose needs rationalisation with perhaps one person serving one or two villages. They need further training and handholding support and the systems for their remuneration need to be developed so that they can continue to work post-project.

78. **Environmental Sustainability.** Overall, the activities promoted by the project are supportive of ecological security. However, as earlier pointed out, to deepen these positive effects, the project needs to develop more integrated resource management strategies, action plans to develop FRA lands and more active participation of the forest department.

79. **Exit Strategy.** As recommended by the previous JRM a study by WASSAN to develop exit strategies has been commissioned. WASSAN presented a draft of their study at the debriefing workshop. The project would need to develop and carry out detailed action plans, guided by the WASSAN study. As earlier stated, convergence with other government schemes would ensure that work continues in these villages to carry forward the initiatives taken by this project in the post-project phase.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
1. Develop detailed action plans to implement an exit-cum-sustainability and growth strategy based on WASSAN study	PSU	30 Jun 2010

## G. Impact

80. The project has commissioned Sambodhi to conduct a study of the Project's impact on the beneficiaries, which is currently underway. Sambodhi made a presentation of their preliminary findings at the debriefing workshop, indicating fair to significant impact.

81. **Physical and Financial Assets.** A wide range of assets like check dams, diversion weirs, community buildings, horticulture plantations have been created by the project. The CBOs, particularly SHGs promoted by the project have saved Rs 71.9

million (\$1.73 million). These would over time enhance productivity of human labour and natural resources and improve poor people's livelihoods.

82. **Food Security.** People in project villages visited reported significant improvement in food security. The availability of WFP food and enhanced production from agriculture has contributed to food security.

83. **Increase in Incomes.** Incomes of farmers in Phase I villages have shown increases wherever irrigation facilities have been created. Women taking up collective production and marketing activities also reported modest increases in incomes.

84. **Impact on Civil Society.** There are 28 NGOs working in the project. The project activities are new for most of the NGOs and they have gained from this experience. The NGOs have also developed new linkages with a wide range of resource agencies.

85. **Policy Impact.** The project is actively involved in the process of recording and settlement of land rights under FRA and other laws currently underway. The activities taken up under the project have demonstrated a wide range of opportunities where funds from large government schemes like NREGS and BRGF can be fruitfully used, though there is as yet little exchange on this score.

## H. Conclusion

86. Considerable progress has been made since the previous JRM and project outreach has expanded significantly, covering all the slated project districts. During the debriefing with OTELP, it was agreed that the project will look into the overall recommendations of the JRM including those strategic recommendations as contained in the Aide Memoire and other recommendations as contained in respective technical reports.

87. During the wrap-up meeting with the Government of Orissa, chaired by the Development Commissioner & Additional Chief Secretary and attended among others by the heads of various State Government departments, the following issues were re-emphasized that require to be addressed with urgency:

- i. The need for more systematic convergence of on-going government programmes and schemes such as NREGS, BRGF, NHM, NRLM, ATMA, etc. with OTELP-IFAD programme in order to make significant and sustainable impact.
- ii. The process of land allotment to forest dwellers under the FRA and to the landless under the OPLEA and OGLS Rules already underway needs to be accelerated to meet the aspirations of the people. Also, the area allotted to each household needs to be adequate to enable it to meet its livelihood needs.
- iii. Instances of payment of taxes/cess/royalty to Revenue Department by Village Development Committees set up under the project on stones and sand collected locally to construct common facilities, water harvesting structures, etc. in their own villages were brought to the notice of the Mission. The relevant policies and rules should be reviewed forthwith and appropriate relief provided.
- iv. Placement of Orissa Administrative Service (OAS) officers or equivalent officers in ITDA needs to be expedited in the new districts. It is also desirable that officers with the right aptitude and experience may be placed and continuity be ensured.
- v. The participation of Forest Department in the programme needs deepening as most of the programme villages are located in forest fringe areas.
- vi. Staff remuneration for SMSs at ITDAs and NGO WDTs requires urgent review to attract and retain best talent. Anomalies in remuneration structure within and across management hierarchies need to be corrected to promote team spirit.

88. The Government of Orissa, while appreciating the observations of the JRM, assured the Mission that it would examine the above issues with priority and attend to the agreed actions for more effective implementation of OTELP. The GoO has indicated that it would constitute a State level coordination committee to bring about coherence with respect to staff remuneration across the externally aided programme. It also indicated that mechanisms would be created to exchange experiences across these projects.

## **Appendices and Annexes**

- Appendix 1 Summary of project status and ratings
  - Appendix 2 Progress against previous mission recommendations
  - Appendix 3 Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; Disbursements by category and by component
  - Appendix 4 Compliance with financing agreement covenants: Status of implementation
  - Appendix 5 Physical progress measured against AWP&B and appraisal targets
  - Appendix 6 RIMS table
  - Appendix 7 Knowledge management: Learning and innovation
  - Appendix 8 Audit log
  - Appendix 9 Supervision mission schedule and persons met
- 
- Annex I Technical report
  - Annex II Additional annexes determined by the supervision mission

## **Appendix 1: SUMMARY OF PROJECT STATUS AND RATINGS**

*Note: The template for the PSR is now available electronically on the IFAD Website (<https://webapps.ifad.org/prosol>) and should be completed on line by the Supervision Mission Team while in country using the LAN ID and password provided to the CPM or Team Leader.*

*A User Guide can be retrieved on the following link -  
<http://xdesk/sites/uee/ca/psronline/default.aspx>*

*Once filled out in draft, the PSR can be exported in either Word or as a PDF file. The draft version in Word should be inserted into the supervision report as Appendix 1. The scores in the PSR will be validated at a divisional review meeting. Once scores are finalized following the meeting, the final PSR will be published by the divisional focal point responsible for PSRs.*

**[Insert PSR form here]**

## Appendix 1: SUMMARY OF PROJECT STATUS AND RATINGS

### A. Basic Facts

<b>Country</b>	India	<b>Project ID</b>	1155	<b>Loan/Grant No.</b>	IN-585
<b>Project</b>	<b>Orissa Tribal Empowerment and Livelihoods Improvement Programme</b>			<b>Supp. Loan/Grant</b>	
<b>Date of Update:</b>	18-Dec-09	<b>Last Supervision</b>	Nov-Dec 2008	<b>Financing terms</b>	F
<b>Supervising Inst.</b>	IFAD	<b>No. of Supervisions</b>	5		
				USD million	Disb.rate%
<b>Approval</b>	23-Apr-2002	<b>Quality at entry rating</b>	3	<b>Total costs</b>	
<b>Agreement</b>	18-Dec-2002	<b>Effectiveness lag</b>		IFAD loan	20.00 19.33
<b>Effectiveness</b>	15-Jul-2003	<b>Problem project</b>		DFID Grant	40.00 84.42
<b>MTR</b>	04-Sep-2006			IFAD grant	
<b>Current completion</b>	31-Mar-2013	<b>Last Amendment</b>		Domestic	18.83
<b>Current closing</b>	30-Sep-2013	<b>Last Audit</b>	29/11/2007	Co financing	52.33
<b>No. of extensions</b>				<b>Co financiers</b>	Government of Orissa
					DFID
					WFP (food grain)

### B. Project Performance Ratings

<b>B.1 Fiduciary Aspects</b>	<b>Last</b>	<b>Current</b>	<b>B.2 Project implementation progress</b>	<b>Last</b>	<b>Current</b>		
1. Quality of financial management	3	3	1. Quality of project management	5	4		
2. Acceptable disbursement rate	4	3	2. Performance of M&E	5	5		
3. Counterpart funds	5	5	3. Coherence between AWPB & implementation	4	5		
4. Compliance with loan covenants	5	4	4. Gender focus	5	5		
5. Compliance with procurement	5	4	5. Poverty focus	5	5		
6. Quality and timeliness of audits	4	3	6. Effectiveness of targeting approach	5	5		
			7. Innovation and learning	4	4		
<b>B.3 Outputs and outcomes</b>			<b>Allocated budget (USD million)</b>	<b>% of total</b>	<b>Cumulative expenditure (USD million)</b>	<b>Last</b>	<b>Current</b>
1. Actual outputs/component 1 <b>Capacity Building for Empowerment</b> [Describe component title]			8.1	10	3.52	3	4
2. Actual outputs/component 2 <b>Livelihoods Enhancement</b>			54.12	70	12.14	4	4

[Describe component title]					
3. Actual outputs/component 3 <b>Policy Initiatives Support</b> [Describe component title]	1.69	2	-	4	4
4. Actual outputs/component 4 <b>Development Initiatives Fund (DIF)</b> [Describe component title]	4.68	6	0.35	4	4
5. Actual outputs/component 5 <b>Programme Management</b> [Describe component title]	8.25	11	1.58	4	4
6. Actual outputs/component 5 <b>Food Handling</b> [Describe component title]	0.72	1	0.21	5	5

B.4 Sustainability	Last	Current	B.5 Impact	Last	Current
1. Institution building (organizations, etc.)	3	4	1. Physical/financial assets	4	5
2. Empowerment	4	5	2. Food security	5	5
3. Quality of beneficiary participation	4	5	3. Increase in incomes	5	4
4. Responsiveness of service providers	4	4	4. Policy impact	4	4
5. Exit strategy (readiness and quality)	3	3			
6. Potential for scaling up and replication	5	5	<b>B.6 Partnerships</b>	4	4

B.7 In-loan grant ( <i>only if applicable and if funding specific activities not funded by the loan</i> )	Last	Current
[Describe main achievements and issues]		

C. Overall Assessment and Risk Profile	Last	Current
C 1 Overall <b>implementation progress</b> (Sections B1 and B2)	4	4
C 2 Likelihood of achieving the <b>development objectives</b> (section B 3 and B4)	4	4

**Rationale for implementation progress rating** (Max 300 words)

The project has made considerable progress since the last JRM Mission, both in qualitative and quantitative terms. CBOs are now able to manage significant project investments efficiently and transparently. Food, livelihood security, income and overall empowerment have improved as a result of land and water management, enhanced resources, capacity building and labour productivity. The level of engagements of the project staff at PSU, ITDA and FNGOs are also improving with greater satisfaction as observed in the fields.

**Rationale for development objectives rating** (Max 300 words)

The project has already demonstrated that the development of poor tribal people requires, besides financial investments, the establishment of a trust relationship. Hence, it calls for collaboration among multiple stakeholders and a favourable policy environment. The project has also demonstrated that the tribal poor have the potential to effectively manage natural resources, adopt complex technologies and take charge of their own development. From a long-term perspective of sustainable development, it is clear that current efforts and public investments need to continue. This calls for convergence of various on-going government programmes,

harnessing the institutional capabilities of CBOs. Moreover, working with the tribal people, particularly with the "Primitive Tribal Groups" (re-termed as Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups) as in OTELP, require special motivational orientation for the project staff and FNGOs.

**C 3 Risks** *Short description of major risks for each section and their impact on achievement of development objectives and sustainability*

Fiduciary aspects	Scope for improving quality of audit and its reporting system; ITDA staffs handling finance and accounts require adequate capacity building on fiduciary aspects. Require timely reconciliation of funds released to the FNGOs and CBOs. Low reception capacity at CBOs (VDCs/VLSCs/SHGs) due to illiteracy continue to be a challenge for maintaining desired quality of financial records at grassroots level.
Project implementation progress	The project is continuing making progress in organising poor tribal women and men, enhancing their capabilities, introducing more sustainable and productive resource management systems and increasing the availability of cultivable land to them. The project has Poor utilisation of funds in the ITDAs, VDCs, and VLSCs' as a result of poor execution of programme may delay progress of the programme. New districts taken in the current year would add further challenge, so also increasing incidence of extremism and communal tension in some pockets of the programme areas may impact in the progress of the project implementation.
Outputs and outcomes	Land and Water Management activities completed in the Phase I villages, bringing a significant area under irrigation and land development activities. The production enhancement technology/ approaches adopted under the programme have not yet been utilised to its full potentials. Low quality of demonstration, training and handholding support to the farmers may result in slow adoption of technology. Micro credit support for taking up income generating activities in groups through SHG may only impact fewer members within a group. Microplans have been developed and implemented. Half of VDC members are women. More than 60% of HHs reported increased productivity for major crops. Collective marketing of NTFPs and vegetables resulted in price increase of 15-30%. SHG bank linkages are improving, but require further facilitation for increased linkages and sustainability. Forest land allotment under FRA (3585 hhs) and revenue land to landless improving but much remained to be done.
Sustainability	Community Based Organisations (CBOs) such as SHGs and VDCs/VLSCs are showing already a satisfactory level of ownership. However, they still require support from FNGOs in order to strengthen their capacity and their internal working systems and control mechanisms. There is also the need to establish strong linkages with external institutions, public and private in order to maximize the opportunities of convergence with existing GOI/SG programs (child development, education, health and social welfare schemes) and develop backward and forward linkages, from production to markets. Village level Community Volunteers are being trained, targeting in particular the rural youth, with the objective to gradually take over extension duties in social and economic activities. Women leaderships are also being developed.

#### D. Follow-up Action

Issue/problem	Recommended Action	Status/Timing
Linkage with Forest Dept	The participation of Forest Department in OTELP continue to be low or minimal, which needs to be enhanced significantly, both for technical advice and convergence with its various schemes for overall sustainability of natural resource management and NTFP-based livelihoods. GoO assured further efforts on this matter	On-going
Project Finance under TA	The support of Financial Support Assistance through DFID TA will be completed by January, 2010. The project may adopt the arrangement with certain modification and continue for strengthening the accounting and record keeping at the SHG, VLSC and VDC level and MIS at FNGO will be undertaken for the village-level accountants (book writers) for improved understanding and application of financial management.	On-going
Project management needs improvement	Periodic training and exposure of project staff (both PSU and ITDA) on respective subjects along with management training to be organized for the programme staff for ensuring better implementation support, coordination and leadership. Continuous training to the WDT members and Community Mobilizers based upon the skill requirement (as per the CB strategy). Exposure of WDT and Community Mobilizers to similar project implemented outside the state. The staff remuneration at each level to be reviewed periodically and enhanced to retain experienced staff. Performance based incentives may be adopted to invite innovations and learning within the programme.	On-going
Overall financial management practices needs to be strengthened to reduce the fiduciary risk in the project.	The Addl. Chief Secretary cum Development Commissioner acknowledged the importance of the issue and directed the Programme Director to take corrective action as recommended by the mission at the earliest; training of ITDA staffs on financial management.	Training by March 2010
Enhance SHGs bank linkages	During the last JRM, GoO assured that Bank officials on deputation with the Government of Orissa would be deputed to resolve the issue and if required the matter could also be raised in the SLBC. In spite of these efforts, linkages remain challenging due to remoteness of the villages; greater efforts by the project staff and FNGOs.	On-going
Exit cum Sustainability Strategy	The sustainability strategy designed by the programme needs piloting. The FNGOs of Phase I are to be facilitated to start piloting the same in at least two micro watersheds for a period of six months and thereafter come up with an option for further fine-tuning of the strategy. Based on the piloting, each FNGO shall prepare a sustainability plan for the villages being covered by them and start the implementation of the same.	Start by Jan 2010

<p>Land to Landless require greater attention</p>	<p>The landless households are to be settled with land (agriculture and homestead) with the existing provision of the Govt (OPLEA/ OGLSR/ FRA). Encouraging initiatives have been taken up; already 3585 families settled under FRA but lots remained to be done. The survey and settlement unit for surveying lands between 10-30 degree slope in Phase I programme villages to start. A focus strategy is to be designed and implemented to prepare a livelihood plan for the landless households provided with a piece of land through various schemes and acts of Govt.</p> <p>The programme has adopted a strategy through making specific allocation under the Development Initiatives Fund (DIF) component. However, the effectiveness of selection of activity and implementation needs to be evaluated. A small study may be conducted to look at the initiatives made and also propose a manageable livelihood option for the poorest of the poor with financial implication.</p>	<p>On-going</p>
<p>Convergence needs priority attention</p>	<p>There is the need for more systematic convergence of on-going government programmes and schemes such as NREGS, BRGF, NHM, NRLM, ATMA, etc. with OTELP-IFAD programme in order to create desired significant and sustainable impacts both in scales and intensity. An appropriate administrative instruction from your end would go a long way in harnessing this opportunity.</p>	

## Appendix 2: Action Taken Report on the Recommendations and Agreed Actions of the Last JRM

### Action Taken Report on JRM November 2008 Agreed Action Points

Action Taken Report on JRM November 2008 Agreed Action Points				
PART A: Critical Recommendations				
Action Area	Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date	Status of Implementation
<b>1. Programme Implementation Performance and Capacity Building</b>	1.1 Settlement of forest and Revenue land with priorities for the landless	PSU/ GoO (Revenue, Forest and ST & SC Development)	30-Jun-09	The programme has facilitated to expedite the implementation of Forest Rights Act for settlement of forest lands by providing hand held GPS of the sub-collectors of the programme areas along with financial assistance to engage additional hands preferably retired RIs and <i>Amins</i> . During the period, 3585 families have received 6347.541 acres land under FRA. Further, with the existing provisions of Revenue Department, 472 families with 426.818 acres and 759 families with 426.818 acres of land have been settled under OPLE Act and OGLS Rules respectively. Further under the <i>Vasundhara</i> Scheme 2328 families have been provided with 180.31 acres of homestead Land and 27 families with 11.98 acres through <i>Mo Jami Mo Dhia</i> scheme. Out of 11651 no. of absolute landless households on the programme area, more than 40% households have been settled with agricultural and homestead land. The project has initiated a study to assess the impact of land allocation under FRA and also to design an alternate land use system for the families settled with land.
	1.2 Review status of old SHGs with respect to their pre-OTELP liabilities and take corrective steps where necessary so that groups do not deteriorate and adversely affect their memberships.	PSU/ ITDA/ FNGOs	30-Jun-09	SHG wise database from each programme village has been prepared to ascertain the potential and weakness of each group and to take necessary remedial measures for strengthening the group function. This covers both newly formed SHGs and the SHGs formed before the implementation of programme. In this regard, six monthly gradation systems have been institutionalised following the grading mechanism developed by NABARD. Further detail of SHGs such as with Bank, FFIs, SGSY or any lending institutes have been developed and necessary support has been rendered as per need ascertained. This ensures & improving the health of the groups and promoting income generating activities through further bank linkage. Till date about 307 lakhs has been mobilised from banks/ FFIs for various income generating programme with satisfactory repayment practice.

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
 Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

<b>2. Rural Financial Services</b>	2.2 Training in Book-keeping; capacity building for the community members to develop cadres of book keeping and book writer specialists among the communities/ SHGs	PSU/ ITDA/ FNGOs	Completed by February 2009	Book keeping and accounts maintenance by the SHG members is a challenge in the tribal locality, where OTELP is operational. Accordingly, the SHG volunteers and some other literate members of the community have been trained on Book Keeping and accounts. Till date 114 SHGs are writing the bank account with their own members. Recently, a detail module and communication material has been developed with the assistance of ACCESS under the TA to DFID support on Book Keeping and Account Management. ToT on the above is under progress. This will cover at least two barefoot book keepers at every programme village level.
<b>3. Livelihoods Enhancement</b>	3.1 Commission a study on suitable approaches to develop natural resources to enhance livelihoods in the Phase II areas (based on experiences and lessons learned from Phase I and other programme interventions in the area.	PSU/ ITDA/ FNGOs	30-Jun-09	This will be covered under the Exit / sustainability strategy being developed with the technical support of WASSAN. The PSU has also prepared the Land & Water Management Manual based on the learning from the Phase I implementation. Similarly the experiences of agriculture interventions made in Phase I are also documented and published.
<b>4. Monitoring &amp; Evaluation</b>	4.1 Arrangements to be made for regular maintenance/updation of the software and periodic training of staff with the technical assistance of the developer (CES)	PSU	31-Jan-09	The M&E software development agency i.e CES technologies limited is supporting in maintenance and updating of the software. The Manager MIS and MIS Executive of ITDAs have been oriented by the agency in operation and maintenance of the software. Further this staffs are also trained on the Ms-SQL Server, .Net etc which are used to develop the software.
<b>5. Fiduciary</b>	5.1 Internal Audit at all levels by through firms of external auditors.	PSU	Begin by April 2009 for FY 09-10	External audit agencies from the respective ITDA Head Quarters have been selected and contracted to undertake internal audits at ITDAs. The first internal audit report is expected by end of October 2009.

<b>6. Sustainability</b>	6.1 Develop strategy or guidelines for convergence particularly with NREGS and various ITDA schemes.	PSU/Panchayati Raj Department/ST&SC Development Department	Start by 30 June 09	<p>The matter has been taken up with Govt. Accordingly the Development Commissioner cum Addl. Chief Secretary has taken a review meeting on convergence of NREGS with other developmental schemes of different departments on 15th Oct, 2009. The Commissioner cum Secretary, Panchayat Raj Department has been requested to simplify the implementation process under NREGS and issue strategic guideline for convergence with NREGS.</p> <p>Further, the DC cum ACS, while reviewing the prospective plan of SC &amp; SC Development Department, on 14th October, 2009 has advised the Principal Secretary, ST &amp; SC Development Department for issue of instruction to all ITDAs (including non OTELP ITDAs) to adopt the process and successful interventions in OTELP and also ensure convergence with OTELP.</p>
<b>7. Exit Strategy</b>	7.1 Commission a study to prepare Exit Strategy	PSU/PST	31-Mar-09	<p>M/s Wassan, Hyderabad has been contracted to execute a study to prepare the exit strategy. The team consists of four members from different thematic areas like watershed management, institution specialist, production enhancement specialist and gender specialist. The team has already undertaken field visit in 3 districts and organised a State level workshop to disseminate the observations made during the first round of field visit. Based on the feedback given during the workshop the team revisited the framework proposed and planned for the second round of field visit. It is expected that the final draft of the exit strategy will be presented before the fourth coming JRM.</p>
<b>PART B: Summary of key recommendations</b>				
<b>Action Area</b>	<b>Agreed action</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Agreed date</b>	<b>Status of Implementation</b>
<b>1. Programme Implementation Performance and Capacity Building</b>	1.1 Settlement of forest and Revenue land with priorities for the landless	Departments of Revenue, Forests and ST & SC Development, GoO	30-Jun-09	<p>The programme has facilitated to expedite the implementation of Forest Rights Act for settlement of forest lands by providing hand held GPS of the sub-collectors of the programme areas along with financial assistance to engage additional hands preferably retired RIs and <i>Amins</i>. During the period, 3585 families have received 6347.541 acres land under FRA. Further, with the existing provisions of Revenue Department, 472 families with 426.818 acres and 759 families with 426.818 acres of land have been settled under OPLE Act and OGLS Rules respectively. Further under the <i>Vasundhara</i> Scheme 2328 families have been provided with 180.31 acres of homestead Land and 27 families with 11.98 acres through <i>Mo Jami Mo Dhia</i> scheme. Out of 11651 no.of absolute landless households on the programme area, more than 40% households have been settled with agricultural and homestead land. The project has initiated a study to assess the impact of land allocation under FRA and also to design an alternate land use system for the families settled with land.</p>

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

1.2 Capacity building of the FNGOs on FRA	PSU	Apr-09	Specific training programmes on HRA have been taken up for the ITDA and F.NGO staffs associated in sensitising the communities on FRA level through Director, STSCTRI and through respective resource persons. Selected ITDA officials have been oriented on the provision and entitlement on FRA at the State level. Similarly staffs of OTELP at ITDA and F.NGO have been oriented at the district level through ITDA. Other local volunteers also oriented on the FRA. The Sub Collectors from all OTELP implemented blocks have been strengthened with Handholding GPS for early survey and settlement work under FRA. As a whole 16 no. of workshop and training events have been organised during the period. A short term study on the processes followed in augmenting FRA has been taken up by Director, STSCTRI, Bhubaneswar.
1.3 Initiate action to enhance numeracy skills among SHG members through convergence with Adult Literacy Programme	FNGOs	30-Jun-09	209 literacy programmes has been organised at the SHG level, benefiting 8983 SHG members under formal literacy. This programme will be up scaled to all the programme villages.
1.4 Rotate leadership practices among SHGs/VDCs/VLSCs every two years	PSU/PST/FNGOs	30-Jun-09	A focused drive has been taken up with proper sensitisation at the SHG level to rotate the leadership on a regular interval. Till date 510 SHGs have adopted rotational leadership and others will follow the same principle in future.
1.5 Review status of old SHGs with respect to their pre-OTELP liabilities and take corrective steps where necessary so that groups do not deteriorate and adversely affect their memberships.	FNGOs	30-Jun-09	SHG wise database from each programme village has been prepared to ascertain the potential and weakness of each group and to take necessary remedial measures for strengthening the group function. This covers both newly formed SHGs and the SHGs formed before the implementation of programme. In this regard, six monthly gradation systems have been institutionalised following the grading mechanism developed by NABARD. Further detail of SHGs such as with Bank, FFIs, SGSY or any lending institutes have been developed and necessary support has been rendered as per need ascertained. This ensures & improving the health of the groups and promoting income generating activities through further bank linkage. Till date about 307 lakhs has been mobilised from banks/ FFIs for various income generating programme with satisfactory repayment practice.
1.6 Analyse reasons why 50% SHGs remain in B & C Grade and initiate action to strengthen them to A level.	PSU/ ITDA/ FNGOs	01-Jun-09	The latest gradation report in Phase-I programme villages indicates sharp improvement in the ranking of SHGs in different grade. More than 70% SHGs are in A Grade, whereas less than 30% SHGs are in B & C Grade. 882 training/ exposure programmes have been organised during the last year on leadership, conflict management, funds management, Income Generating activities, Collective Marketing and other social issues.

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
 Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

<p>1.7 Develop formats for FNGO performance assessment and complete the assessment of FNGO performance.</p>	<p>PSU</p>	<p>31-May-09</p>	<p>The format for assessment of performance of FNGOs has been designed by PSU taking reference from the formats used by Chhattisgarh and Meghalaya Project. The format contents a list of indicators developed basing upon the ToR signed with the FNGO. Each indicator will be evaluated based on some specific questions and rated on a scale of 1 to 5 (Unsatisfactory to Highly satisfactory). The assessment of the FNGOs will be made annually adopting a participatory methodology where each stake holder will be a participant in the process. The final draft of the tool has been sent to the ITDAs and FNGOs for their feedback, on receipt of which the tool will be executed.</p>
<p>1.8 Develop Time bound and targeted action plan for skill training based on the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy for all SHG members.</p>	<p>PSU/ ITDA/ FNGOs</p>	<p>February, 2009</p>	<p>Detail guideline on Gender Mainstreaming for OTELP has been developed. All the staff from ITDA and F.NGO have been oriented on Gender mainstreaming in the perspective of OTELP from all seven districts. The training of TOTs at the block level is also in progress. Accordingly, need based skill development training programmes have been taken up for the SHG members not only in the empowerment perspectives but also to smoothen the IGPs taken up by the SHGs. The uptake of loan from bank, FFIs and RFS component of OTELP has been raised. The repayment of loan from the SHGs is also satisfactory.</p>
<p>1.9 Commissioning resource agencies/ persons to implement various strategies and guidelines.</p>	<p>PST and PSU</p>	<p>31-Dec-08</p>	<p>Different agencies are on board and working closely with PSU and ITDA to operationalise the strategies developed. PRIA is working for gender mainstreaming, New Concept on Communication, ACCESS for promotion of SHG interventions, Chand &amp; Co and ESSN for Finance Management. WASSAN has been contracted to formulate Exit Strategy for OTELP. Similarly CTRAN is engaged to study the possibility of up scaling the Solar electrification initiatives taken up in Tingnaput village, OTELP.</p>
<p>1.10 Identify socially disadvantaged groups (old, widow, differently challenged, destitute, etc.) and devise a strategy for their inclusion in the SHGs by differential rates of contribution.</p>	<p>PSU/ ITDA/ FNGOs</p>	<p>Begin by February, 09</p>	<p>Efforts have been made in principle to include all household in the SHG fold in the programme villages. Later a specific strategy to address the need of socially dis-advantaged group has been taken up by allocating at least 25% funds available under DIF component. Need based interventions such as poultry, cattle, petty business etc. have been taken up under the programme. Accordingly, till date 6 socially disadvantaged groups from 6 villages have taken up Income Generating Activities with the financial support from RFS component of the programme. The businesses taken up by then are poultry, petty business and Collective Marketing. Now the savings amount with the groups is Rs. 31690/-</p>

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

<b>2. Rural Financial Services</b>	2.1 Analyse the investment pattern and usage of loan funds by the groups (in order to ensure a more effective intervention in livelihood promotion, judicious spending and to prevent over-indebtedness.)	PSU, ITDA, FNGO	March 30, 2009	The investment pattern and usage of loan among the SHGs have been analysed and found about 50% of loan are optimally utilised. The port folio of loan availed from the Banks, FFIs and RFS funds under OTELP is - Consumption - Rs. 68.80, to repay the loan availed from different private sources - Rs. 8.28, loan under Production enhancement is Rs. 85.54 and Loan for Micro Enterprises is Rs. 49.16. Need based training programme, exposure visit, cross learning are being organised to raise the potential of use of funds among the SHGs.
	2.2 Training in Book-keeping; capacity building for the community members to develop cadres of book keeping and book writer specialists among the communities/ SHGs	PSU, ITDA, FNGO	On-going	Book keeping and accounts maintenance by the SHG members is a challenge in the tribal locality, where OTELP is operational. Accordingly, the SHG volunteers and some other literate members of the community have been trained on Book Keeping and accounts. Till date 114 SHGs are writing the bank account with their own members. Recently, a detail module and communication material has been developed with the assistance of ACCESS under the TA to DFID support on Book Keeping and Account Management. ToT on the above is under progress. This will cover at least two barefoot book keepers at the programme village level.
	2.3 Completion of internal audits for all groups.	PSU, ITDA, FNGO	April 30, 2009	Internal audit of SHG accounts has been expedited after the positioning of FSAs in the field. Till date only 408 (32%) SHG books have been audited. However, all SHG audit will be completed by March, 2010.
	2.4 Operationalising the customised M&E software	PSU, ITDA, FNGO	Dec-08	The development of M&E software has been completed. This software has been under operation at PSU/ITDA level for effective monitoring of SHG interventions.
<b>3. Livelihood Enhancement</b>	3.1 Commission a study on suitable approaches to develop natural resources to enhance livelihoods in the Phase II areas (based on experiences and lessons learned from Phase I and other programme interventions in the area.	PSU & ITDA	Initiate by February 2009	This will be covered under the Exit / sustainability strategy being developed with the technical support of WASSAN. The PSU has also prepared the Land & Water Management Manual based on the learning from the Phase I implementation. Similarly the experiences of agriculture interventions made in Phase I are also documented and published.
	3.2 Exposure visits to G.B. Pant Institute of Himalayan Environment & Development for SALT model and BAIF for WADI Model. (and other various NGOs like PRADAN, SPS, BAIF, WOTR, etc.)	PSU & ITDA	On-going	Training and Exposure Visits have been taken up for the staff of OTELP, ITDA, and F.NGO to different institutes as suggested by the JRM team. 20 officers from PSU and ITDA have been attended training at ICRISAT, MANAGE, WOTR etc. Similarly 39 WDTs have been exposed to ICRISAT and MANAGE, Hyderabad on Agriculture and watershed Engineering aspects in 3 batches. The training covered are on Survey Instrument and their implementation, Farm training on Agriculture, process Document, Watershed Engineering etc.

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
 Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

3.3 Develop 4 SALT Models or its locally adopted agro-forestry model (one in each of the 4 Phase I districts.)	PSU & ITDA	Sep-09	The land & water management manual developed by the programme covers the technical and operational methodologies of 4 types of SALT model. The same will be implemented in the Phase I programme areas.
3.4 Develop Quality Control Parameters for all the mechanical or engineering structures under Land & Water Management and undertake quality assessment.	PSU/ ITDA/ FNGOs	On-going	The PSU has contracted with four technically qualified and experienced expert in land and water management for each Phase-I district who will be visiting to the field for about 10 days in a month to undertake quality assessment of mechanical structures created under land and water management component in a random selection basis after the first visit of the experts the quality indicators will be defined by them and accordingly a threshold limit will be fixed beyond which the expert will make 100% quality checking of those structures.
<b>Agriculture and horticulture</b>			
3.5 Promote 10 more FFS promotion (5 for SRI and 5 for vegetables) for agricultural intensification.	PSU & ITDA	Aug-09	16 FFS on SRI and 12 FFS on other crops such as vegetables, ground nut etc. have been promoted during the period in Gajapati and Kandhamal districts for the purpose of agricultural intensification. However demonstrations under SRI has been made in all four Phase I ITDAs along with exposure of the farmers to the demonstration field for technology dissemination.
3.6 Promote one Agriculture and Horticulture volunteer in each micro-watershed with adequate training.	PSU & ITDA	Jun-09	135 Village Volunteers for agriculture and horticulture promotion have been promoted in 135 micro watersheds covering 360 villages of phase I programme area. Each of these village volunteers have been trained in basic agricultural practices by the local agricultural officers and from the <i>Krishi Vigyan Kendras</i> . Each village volunteer has been assigned with the management of at least three Agricultural Resource Centres (ARC) equipped with small but useful farm equipments for promoting farm mechanisation for production enhancement. These volunteers have also been equipped with different extension materials from the govt. and from project to intensify the agriculture interventions. Similarly, 113 such volunteers have been identified in the Phase II areas of the Phase I district and are undergoing various capacity building activities and exposures. In Phase II districts another 110 such volunteers will be promoted.
3.7 Promote planting of fruit trees and vegetable cultivation on homesteads/backyards with at least half of the SHG members.	PSU & ITDA	Sep-09	Planting of fruit trees and vegetable cultivation on homestead/ backyards have been promoted by the programme during the evaluation period. 4847 households have been supported with 6878 horticulture plants and 4745 vegetable kits planting in their homestead/ backyard. All these households are part of the SHG of their village.

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
 Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

3.8 Piloting the model of agri-business agents with at least 100 youth (preference to landless, including women) with adequate training.	PSU & ITDA	Sep-09	58 Cadres have been oriented extensively with the technical assistance of MART to promote Agri Business model in OTELP programme villages. Besides about 152 SHG volunteers promoted in the programme villages are reportedly functioning effectively. The selection of volunteers / cadres have made from the programme villages.
3.9 Promote MART-model of road side agri-business outlets at least in 10 micro-watersheds.	PSU & ITDA	Jun-09	4 MART model road side business have been taken up in the programme villages covering more than 10 MWS. However up-scaling of the similar road side agri business outlet will be taken up this year. In this regard, profile of availability of products, availability details has been worked out.
3.10 Exposure visit of selected SHGs/ Women (including FNGOs & ITDA staff) to areas of Orissa/ Chhattisgarh on bio-gas construction, operation and maintenance, and use of slurry for agricultural production.	PSU & ITDA & FNGO	Jun-09	To be taken up during January-February, 2010.
<b>Livestock &amp; Aquaculture</b>			
3.11 Promote improved breed of livestock among at least 50 more landless households.	PSU & ITDA	Jun-09	Since previous JRM (Nov. 08), 557 landless households have been facilitated to take up livestock based livelihood activities preferably improved breed of goat and hen. The project facilitated the capacity building of those households along with livestock support services through the para-vet workers supported by the project.
3.12 Promote one livestock volunteer in every micro watershed with adequate training in livestock management, provision of veterinary kits and linkages with State Veterinary Department.	PSU & ITDA	Jun-09	135 Livestock Volunteers (para-vet workers) promoted in 135 micro watersheds covering 360 villages of phase I programme area. Each of these para-vet workers has been trained by the local offices of the state veterinary department and facilitated to receive the vaccines and medicines for animals from the department. More than 70% of the promoted volunteers are effectively delivering the services not only in the programme villages but also in adjoining villages. This has impacted over the income of the volunteer and also increased the social status in the vicinity. Similarly, 113 such volunteers have been identified in the Phase II areas of the Phase I district and are undergoing training. In Phase II districts another 110 such volunteers will be promoted.

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
 Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

	3.13 Obtain basic livestock disease control and management extension materials from the State Veterinary Department and distribute widely to communities through training on livestock management and care.	PSU & ITDA	Jun-09	Inadequate IEC material is available with the State Veterinary Department. The sample materials have been brought from the department and the same is being under further production through communication strategy implementation agency.
	3.14 Pilot fodder development activities in at least in 10 micro-watersheds for demonstration.	PSU & ITDA	Jun-09	Fodder piloting has been promoted in 74.10 Ha of area covering about 40 MWSS in Koraput, Gajapati and Kandhamal districts of Phase I programme area. The species demonstrated are Hybrid Bajra, MP Cheri, Stylo, Berseem, Oats, Azola, Subabul, Maize and Cowpea.
	3.15 At least 10 more water bodies constructed under the land and water management component may be developed for aquaculture involving SHGs and/or landless households as User Groups.	PSU & ITDA	Jun-09	135 water bodies created under Land & Water Management are promoted for aquaculture involving 128 SHGs in four Phase I programme villages. These SHGs released fish fries purchased from the local govt. nursery. In Gajapati district one SHG has started a nursery of fingerlings.
<b>4. Monitoring &amp; Evaluation</b>	4.1 Arrangements to be made for regular maintenance/updating of the software and periodic training of staff with the technical assistance of the developer (CES)	PSU	31-Jan-09	The M&E software development agency i.e CES technologies limited is supporting in maintenance and updating of the software. The Manager MIS and MIS Executive of ITDAs have been oriented by the agency in operation and maintenance of the software. Further this staffs are also trained on the Ms-SQL Server, .Net etc which are used to develop the software.
<b>5. Fiduciary Aspects</b>	5.1 Status report on fixed assets to be compiled by staff teams created for the purpose	PSU	Mar-09	The PSU has constituted a team comprising the Revenue & Administrative Officer, Manager MIS and Asst. Section Officer to prepare a status report of the fixed assets at PSU. The team has physically verified the status of the assets and compiled the same. The report will be produced before the forthcoming JRM.
	5.2 Financial /accounting operational Manual as a reference guide for to be introduced	PSU	Mar-09	The draft operational manual for financial management and accounting is being prepared with the support of PST (DFID TA). The same is now being edited by the Chief Finance Officer of PSU before release.
	5.3 Internal executive guidelines for procurement to be issued to the ITDAs	PD-PSU	Jan-09	The programme adopts the procurement guidelines as per the PIM duly approved by the Govt. which is within the perview of the IFAD procurement guideline. Further, the PIM has very clearly defined the delegation of financial limits for the field units as well as PSU. The same is under operation and reiterated to all concern for information and necessary action.

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

	5.4 Internal Audit at all levels by through firms of external auditors.	PSU	Begin by April 2009 for FY 2009-10	External audit agencies from the respective ITDA Head Quarters have been selected and contracted to undertake internal audits at ITDAs. The first internal audit report is expected by end of October 2009.
<b>6. Sustainability</b>	6.1 Commission studies of project management experience of various CBOs (particularly VDCs, VLSCs, and SHGs)	PSU/PST	31-Mar-09	Being covered under designing of the Exit Strategy.
	6.2 Document schemes implemented by Panchayat Raj, ITDA and Rural Development Departments in programme areas and provide this information to all VDCs for convergence.	PSU/PST	31-Mar-09	The Orissa Watershed Development Mission with the support of DFID funded project, WORLP has published a information booklet covering different schemes implemented by the state Panchayati Raj, Rural development, SC & ST development department and other Government agency for the welfare of the poor people living in the state. The PSU has placed an indent for 500 copies of the booklet which will be provided to the VDCs, FNGOs and ITDAs. As informed by the OWDM the copies will be sent by them within a month.
	6.3 Develop strategy or guidelines for convergence particularly with NREGS and various ITDA schemes.	PSU/Panchayati Raj Department/ST&SC Development Department	Start by 30 June 09	The matter has been taken up with Govt. Accordingly the Development Commissioner cum Addl. Chief Secretary has taken a review meeting on convergence of NREGS with other developmental schemes of different departments on 15th Oct, 2009. The Commissioner cum Secretary, Panchayat Raj Department has been requested to simplify the implementation process under NREGS and issue strategic guideline for convergence with NREGS.  Further, the DC cum ACS, while reviewing the prospective plan of SC & SC Development Department, on 14th October, 2009 has advised the Principal Secretary, ST & SC Development Department for issue of instruction to all ITDAs (including non OTELP ITDAs) to adopt the process and successful interventions in OTELP and also ensure convergence with OTELP.
	6.4 Incorporate a review of bank financing in OTELP areas in various banking coordination forums	PSU/Panchayati Raj Department	Start by 30 June 09	The staff of ITDA particularly the PO (PM&E), Finance Officer and Micro Finance Officer are attending the district level bankers meeting chaired by the District Collector. The issues relating to the bank financing to SHG or regarding the transactions of VDC/ VLSC are being taken up and resolved.

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
 Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

	6.5 Develop strategies to institutionalise collective marketing initiatives	PSU/MART/PST	Start by 30 June 09	Series of capacity building programme has been taken up for the staff of OTELP at ITDA and F.NGO level so as to mainstream the Collective Marketing in the programme perspectives. Similarly, 58 cadres have been promoted from the community to provide hands on support to the community on regular basis. Besides, more than 170 SHG volunteers reported to working effectively at the village level to facilitate Collective Marketing. Recently, a study has been commissioned to assess the impact of the initiative on Collective Marketing and to recommend the strategy to mainstream the intervention effectively.
<b>7. Exit Strategy</b>	7.1 Commission a study to prepare Exit Strategy	PSU/PST	31-Mar-09	M/s Wassan, Hyderabad has been contracted to execute a study to prepare the exit strategy. The team constitutes with four members from different thematic areas like watershed management, institution specialist, production enhancement specialist and gender specialist. The team has already undertaken field visit in 3 districts and organised a State level workshop to disseminate the observations made during the first round of field visit. Based on the feedback given during the workshop the team revisited the framework proposed and planned for the second round of field visit. It is expected that the final draft of the exit strategy will be presented before the fourth coming JRM.

**Appendix 3: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier;  
 by component and disbursements by category**

**Table 3A: Financial performance by financier**

Financier	Approval	Disbursements (INR)	Per cent disbursed
	(USD '000)		
<b>IFAD loan</b>	19,996.00	4,214.73	21.08
<b>DFID grant</b>	15,080.00	8,442.07	55.98
<b>Co-financier</b>	12,317.00	-	-
<b>Government</b>	9,567.00	16,185.23	169.18
<b>Total</b>	<b>56,960.00</b>	<b>28,842.04</b>	50.64

**Table 3B: Financial performance by financier by component (USD '000)**

Component	IFAD loan			DFID Grant			Government			Domestic 1			Total		
	Approval	Actual	%	Approval	Actual	%	Approval	Actual	%	Approval	Actual	%	Approval	Actual	%
Capacity Building for Empowerment	1.78	0.78	43.50	3.56	1.55	43.50	2.75	1.20	43.50				8.10	3.52	43.50
Livelihood Enhancement	11.91	2.67	22.43	23.81	5.34	22.43	18.40	4.13	22.43				54.12	12.14	22.43
Support for Policy Initiative	0.37	-	-	0.74	-	-	0.57	-	-				1.69	-	-
Development Initiative Fund	1.03	0.08	7.45	2.06	0.15	7.45	1.59	0.12	7.45				4.68	0.35	7.45
Programme Management	1.82	0.35	19.16	3.63	0.70	19.16	2.81	0.54	19.16				8.25	1.58	19.16
Food Handling	0.16	0.05	29.65	0.32	0.09	29.65	0.24	0.07	29.65				0.72	0.21	29.65
<b>Total</b>	<b>17.06</b>	<b>3.92</b>	<b>22.96</b>	<b>34.13</b>	<b>7.84</b>	<b>22.96</b>	<b>26.37</b>	<b>6.05</b>	<b>22.96</b>				<b>77.56</b>	<b>17.81</b>	<b>22.96</b>

**C: IFAD loan disbursements (SDR, as at dd-mth-yr)**

<b>Table 3C:</b>		IFAD loan disbursements (SDR)		In USD			
<b>Category</b>	<b>Category description</b>	<b>Original Allocation</b>	<b>Revised Allocation</b>	<b>Disbursement</b>	<b>W/A pending</b>	<b>Balance</b>	<b>Per cent disbursed</b>
I	Vehicle Equipments & Materials	100,000.00	150,000.00	80,352.45	23,560.13		
II	Technical Assistance, Contractual Services	570,000.00	3,080,000.00	719,952.19	358,233.94		
III	Investment Fund	400,000.00	4,540,000.00	2,793,767.30	1,553,946.60		
IV	Grant Fund	40,000.00	240,000.00	61,835.11	118,688.83		
V	Credit Fund	15,000.00	210,000.00	173,541.77	-		
VI	Development Initiative Fund	210,000.00	1,010,000.00	170,602.09	207,359.79		
VII	Salary and Allowances	90,000.00	690,000.00	157,242.30	81,389.51		
VIII	Other incremental Operating Cost	20,000.00	160,000.00	57,541.45	45,050.21		
IX	Unallocated Phase –I	205,000.00	9,200,000.00				
	Phase-II	9,200,000.00	-				
	Phase-III	5,200,000.00	5,200,000.00				
	Initial deposit	-					
	<b>Total</b>	<b>16,050,000.00</b>	<b>24,480,000.00</b>	<b>4,214,834.64</b>	<b>2,388,229.00</b>		

**Table 3C:**

		DFID Grant disbursements (USD)		In USD			
Category	Category description	Original Allocation	Revised Allocation	Disbursement	W/A pending	Balance	Per cent disbursed
I	Vehicle Equipments & Materials		400,000.00	167,395.21	75,067.45		
II	Technical Assistance, Contractual Services		2,220,000.00	1,118,856.23	1,396,911.40		
III	Investment Fund		1,540,000.00	5,927,554.72	4,217,111.02		
IV	Grant Fund		160,000.00	127,898.94	293,323.55		
V	Credit Fund		50,000.00	404,930.79	-		
VI	Development Initiative Fund		820,000.00	238,054.51	643,856.51		
VII	Salary and Allowances		320,000.00	339,734.79	217,072.77		
VIII	Other incremental Operating Cost		60,000.00	117,653.68	121,726.89		
IX	Unallocated Phase –I		870,000.00				
	Phase-II		8,640,000.00				
	Phase-III		-				
	Initial deposit		-				
	<b>Total</b>			<b>8,442,078.87</b>			
			<b>15,080,000.00</b>		<b>6,965,069.60</b>		

**Figure 1: IFAD loan/grant disbursement, comparisons between original and revised allocations and actual disbursement**

**Appendix 4: Compliance with financing agreement covenants: Status of implementation**

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/ Date	Remarks
Section 1.05	<i>Appointment of the Cooperating Institution.</i> The Fund intends to appoint the United Nations Office for Project Services (UNOPS) as the Cooperating Institution, with the responsibilities set forth in Article III (The Cooperating Institution) of the General Conditions, to administer the Loan and supervise the Programme, at the expense of the Fund, in accordance with the Cooperation Agreement. The Borrower hereby agrees to such appointment.			Not Applicable
SECTION 2.03	<i>Special Account.</i> (a) The Borrower shall open and thereafter maintain in a bank, proposed by the Borrower and accepted by the Fund, a Special Account denominated in US Dollars for the purpose of financing the Programme with an authorised allocation of two million US dollars (USD 2 000 000) (the "Authorised Allocation"). The Special Account shall be protected against set-off, seizure or attachment on terms and conditions proposed by the Borrower and accepted by the Fund.	On Going	Being complied with	
	(d)The Borrower shall operate the Special Account in accordance with Section 4.08 of the General Conditions.	On Going	Being complied with	
SECTION 2.04	The Borrower and each Programme Party shall use the proceeds of the Loan exclusively to finance Eligible Expenditures in accordance with this Agreement and the General Conditions.	On Going	Being complied with	
ARTICLE III SECTION 3.02	The PSU shall prepare a draft annual work plan and budget ("AWPB") for each Programme Year. Each draft AWPB shall include, among other things, a detailed description of planned Programme activities during the coming Programme Year, and the sources and uses of funds therefore, based on the respective VRMPs or work plans	On Going	Being complied with	

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/ Date	Remarks
	and budgets prepared by each of the Programme Parties, in accordance with paragraph 9 of Schedule 3.			
	The PSU shall submit each draft AWPB to the PSC for its approval, then to the Fund and the Cooperating Institution, for their respective comments and approval, no later than sixty (60) days before the beginning of the relevant Programme Year. If neither the Fund nor the Cooperating Institution comments on the draft AWPB within 30 days after receipt, the AWPB shall be deemed approved.	On Going	Being complied with from 2006/07	
	The PSC shall adopt each AWPB approved by the Fund and the Cooperating Institution, and the PSU shall provide copies thereof to the Fund and the Cooperating Institution, prior to the commencement of the relevant Programme Year.	On Going	Being complied with	
	If required, the PSU, through the Lead Programme Agency, may propose adjustments to the AWPB during the relevant Programme Year, which shall become effective upon approval by the Borrower, the Cooperating Institution and the Fund.		Doesn't arise at this stage	
SECTION 3.03	The PSU shall open and thereafter maintain, in a bank proposed by the Lead Programme Agency and accepted by the Fund, a current account denominated in INR for Programme operations.	On Going	Being complied with	
	Each ITDA shall open and thereafter maintain, in a bank proposed by the ITDA and accepted by the Fund, a current account denominated in INR for Programme operations (each an "ITDA Programme Account"). The Programme Administrator of each ITDA shall be fully authorised to operate the relevant ITDA Programme Account.	On Going	Being complied with	
	Each VDC shall open and thereafter maintain, in the local branch of a commercial bank, a current account denominated in INR for Programme operations (each an	On Going	Being complied with	

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/ Date	Remarks
	"VDC Programme Account"). The Chairperson of each VDC shall be fully authorised to operate the relevant VDC Programme Account.			
SECTION 3.04	The Borrower shall make the proceeds of the Loan available to the State in accordance with the AWPBs and its customary national procedures for the transfer of external funding to carry out the Programme.	On Going	Being complied with	
	The Borrower shall ensure that the State makes the proceeds of the Loan available to the Lead Programme Agency and each other Programme Party in accordance with the AWPBs and the Programme Agreement to carry out the Programme.	On Going	Being complied with	
SECTION 3.05	In addition to the proceeds of the Loan, the Borrower shall make available to the Lead Programme Agency and each other Programme Party, promptly as needed, such funds, facilities, services and other resources as may be required from time to time to carry out the Programme in accordance with this Agreement.	On Going	Being complied with	
	The Borrower shall ensure that the State makes available to the Lead Programme Agency counterpart funds from its own resources, in an aggregate amount of approximately USD 9 567 000.	On Going	Being complied with	
	The Borrower shall make the DFID Grant and the WFP Food Assistance available to the Lead Programme Agency and each other Programme Party in accordance with the AWPBs upon their availability thereof.		DFID funds not yet available WFP being provided	
ARTICLE IV Section 4.01	The PSU shall establish, as soon as practicable but in no event later than 180 days after the Effective Date, and thereafter maintain an appropriate information management system to enable it to continuously monitor the Programme in accordance with paragraph 16 of		Has been complied	

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/ Date	Remarks
	Schedule 3 hereto and Section 8.02 (Monitoring of Programme Implementation) of the General Conditions, based on indicators agreed by the State and the Fund, in consultation with the Participants.			
Section 4.02	The PSU shall submit to the Fund and the Cooperating Institution semi-annual and annual progress reports on Programme implementation, in accordance with paragraph 3.3 (d) of Schedule 3 and as required by Section 8.03 (Progress Reports) of the General Conditions, no later than 30 June and 31 December each Programme Year.	On Going	Being complied with from 2005/06 annual report	
Section 4.03	The Borrower, the Lead Programme Agency, the Fund, the Cooperating Institution and the Participants shall jointly carry out a review of Programme implementation at the beginning of the second half of each of the third and seventh Programme Years.	On Going	Being complied with	
ARTICLE V Section 5.01	The Lead Programme Agency shall prepare the financial statements of the operations, resources and expenditures related to the Programme required by Section 9.02 (Financial Statements) of the General Conditions in respect of each six-month period during each Fiscal Year and deliver such financial statements to the Fund and the Cooperating Institution within four months after the end of each such period.	On Going	Being complied with	
Section 5.02	Within 90 days after the Effective Date, the Borrower shall designate or appoint, with the prior approval of the Fund, the Controller and Auditor-General of the Borrower or any independent auditors selected in accordance with the procedures and criteria agreed upon by the Fund to audit the accounts relating to the Programme for each Fiscal Year until the Closing Date.	On Going	Being complied with	
SCHEDULE 1	1. The Programme shall be carried out in 30 blocks with high tribal concentrations in the northern tribal belt and in the following South-western districts of the State:	On Going	10 blocks have been selected for Phase I and 20	

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/ Date	Remarks
	Phulbani, Gajpati, Kalahandi, Kandhamal, Koarput, Malkangiri, Nawarangpur and Rayagada (the "Programme Area").		blocks have been selected for Phase II	
	2. The Programme shall benefit both tribal and non-tribal households in Programme Area villages comprised of at least 60% scheduled tribes or scheduled castes, as selected through participatory rural appraisal ("PRA") or other participatory methodologies. Priority shall be given to marginalised or in the process of marginalisation groups, namely women, Primitive Tribal Groups (PTGs), hill cultivators, landless and marginal farmers and scheduled castes.	On Going	Being complied with	
	3. The State shall ensure that the villages selected under the Programme shall have no less than 60% tribal and scheduled caste population, and shall otherwise conform to selection criteria to be agreed upon by the Fund and the Borrower.	On Going	Being complied with	
SCHEDULE 2 Para 4. (a)	No disbursement shall be made to any VDC under the Land and Water Management Fund, Participatory Forest Management Fund, or Community Infrastructure Fund until such VDC has been duly formed and its Social and Financial Audit Sub-Committee has been established in accordance with paragraph 8.1 of Schedule 3; the VDC has entered into the ITDA Memorandum of Understanding, in accordance with paragraph 5.3 of Schedule 3 and approved by the Fund, and has opened its VDC Programme Account	On Going	Being Complied with	
SCHEDULE 2 Para 4. (b)	No disbursement shall be made to any NGO until such NGO has been duly selected in accordance with selection criteria approved by the Fund, and the NGO has entered into a memorandum of understanding with the relevant ITDA, in form and substance accepted by the Fund.	On Going	Being complied with	
SCHED. 3	The State shall establish and maintain throughout the Programme Implementation Period a Programme steering	On Going	Being complied	

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/ Date	Remarks
A.2	committee ("PSC").		with	
	3.1 The State shall establish and maintain a Programme Support Unit (the "PSU") within the Lead Programme Agency. The PSU shall enjoy operational autonomy and, to this end, the State shall issue a delegation of authority to the Programme Director and any other key officer of the PSU to take any action necessary for Programme implementation. Within 150 days of the Effective Date, the key officers in the PSU shall have been recruited.	On Going	Being complied with	
	4.1 Within three months of the Effective Date, the State shall appoint a qualified and experienced Programme Director ("PD"), accepted by the Fund. The PD shall serve at least until the end of Phase I, subject to satisfactory performance as determined by the State in agreement with the Fund, and any successor thereto shall have similar qualifications, serve under similar terms and conditions and be accepted by the Fund.		Complied with initially. However, IFAD was not consulted when new PD was posted as noted during by MTR Mission	
	5.1 Each ITDA shall endeavour to strengthen its autonomy as a registered society to permit it to operate bank accounts, hire staff from the government or the open market, including the Programme Administrator and the Financial and Administration Officer, and establish independent financial and personnel policies. The Project Level Committee shall establish a Management Committee, chaired by the District Collector, to provide regular management support, including the review and monitoring of Programme implementation. All staff shall be hired on renewable contracts. Within 150 days of the Effective Date, the key officers of each ITDA shall have been recruited including the Programme Administrator and the Financial and Administration Officer for each Phase I ITDA. The State shall not permit the transfer of	On Going	Being complied with	

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/ Date	Remarks
	government officers on secondment to the ITDA, unless requested by the Project Level Committee of the ITDA in writing to, and approved by, the State.			
	5.1.1 Within 120 days of the Effective Date, the financial and personnel regulations of the First Phase ITDAs shall have been approved.	On Going	Being complied with	
	5.3.1 Each ITDA shall enter into an agreement with each VDC in its District for Programme implementation and transfer of Loan proceeds (each an "ITDA MOU").	On Going	Being complied with	
	6.1 The PSU shall recruit Facilitating and Resource NGOs to support Programme implementation as set forth below. All NGOs shall be selected through an open, competitive process, based on selection criteria approved by the Fund. Within 180 days of the Effective Date, each Phase I ITDA shall have prepared the short list of Facilitating and Resource NGOs.	On Going	Being complied with	
	7.1 Facilitating NGOs shall recruit multi-disciplinary Watershed Development Teams (each a "WDT") to provide technical support services for Programme implementation. Each WDT shall be comprised of the following experts, as appropriate: SHG and micro-finance capacity building; soil conservation; irrigation; training; accounting; agriculture, horticulture, forestry, marketing and legal affairs.	On Going	Being complied with	
	8.1 VDCs shall be formed with the assistance of Facilitating NGOs contracted by the relevant ITDA. Two-thirds of the members of the VDC shall be drawn from SHGs and/or user group office bearers, with the remainder selected by the Village Assembly to include two members of the PRI, including its ward member. Each VDC shall elect a Chairperson, Vice-Chairperson, Secretary and Treasurer, who shall form the Management Committee. Each VDC shall also establish a Social and Financial Audit Sub-Committee and Technical Sub-	On Going	Being complied with	

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/ Date	Remarks
	Committees, as necessary.			
	15.1 The PSU shall prepare a draft Programme Implementation Manual as soon as practicable but in no event later than six months after the Effective Date. The Programme Implementation Manual shall include, among other things:	On Going	Being complied with	
	15.2 The PSU shall prepare a draft Programme Implementation Manual as soon as practicable but in no event later than six months after the Effective Date. The Programme Implementation Manual shall include, among other things:	On Going	Being complied with but late	
	15.3 The PSC shall adopt the Programme Implementation Manual, substantially in the form approved by the Fund, and the Lead Programme Agency shall promptly provide copies thereof to the Fund and the Cooperating Institution. If neither the Fund nor the Cooperating Institution comments on the draft Programme Implementation Manual within 30 days after receipt, it shall be deemed approved.	On Going	Being complied with	
	The Programme Implementation Manual shall be modified only with prior consent of the Fund.	On Going	Being complied with	
	16.1 The PSU shall contract an agency specialised in monitoring and evaluation to design the Programme's monitoring and evaluation system. The team shall collectively have expertise in participatory methods, computer and information technology, statistical methods and rural development practices.	On Going	Being complied with	
SCHEDULE 3A	The State shall endeavour to take any Actions required to: (a) provide each ITDA with the financial, administrative and personnel autonomy necessary to permit it to carry out its responsibilities set forth in Schedule 3 and the Programme Implementation Manual;	On Going	Being complied with	

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/ Date	Remarks
	(b) ensure inter-departmental cooperation; and (c) otherwise facilitate Programme implementation.			
SCHEDULE 4 Part A	1) Procurement of goods and civil works financed by the Loan shall be subject to the provisions of the "Guidelines for Procurement under Financial Assistance from the International Fund for Agricultural Development of 1982", as such guidelines may be amended from time to time by the Fund (the "Procurement Guidelines").	On Going	Being complied with	
	2) Procurement of consultant services financed from the proceeds of the Loan shall be undertaken in accordance with procedures proposed by the Borrower and approved by the Fund.	On Going	Complied with	
	3) To the extent possible, the goods, civil works and services shall be bulked into sizeable bid packages in such a manner as to permit the optimal use of competitive bidding. Before the commencement of procurement, the PSU shall furnish to the Cooperating Institution, for approval: (i) a list or lists of goods and services to be procured; (ii) the proposed grouping of these goods and services; and (iii) the proposed number and scope of civil works contracts to be awarded.	On Going	Being complied with	
	6) Local Competitive Bidding (LCB). Each contract for the supply of civil works shall be awarded on the basis of competitive bidding advertised locally, in accordance with procedures approved by the Cooperating Institution.	On Going	Being complied with	
Part C	7) Local Competitive Bidding (LCB) Each contract for the supply of goods, vehicles and equipment estimated to cost USD 25 000 equivalent or more shall be awarded on the basis of competitive bidding advertised locally, in accordance with procedures approved by the Cooperating Institution.	On Going	Being complied with	
	8) Local Shopping. Each contract for the supply of goods, vehicles and equipment estimated to cost USD 10 000	On Going	Being complied	

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/ Date	Remarks
	equivalent or more but less than USD 25 000 equivalent shall be awarded on the basis of evaluating and comparing bids invited from at least three suppliers, in accordance with procedures approved by the Cooperating Institution.		with	
	9) Direct Contracting. Each contract for the supply of goods, vehicles and equipment estimated to cost less than USD 10 000 equivalent shall be awarded through direct contracting with the contractor/supplier, on terms and conditions approved by the Cooperating Institution.	On Going	Being complied with	
Part D	10) International Competitive Bidding (ICB). Each contract for consultant services estimated to cost USD 100 000 equivalent or more shall be awarded following ICB procedures.	On Going	Being complied with	
	11) Local Competitive Bidding (LCB). Each contract for consultant services estimated to cost USD 25 000 equivalent or more but less than USD 100 000 equivalent shall be awarded on the basis of competitive bidding advertised locally.	On Going	Being complied with	
Part E	15. Procurement of Services. In the procurement of consultant services, everything else being equal, preference shall be given to consultants from developing Member States of the Fund.	On Going	Being complied with	
Part F	16. The award of any contract for goods, vehicles and equipment or civil works estimated to cost USD 100 000 equivalent or more shall be subject to prior review by the Cooperating Institution in accordance with the provisions of Annex 3 to the Procurement Guidelines.	On Going	Being complied with	
	17. The award of any contract for consultant services estimated to cost USD 100 000 equivalent or more shall be subject to prior review by the Cooperating Institution.	On Going	Being complied with	

**Appendix 5: Physical progress measured against AWP&B and appraisal targets, including RIMS indicators**

(Note: The duly completed RO-AWP&B Table, if used by the project, may be attached instead)

Period: dd-mm-yy to dd-mm-yy				
Impact and Outcomes	Indicators (with global target if available)	Achievements (as per M&E data)	RIMS Rating	
			(by Project)	(by supervision mission)
<b>Impact level</b>				
<b>Overall Goal</b> Quality of life of poor tribal households in remote areas sustainably improved	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Increased employment opportunities in the external environment for the households in the programme are resulting from diversified economy</li> <li>▪ Increased incomes of households in the programme area resulting from a diversified economy</li> <li>▪ Health indicators (IMR and MMR) in the programme area are on par with state averages</li> <li>▪ Educational indicators (literacy and school completion rates) in the programme area are on par with state averages</li> <li>▪ Tribal women, men and children in the programme area enjoy civil and political rights and access to justice on a par with other communities in the State for the rights defined under PESA, Prevention of Atrocities Act, Regulation-3 1956, Money lending Act, Forest Right Act, NREG Act and Right to Information</li> </ul>			
<b>Project Purpose</b> Livelihoods and food security of 75,000 poor tribal households sustainably improved	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Increase of at least 50% in real income of poor tribal households including the ultra poor and vulnerable households by EOP</li> <li>▪ At least 50% of <u>Below Poverty Level</u> households show a sustainable increase in assets by EOP</li> <li>▪ At least 20% reduction in incidence of severe malnutrition<sup>3</sup> amongst children (0-36 months) in Programme villages by EOP</li> <li>▪ Decrease in incidence of lean season food</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ There has been significant increase in income of the poor tribal households by diversification of the livelihood portfolio. The poor tribal people have reported increase in income from the activities like Horticulture, vegetable cultivation, goat rearing, poultry, fishery and increased availability of wage employment in the locality.</li> <li>▪ The asset index of the households of Phase I</li> </ul>		

<sup>3</sup> To be assessed from the level of incidence as arrived at from the anthropometric study conducted in 2009

	<p>shortages reported by all the households in programme area by EOP</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Significant reduction in incidence of distress migration of the project households by EOP</li> <li>▪ Decrease in indebtedness to moneylender as proportion of overall indebtedness reported by all the households accessing credit in the programme reported by EOP</li> <li>▪ Atleast 80% of households in the programme area have access to a permanent safe source of drinking water within 100 meters of the household by EOP</li> <li>▪ All the individuals in atleast 20% of the programme villages have access to and report use of toilets by EOP</li> </ul>	<p>programme villages has been increased to 18.2 from 15.1 of baseline (2004)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Data collected during RIMS survey but not analyzed.</li> <li>▪ 62% of the total households of Phase I villages reports having enough food through out the year in comparison to 4.2% during baseline (2004). 37% of the total households of Phase I have two square meals a day with occasionally shortage in comparison to 53% during baseline (2004).</li> <li>▪ Distressed migration has been reduced to 7% in comparison to 34% during baseline (2004) in the Phase I programme villages.</li> <li>▪ 71.97% of the households of Phase I programme villages have reported decreased dependency on money lenders as they have access to rural financial services of the programme.</li> <li>▪ 98% of the total households of the Phase I programme villages reported access to permanent safe drinking water within 100 meters from their house. Out of which 6% of the households have access to tap water in their village and 7% of the households have been provided with tap water in their house. 71 villages out of 390 (20%) of Phase I have provided with tap water to their individual households and villages. Others are accessing the drinking water on the public well and handpump.</li> <li>▪ 4613 households out of 19481 which is about 24% of the total households in Phase I villages have access and reporting use of toilets</li> </ul>				
<b>Output level</b>						
<b>Outputs by component</b>	<b>Indicator</b>	<b>(Physical) Targets</b>				
		<b>AWP&amp;B (planned)</b>	<b>Actual (achieved)</b>	<b>%</b>	<b>Appraisal (Global)</b>	<b>Cumulative (so far)</b>

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

<b>Component 1 - Purpose: Capacity Building for Empowerment</b>							
<b>Community Empowerment &amp; Management</b>							
Community Mobilization Camp	No. of VLSCs/ VDCs (all CBOs) formed and strengthened	1924	1234			2892	
Training Programme for CBOs (SHG/ VDC)	No. of SHGs trained	2110	1440			5400	
<b>Beneficiary Skill Up-gradation</b>							
Training & Exposure on L&W Mgt to Village Volunteer/ Barefoot Engineers/ UGs	No. of L&W VVs trained	467	230		1600	461	
Training and Exposure of farmers on improved technologies and crop management	No. of farmers trained	637	211		2400	738	
Training & Exposure to the Livestock Village Volunteers/ Beneficiaries on Livestock management	No. of Livestock Volunteers trained on vaccination/ AI	353	156		2400	512	
Training & Exposure on Non Farm/ Off Farm Income Generating activities	No. of members trained to Income generating activities	811	187		4000	627	
Training to Unemployed Youth	No of youths trained and employed	120	45		800	199	
Training to the FNGO Staff and other support agencies		171	41		800	181	
Training to the Programme Staff (ITDA & PSU)	No. of staffs from PSU and ITDAs trained by categories	20	12		200	56	
FNGO Facilitation Cost		34	34		34	34	
RNGO Support for Capacity Building	No. of RNGOs supporting the project	7	7		NT	12	
<b>Component 2 - Purpose: Livelihood Enhancement</b>							

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

<b>Land &amp; Water Management</b>							
Creation of Water Bodies	Ha of agriculture land with increased irrigation	4770	432		NT	4065	
Irrigation Channels/ Water ways		25111	22412		NT	158000	
Land Development (Field/ Contour Bonding)	Ha of land brought under agriculture	819.908333	1167000		NT	11848000	
Land Development (Contour Trench)		244.73	13433		NT	173000	
Gully Control	No. of gullies stabilised	5294	2455		NT	42171	
Vermi Pit/ Compost Pit		1639	187		NT	-	
Plantation for Soil Conservation	No. of patches where plantation raised	5722.08	56556		NT	-	
Nursery for Plantation	No. of Nurseries raised	10	10		NT	-	
Provision of equipments	No. of MWS provided with equipments	11	11		34	23	
<b>Agriculture &amp; Horticulture Development</b>							
Creation of Agriculture Resource Centre	No. of Agriculture Resource Centres created	130	113		1034	521	
Improved Agriculture Crop Demonstration	No. of demonstrations made	13939.5	1743		NT		
Horticulture Crop Demonstration including promotion of Kitchen Garden	No. of Horticulture Demonstrations Made	2069	4847		NT		
New Crop Demonstration	No. of New Crops introduced	10	408		NT		
Intercropping Demonstration		33	259		NT		
New Technology Demonstration		435	84		NT		
<b>Livestock &amp; Aquaculture Production</b>							
Promotion of Paravet workers with provision of vet kit	No. of paravet workers actively supporting farmers	110	113		NT		

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

Livestock livelihood model demonstration (Goat Rearing)	No. of models demonstrated	43	44		NT		
Livestock livelihood model demonstration (Other Animals)		40	0		NT		
Livestock livelihood model demonstration (Poultry/ Other Bird)		218	56		NT		
Breed Upgradation (Goat/ Sheep/ Pig etc.)	No. of animals/ birds upgraded	30	91		NT		
Breed Upgradation (Birds)		487	1426		NT		
Vaccination and De-worming of Animals/ Birds	No. of animals/ birds immunized/ vaccinated	28137	62885		NT		
Fodder Development & Promotion	Ha of land under fodder cultivation	2	295		NT		
Pisciculture Promotion/ Demonstration	No. of ponds/ groups used/ adopted for pisciculture	32	36		NT		
<b>Rural Financial Services</b>							
Seed Capital to the SHGs	No. of SHGs received the seed capital for initiating IGA	548	211		4800	3732	
Revolving funds to SHGs	No. of SHGs prepared IGA plans and received Revolving funds				4800	3732	
Farm Based Micro Enterprises		91	65		NT		
Livestock Based Enterprises		263	112		NT		
Trading/ Vending/ Collective Marketing		357	78		NT		
Processing/ Skill Based Enterprise		35	5		NT		
Pisciculture Activities		63	36		NT		
SHG Kit	No. of SHGs Received Start up kit	646	300		4800	3732	

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
 Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

<b>Participatory Forest Management</b>							
Raising of Nursurry		83	125		NT		
Plantation in Ha		1905	1508		NT		
Silvicultural Cleaning and Forest Operations		8089	8924		NT		
Soil Conservation Measures inside the forest		5485	3211		NT		
Other Forestry Activities		1924	847		NT		
<b>Community Infrastructure Fund</b>							
Infrastructure for Village Storage, Processing, Marketing and Value Addition		133	65		358	136	
Infrastructure for Drinking Water and Sanitation		4039	1677		NT	4613	
Infrastructure for Micro Enterprises		34	8		NT	-	
Infrastructure for Health, Education & Child Care		159	0		NT	-	
Infrastructure for Non Conventional energy electrification of villages		142	29		NT	82	
Other Infrastructures		334	32		NT	32	
<b>Administrative Support to the VDCs</b>							
Honorarium to the Village Volunteers and office bearers	No. of Village Volunteers delivering services effectively	249	249		358	249	
Cycle grant to the VDC	No. of VDCs functioning and managing their organization	109	113		358	249	
Studies and Consultancies under Livelihood Enhancement							

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

Studies & Technical Assistance on Livelihood Enhancement	No. of RNGOs supporting the project in Livelihood enhancement	NT			NT		
	No. of man/month worth of technical assistance provided						
	No. of studies prepared						
Mobility Support to the other facilitating govt./ non govt. agencies							
Mobility Support to the other facilitating govt./ non govt. agencies	No. of tours made by other govt./ resource agencies to the programme villages	NT			NT		
<b>Component 3 - Purpose: Support for Policy Initiatives</b>							
Landless beneficiaries given land rights			3585		NT	7171	
Purchase of GPS for land survey and settlement	No of GPS unts procured		0		NT		
	No. of ha of land surveyed						
Facilitation support for settlement units	No. of Units		0		30	-	
Land alienation/ restoration cases settled	No. of MWS provided with equipments	1000	0		NT	-	
	No. of cases settled						
Mobile squads/ Camp and Facilitation for settlement of land alienation cases under OPLE, OGLS and Tribal Forest Right	No. of mobile squads operating	250	0		358	-	
	No. of landless households provided with land rights/titles						
Legal Defense Fund		7	0		7	-	
<b>Component 4 - Purpose: Development Initiative Fund</b>							
Investment on DIF							
Supplementary funding to other components		29	57		NT	-	

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
 Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

Experimenting and / or up-scaling innovative activities for livelihood		268	98		NT	-	
Promotion of low cost time and labour saving technologies for reduction of drudgery		5962	3321		NT	-	
Support to Vulnerable and Destitute Households		8423	480		NT	-	
<b>Component 5 - Purpose: Programme Management</b>							
Salary of OTELP Staff		TBM			TBM		
Office Running Cost		TBM			TBM		
Furniture, Computers and Equipments		TBM			TBM		
Meetings, Reviews, Workshops, M&E		TBM			TBM		
<b>Component 6 - Purpose: Food Handling</b>							
Food distribution & storage	No. of households receiving food					-	
Food distribution and storage	No. of VDCs effectively managing the food distribution	NT			NT	-	

## Appendix 6: RIMS Tables

### Annual Project Results and Impact Report

Country: India  
Project: Orissa Tribal Empowerment and Livelihoods Programme

Report Date: 31st March 2009

Reporting Period: April 2008 - March 2009  
Calender Year Equiv: 2008  
Fiscal Year End: Mar-09

Anchor Indicator	Households with improvement in household assets ownership index	Unit	Indicator Level	Benchmark	Mid term	Completion	Target
	Prevalence of child malnutrition (boys/ girls)	number	Impact				37500
	Weight for age		Impact				
	Height for age		Impact				
	Weight for height		Impact				

Component	Indicator	Unit	Indicator Level	AWPB Target	Actual	% of AWPB	Appraisal Target	Cumulative Actual	% of Appraisal
Total Project	Persons receiving project services (direct, total project, m/f)								
	(men)	number	1st	40279	34766	86.31	37500	81271	216.72
	(women)	number	1st	42590	35410	83.14	37500	82720	220.59
	Households that have improved food security		2nd	20000	19195	95.98	75000	19195	25.59
Capacity Building for Empowerment	Persons trained, by gender and sector								
	(self-help group (SHG) members - men)	number	1st	6000	4423	73.72	n/a	4423	
	(SHG members - women)	number	1st	25000	22602	90.41	n/a	22602	
	Interest groups formed by type								
	(SHGs)	number	1st	1650	919	55.70	2160	2316	107.22
	(VDCs)	number	1st	110	109	99.09	340	245	72.06

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
 Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

	(User Groups)	number	1ar	5000	3009	60.18	n/a	5990	
	People belonging to groups, by type of group								
	(SHGs)	number	1st	n/a	14629	#VALUE!	n/a	27773	n/a
	Groups operational/ functional, by type								
	(SHGs)	number	2nd	2000	1617	80.85	2160	1617	74.86
	(VDCs)	number	2nd	136	136	100.00	340	136	40.00
Livelihood Enhancement	Land and Water Management & Production System Enhancement								
	Persons trained, by gender and sector								
	(land and water management - men)	number	1st	n/a	9393	#VALUE!	540	13613	2520.93
	(land and water management - women)	number	1st	n/a	7047	#VALUE!	540	9050	1675.93
	(participatory forest management - men)	number	1st	n/a	6096	#VALUE!	720	8129	1129.03
	(participatory forest management - women)	number	1st	n/a	3674	#VALUE!	720	4874	676.94
	(crop production - men)	number	1st	n/a	8072	#VALUE!	2700	13308	492.89
	(crop production - women)	number	1st	n/a	6750	#VALUE!	2700	10357	383.59
	(livestock and aquaculture production - men)	number	1st	n/a	1946	#VALUE!	2700	2947	109.15
	(livestock and aquaculture production - women)	number	1st	n/a	2273	#VALUE!	2700	3243	120.11
	Common property resources (area under improved management practices)	ha	2nd	n/a	1675	#VALUE!	n/a	8558.4	#VALUE!
	(participatory forest management)			9600	10064	104.83333	27200	13472	49.53
	Farmers adopting technology recommended by project								
	(land & water management - irrigated crop production/ yield increases)	number	2nd	8220	4058	49.37	1080	16215	1501.39
	(forest production/ yield increases)	number	2nd	4985	3912	78.48	1440	3912	271.67
	(crop production/ yield increases)	number	2nd	7411	2402	32.41	5400	2795	51.76
	(livestock and aquaculture production/ yield increases)	number	2nd	2109.5	1095	51.91	5400		
	Farmers reporting production/ yield increases					#DIV/0!			
	(land & water management - irrigated crop production/ yield increases)	number	2nd	2029	850	41.89	1080		
	(forest production/ yield increases)	number	2nd	1956	2536	129.65	1440		
	(crop production/ yield increases)	number	2nd	1201	472	39.30	5400		
	(livestock and aquaculture production/ yield increases)	number	2nd	548	308	56.26	5400		
	Rural Micro-finance					#DIV/0!			

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
 Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

	Intersect groups formed by type					#DIV/0!			
	(small financial SHGs - up to 10 members)	number	1st	0	228	#DIV/0!	n/a	228	
	(large financial SHGs - upto 20 members)	number	1st	1397	691	49.46	n/a	2088	#VALUE!
	Active savers (disaggregated by gender)					#DIV/0!			
	(men)	number	1st	n/a	1076	#VALUE!	n/a	1076	#VALUE!
	(women)	number	1st	n/a	17345	#VALUE!	n/a	17345	#VALUE!
	Value of savings mobilized/a	USD	1st	n/a	126360.3	#VALUE!	n/a	387420	#VALUE!
	Active borrowers (disaggregated by gender)					#DIV/0!			
	(men)	number	1st	n/a	710	#VALUE!		710	#DIV/0!
	(women)	number	1st	n/a	6469	#VALUE!		6469	#DIV/0!
	Value of gross loan portfolio (loans outstanding - loans written off)/a	USD	1st	n/a	199119.8	#VALUE!	n/a	199119.8	#VALUE!
	Community Infrastructure				0	#DIV/0!			
	Schools/ clinics built/ rehabilitated	number	1st	n/a	1276	#VALUE!	n/a	1276	#VALUE!
	Wells drilled/ dug for drinking water	number	1st	n/a	54	#VALUE!	n/a	455	#VALUE!
	Roads constructed/ rehabilitated	km	1st	n/a	0	#VALUE!	n/a	0	#VALUE!
	Community projects functional, by type	number	2nd	n/a	659	#VALUE!	n/a	1696	#VALUE!
Institutional Support	% disbursement of IFAD loan	SDR	1st						

SECOND LEVEL RESULTS		
Component	Results	Rating
<b>Natural Resources (land and water)</b>	Likelihood of sustainability of groups managing infrastructure formed/strengthened	4
	Effectiveness of productive infrastructure - Irrigation schemes	5
	Likelihood of sustainability of productive infrastructure - Irrigation schemes	4
	Likelihood of sustainability of natural resources management groups formed/strengthened	4
	Effectiveness of natural resources management and conservation programmes	5
<b>Agricultural technologies and production</b>	Effectiveness: improved performance of service providers	4
	Effectiveness: improved agricultural, livestock and fishery production	4
<b>Rural Financial Services</b>	Likelihood of sustainability of saving and credit groups formed/strengthened	5
	Effectiveness: improved access of the poor to financial services	4

	Sustainability: improved performance of financial institutions	4
<b>Market</b>	Effectiveness: producers benefiting from improved access to markets	5
	Likelihood of sustainability of roads constructed/rehabilitated	
	Likelihood of sustainability of marketing facilities	5
	Likelihood of sustainability of storage facilities	5
	Likelihood of sustainability of procesing facilities	5
	Likelihood of sustainability of the marketing groups formed/strengthened	5
<b>Enterprise Development and employment</b>	Effectiveness: creation of employment opportunities	4
	Likelihood of sustainability of enterprises	4
<b>Policy and community programming</b>	Effectiveness: promotion of pro-poor policies and institutions	4
	Effectiveness: community development	5
	Likelihood of sustainability of community groups formed/strengthened	5
	Likelihood of sustainability of apex organisations formed/strengthened	4
<b>Social Infrastructure</b>	Effectiveness of social infrastructure - Drinking water systems	5
	Effectiveness of social infrastructure - Other	5
	Likelihood of sustainability of social infrastructure - Drinking water system	5
	Likelihood of sustainability of social infrastructure - Other	5

## Appendix 7: Knowledge management, Learning and Innovation

### Learning: What has worked particularly well in this project during this period? What have been the reasons for this?

---

#### **Solar Electrification:**

Solar Electrification initiatives taken up in Tingnaput (Narayanpatna Block, Koraput district) with the barefoot solar tribal women engineers, who were trained on assembling of solar panels, maintenance and basic engineering aspects of solar home light systems at NIRD, Hyderabad for 5 and half months has what is barefoot engineers gained momentum. All the adults of Tingnaput village have been oriented by the bare foot solar engineers on proper use and day to day maintenance of the solar home lights. Eight volunteers have been thoroughly trained from different watersheds. People from nearby villages and school exposed to the Solar Unit and placed order for 3000 solar lanterns for immediate supply. Recently 100 lanterns have been assembled and supplied. Now the trained volunteers are also helping the solar Engineers to assemble the solar lantern and meet the supply for increasing demand from different level. This unit became a viable livelihood model for the solar engineers and the trained volunteers as well.

The presence of barefoot (village or community level) solar engineers made it possible to sensitise the entire community on proper use and due maintenance of solar lights both home light and street light as well. Availability of tribal women barefoot solar engineers is boosts for the community take forward the initiatives in larger scale.

#### **Collective Marketing:**

The concept of Collective marketing has been well grounded in all the programme villages, particularly in Phase I programme villages. The traditional process of marketing of various forest and agriculture produces in volume to the local traders has been changed to marketing through collectivisation of produces, attending the economy of scale and selling the produces to the traders who ensure better price. What is collective marketing? Villagers have been capacitated for collection and marketing of the surplus produces through proper weighing system and with first level value addition. More than 32 products such as Niger, Custard, Cashew, Turmeric, Jack fruit, Cowpea, Arher, Drum stick, Hill Broom, Karanja, Mahua, Ambula, Mango Jelly, Ragi, Suan, Maize, beans etc. have been covered under collective marketing covering 315 villages. The total turnover augmented through the Collective Marketing is about Rs. 3.45 Crores, where the total incremental benefit comes to Rs. 30.00 Lakhs. What is the per household increase incomes by collective marketing? This process not only ensured realisation of better price but also empowered the community with enhanced confidence with desired negotiation skill for marketing. Establishment of weighing system at the community level helped the tribals from cheating in weight and the process of barter system. Though the per household annual income under this initiative raised ranging from Rs. 300/- to Rs. 500/- but a system has established, where villagers have started marketing through a collectivisation process.

Recently web based Production and Market Information System (PMIS) for product mapping has been developed with the support of MART, which will be linked to OTELP site shortly. This would enable both the villagers to get information on availability of traders, price, location etc. Similarly, the traders will able to know the quantity of products available, time of harvesting, cluster hub, contact person. This initiative has been appreciated by other marketing agencies in Orissa.

#### **Standardised Capacity Building Framework**

Programme Support Unit in consultation with the ITDA and FNGO has developed a framework for Capacity Building activities. This framework is need based and flexible in nature. However, a suggestive capacity building input details under different components

---

and sub components under Capacity Building for different phases of programme implementation has been indicated. This initiatives has been appreciated at ITDA and F.NGO level as, this framework helped them to workout the annual capacity building calendar for the year 2009-10. What is the savings in terms time and money, as also the increase in effectiveness of the training through improved quality of contents of training. What is standardised CB framework? This framework has been useful in structuring the contents of the trainings as per requirement resulting the effectiveness of the training programme in systematic approach. Structuring approach helped the programme to curtail the training numbers drastically without compromising the quality aspects.

### **Participatory Process Monitoring**

Participatory Process Monitoring has been institutionalised in the programme which to be conducted on a half yearly basis on a campaign mode. Villagers not only raise discussion on the quality aspects of the interventions, they also speak on timely maintenance and continuity of the participatory process for sustainable growth. The acceptance of Participatory Process Monitoring among the community is good.

The process of Participatory Monitoring by the villagers not only enhanced the level of transparency at the community level, it also empowered them to own the programme.

### **Orientation of staff on Gender Mainstreaming:**

All staffs from PSU, ITDA and F.NGOs have been oriented on Gender Mainstreaming with the facilitation support of Gender Consultant, PRIA, New Delhi. State Coordinator and District Coordinators have been positioned at the project level, who facilitates not only training programme but also support in mainstreaming gender in the programme perspectives. Efforts have been initiated to ensure quality participation of women in group interaction, ensuring positioning of women in senior/ management position etc.

Orientation on gender mainstreaming to the facilitative staff from PSU, ITDA and F.NGO helped to focus on the issues relating to equity, gender disparity, violence against women, addressing the widow and women headed households.

### **Forest Right Act.**

Project facilitated the government and community in formation of Forest Right Committees at the panchayat level. Adequate sensitization and advocacy campaigns have been organised at the village level to ensure mobilisation of applications from the entitled beneficiaries. More than 80% villages have been forwarded to sub divisional level committee for verification and conferment of land in the name of tribals. Supply of hand GPS to government also expedited the process of conferment of land rights to the beneficiaries.

Series of sensitization programme at the community level by the staff of OTELP facilitated the forest right committees to articulate the roles and responsibilities of the committee and in mobilising the applications from the entitled households. Follow up from project also motivated the entitled households to put forth their applications to the committees on time.

### **Veterinary Volunteer**

The concept of establishing volunteers for SHGs, Marketing, Livestock management, health etc. in the programme villages is doing extremely well. Functioning of livestock volunteers in the communities is out standing. They work as savvier at the community level to ensure timely support to avert high mortality of the livestock in the absence / limited presence of veterinary extension officials in the programme villages. They also play an interface role between the community and service providers for timely vaccination, breed up gradation and timely arrival of medicine at the community level. Shift from voluntary mode of services to incentive mode of services has begun. Each

---

volunteer has started earning Rs. 350 to Rs. 700 on their part time involvement as para-vet at the community level.

Timely and comprehensive training to the volunteers really worked well to articulate the basic functioning of the para-vets. Linkage with the line department helped for timely supply of vaccine and other medicines for the benefit of community at large. Besides, the incentive mode of service delivery contributed to the great extent to ensure the effective functioning of the volunteers trained.

---

#### **Learning: What has not worked so well? What have been the reasons?**

---

1. Lots of innovations have been resulted in success in the programme villages but yet to up-scale. Cultivation of paddy through SRI methods, Sun flower cultivation, tissue culture banana, bakery unit, secondary level institute for collective marketing (ABC) have been yield good result but yet to upscale. Strategic approach is to be adopted for replication of the success and good lessons across the programme villages.
  2. The positioning of the Financial Support Assistant (FSA) through DFID TA with the FNGO has not achieved the desired result of capacitating financial management and record keeping with the VDCs and FNGOs. There is a high turn over among the FSAs and their qualification and having a low capacity in managing the TA.
- 

#### **Innovation: Describe any interesting innovation noted during supervision**

---

The project team at ITDA, Th. Rampur, Kalahandi district, particularly the Watershed Development Officer have designed a Land Capability Classification (LCC) wheel and an intervention wheel and used the same as a tool to orient the people of the village in identifying their land capability class and selecting the most appropriate intervention to treat the land along with the suitable livelihoods activity. This has been piloted in phase II villages of the district by the FNGOs and have resulted a good impact on the understanding of the Integrated Natural Resource Management aspects and its application for productivity enhancement by the community.

---

#### **Innovation: How might this be replicated by others, or upscaled here?**

---

The programme shall adopt the above model (LCC Wheel) and provide some professional inputs in fine tuning the tool for further ease of application. The same may be provided to all the Agriculture Resource Centres (ARC) promoted by the programme with hands on training on its usage. This would be a very interesting learning material for the communities who are depending upon the natural resources of the village in earning their livelihoods. Selecting an inappropriate intervention for natural resources have negative implications in the environment where as the tool can address this issue increasing the possibilities of selecting appropriate NRM interventions.

---

## Appendix 8: Audit Log

### 1. Summary Audit Table

Financial Year	Audit Observations as per Audit Report		Audit Observations Settled		Audit Observations Outstanding	
	Number s	Value (BDT)	Number s	Value (BDT)	Number s	Value (BDT)
2006-2007	53	16918834	53	16918834	0	0
2007-2008	27	251024020	27	251024020	0	0
<b>Total :</b>	<b>80</b>	<b>267942854</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>267942854</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

### 2. Detailed Audit Table

Compliance to Management Letter from JBMT Associates for the financial year 2007-08*					
PSU					
Sl.No.	Observation by Auditor	Total Amount involved (INR)	Action taken by the Project	Status of Audit Observations (Settled/Pending)	Remark
1	Vouching:	-	From the financial year 2007-08 the vouchers are prepared in printed format and the signature of programme Director are being obtained in the concerning vouchers. The advance register has maintained regularly along with the Signature of concerned Staff.	Setteled	
2	Delay has been made in diposit of TDS		Except the TDS amount observed by the auditor in all other cases the deposit of TDS are being made within the due date & further we will be careful in future on this aspect.	Setteled	
3	A- During Verification of different advances it is found that fresh advances have been given without adjusting outstanding advance.	45,068.00	The advance of Rs.35,802/- against the following staff which observed by the auditor settled	Setteled	
	B-Festival Advances against G.B.Routray & Srinivas Mohapatra are Unadjusted since long	5,700.00	A letter has been issued to concerned staff regarding their festival advance during the special audit of OTELP to refund the advance amount.	Setteled	
4	Utilization of Rs. 29,03,780/- only has been made against the advance of Rs. 2.5 Crore given to TDCC on 04.12.2007 on account of Food Handling. Since the amount is very huge necessary steps should be taken for recovery of the advance or obtaining UC at the earliest. The amount should have not been released if immediate	250,000,000.00	In regards to advance to TDCC on food handling a agreement was made where it is mentioned that TDCC Ltd will submitted the utilization certificate along with the copies of supporting document/vouchers/bills on a quarterly basis. This was approved by Commissioner-cum-Secretary to Govt. ST & SC Development Department.	Setteled	

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

	expenses of such huge amount was not required.				
<b>Koraput</b>					
<b>Commen Observatioin</b>					
1	Internal Audit of the accounts need to be strengthened		Internal Audit of the accounts has been done from financial yaer 2008-09 by quarterly	Settled	
2	TDS has not been deducted from Hire Charges of Vehicle		Now TDS from hiring charges of vehicle has deducted after getting TAN number	Settled	
3	It is observed that there is no periodical verification of accounts of FNGO by ITDA Staff		From financial Year 2008-09 quarterly internal Audit has been done.	Settled	
4	Interest received from Bank in Savings Bank Accounts by VDC's & FNGO against Balance of Grant-in-Aid has not been accounted for at project level.		Noted		
5	We have verified accounts of VDC's on test check basis & observed that only cash books are maintained by VDC's but no General Ledger. For particular work, Work Register/files are maintained. So it is difficult to compile accounts at VDC level. No periodical checking of accounts has been done by project office. There is no system to have control over of accounts at VDC Level. However, the account has been prepared on the basis of Monthly Progress Report submitted by VDCs & FNGO's.		Noted		
<b>Special Observation</b>					
1	Under Food Handling expenses Rs. 88,406/- has been paid by the forest officer to M/s Jeypore Truck Owners Association from 16/11/2007 to 19/11/2007 without deducting TDS from the party. Moreover the same amount has been paid by cash in lump sum instead of by account payee cheque		Noted for future	Settled	
2	It is observed that CYSD, Laxmipur has made some expenditure deviating approved budget i.e. or office running cost FNGO has incurred Rs. 70,299/- against budget of Rs. 36,000/- excess amount being Rs.34,299/- in case of some community mobilizer & WDT, actual monthly payment has been made less than the		This office has already intimated to FNGO- Representative, CYSD, Laxmipur vide letter no. 1096/II-1/08 dt 27/09/08. This will be complied after receipt the same from CYSD, Laxmipur.		

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

	budgeted amount.				
<b><u>Paralakhemundi</u></b>					
<b>Commen Observatioin</b>					
1	Internal Audit of the accounts need to be strengthened		Internal Audit of the accounts has beenstrengthened	Settled	
2	Journal Vochers are not maintained in the printed format		Now maintained	Settled	
3	TDS has not been deducted from Hire Charges of Vehicle		Now TDS from hiring charges of vehicle has deducted after getting TAN number	Settled	
4	It is observed that there is no periodical verification of accounts of FNGO by ITDA Staff		From financial Year 2008-09 quarterly internal Audit has been done.	Settled	
5	Interest received from Bank in Savings Bank Accounts by VDC's & FNGO against Balance of Grant-in-Aid has not been accounted for at project level.		Noted		
6	We have verified accounts of VDC's on test check basis & observed that only cash books are maintained by VDC's but no General Ledger. For particular work, Work Register/files are maintained. So it is difficult to compile accounts at VDC level. No periodical checking of accounts has been done by project office. There is no system to have control over of accounts at VDC Level. However, the account has been prepared on the basis of Monthly Progress Report submitted by VDCs & FNGO's.		Noted		
<b>Special Observation</b>					
1	Under capacity building Rs.21,200/- has been paid by cash by Mr. D. Jena to DIGI World for two Nos. of Sony DVU Memory card and printing of Ajanultar. Money receipt for the payment couldnot be available and also stock entry has not been made for the material.		The amount of Rs.21200/- paid to DIGI World for two numbers of Sony DVU memory card and printing of Ajanultar by Sri D. Jena for which money receipt was collected later date. However in the mean while the money receipt has been collected and stock entry also has been made for the materials purchased	Settled	
<b><u>ITDA TH.RAMPUR</u></b>					
<b>Commen Observatioin</b>					
1	Internal Audit of the accounts need to be strengthened		Already action in this respect initiated	Settled	
2	Payment Vouchers (Cash/Bank) Credit Vouchers are maintained in printed format except in ITDA Th. Rampur.		Already started from FY 2008-09 onwards	Settled	

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

3	TDS has not been deducted from Hire Charges of Vehicle		Already started from FY 2008-09 onwards	Settled	
4	Interest received from Bank in Savings Bank Accounts by VDC's & FNGO against Balance of Grant-in-Aid has not been accounted for at project level.		Noted for future action	Settled	
5	We have verified accounts of VDC's on test check basis & observed that only cash books are maintained by VDC's but no General Ledger. For particular work, Work Register/files are maintained. So it is difficult to compile accounts at VDC level. No periodical checking of accounts has been done by project office. There is no system to have control over of accounts at VDC Level. However, the account has been prepared on the basis of Monthly Progress Report submitted by VDCs & FNGO's.		Noted for future action	Settled	
<b>Special Observation</b>					
1	Ref. Vr. No.- 331/12.10.2007. It is observed that payment made to Vidya Printer towards printing of SHG Register, Pass Book & Voucher at VDC level. But after issued to VDC there is an excess of stock SHG Book -19 nos., Pass Book-182 nos. at ITDA level. There is unnecessary blockage of funds	Rs. 1,61,990/-	The present stock will be utilised during the financial year 2008-09. Even we require more registers and pass book due to formation of new SHG groups	Settled	
2	Advances given to officials for expenses are not being adjusted regularly. Advances have been paid without settlement of previous advances.		Noted for future action	Settled	
3	Income of VDC towards sale of Supplants		We are developing a format to this type of miscellaneous income. Because in MPR there is no scope to show the same.	Settled	
4	Submission of Receipt & Payment account & BRS with MPR by VDCs		Arranging training for VDCs to ensure the same.	Settled	
<b><u>Otelp Baliguda</u></b>					
<b>Common Observation</b>					
1	Internal Audit of the accounts need to be strengthened		Already action in this respect initiated	Settled	
2	Journal Vouchers are not maintained in the printed format		Already started from FY 2008-09 onwards	Settled	
3	TDS has not been deducted from Hire Charges of Vehicle		Already started from FY 2008-09 onwards	Settled	
4	It is observed that there is no periodical verification of accounts of FNGO by ITDA Staff		Noted for future action	Settled	
5	Interest received from Bank in Savings Bank Accounts by VDC's & FNGO against Balance of Grant-in-Aid has not been accounted for at project level.		Noted for future action	Settled	

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

6	We have verified accounts of VDC's on test check basis & observed that only cash books are maintained by VDC's but no General Ledger. For particular work, Work Register/files are maintained. So it is difficult to compile accounts at VDC level. No periodical checking of accounts has been done by project office. There is no system to have control over of accounts at VDC Level. However, the account has been prepared on the basis of Monthly Progress Report submitted by VDCs & FNGO's.			Noted for future action	Settled
<b>Special Observation</b>					
1	Regarding the audit objection as regard to UC not obtain from FNGO and periodic verification of FNGO accounts not done during the year 2006-2007, the unit has sent the UCs to PSU and has complied the audit objection.			Noted for future action	Settled
2	Advances given to officials for expenses are not being adjusted regularly. Advances have been paid without settlement of previous advances.			Noted for future action	Settled
3	There is no separate cash book maintained by FNGO Pradan for OTELP fund.			PRADAN has been maintaing a general cash book for all the projects operating at Balliguda. During 2007-08, necessary bifurcation is avlaible for OTELP , PRADAN is maintaining a separate Bank Account and payments through cheques. As such separate banker ledger is recording all OTELP transactions and PRADAN has submitted audited statements separately for OTELP scheme.	Settled
4	It is observed that the expenses incurred by FNGO Pradan towards exposure meeting held on different date. But pamphlets printed at view point at Bhubaneswar towards all exposure meeting on particular date. Moreover bill provided by the party without mentioning the bill nos.	3,360.00		Bulk purchases have been made for training materials as per market rate with in the unit cost approved by ITDA. However, since the amount purchasc is very low, i.e. Rs.9600/-, no quotations have been invited. Steps have been taken to observe cash memo nos.	Settled
5	It is observed that the expenses incurred by FNGO Swadeshi towards purchase of training materials amounting of Rs. 9,600/- @Rs. 4,800/- for each voucher. Without mentioning cash memo nos. Splitting of bill inorder to avoid purchase procedure	9,600.00		Bulk purchases have been made for training materials as per market rate with in the unit cost approved by ITDA. However, since the amount purchasc is very low, i.e. Rs.960000 no quotations have been invited. Steps have been taken to observe cash memo nos. while purchasing materials and booking of trainintg wisc materials purchased during 2008-09.	Settled

6	On checking of the above vouchers it is noticed that payment made amounting of Rs. 15,000/- to Chandrakanta Kahnar (C.M.) towards purchase of meals for participants attending on exposure meeting. It is highly irregular as the staff has been directly enveloped in this case.	15,000.00	Since Chandra Kanta Konhar C.M. Swedesi FNGO was entrusted with the exposure visit of SHGs, he has certified the payment of meals purchased for the participants at the time of exposure amounting to Rs.15000/-	Settled	
7	On checking of the MPR we observed that the collection made upto 31 <sup>st</sup> March' 2008 towards VDF account has not been fully deposited	945,292.20	The amount of deposit of VDF accounts have not been updated by VDC secretaries. Help of FSA has been taken for updation of VDC accounts.	Settled	

\*The present information is for the period 2007-2008 for which all due processes had been completed and reports available. The audit report for the year 2008-09 has been completed in September 2009 but responses on the audit observations are awaited from the field units (ITDA) and therefore not included in the present audit log. On receipt of the same the log will be submitted to IFAD.

### Appendix 9: Supervision Mission Schedule

Date	Villages visited		Block	District	Remarks / Major Tribes
	Phase I	Phase II			
02.11.09	Arrival of team members at Bhubaneswar				
03.11.09	Presentation by OTELP and interactions with key partners of OTELP				
	JRM team divided into 3 teams and travel of team members by train to respective destinations (evening).				
04.11.09	Arrival of team members to respective destinations (morning)				
Presentation by ITDA Koraput & partner NGOs for Team 1 at Koraput					
		Gullel	Semiliguda	Koraput	Kandha, Gadaba
		Challanput	Semiliguda	Koraput	Gadaba
Presentation by ITDA Balliguda & partner NGOs for Team 2 at Balliguda					
		Palami	Baliguda	Kandhamal	Kandha
Presentation by ITDA Th. Rampur & partner NGOs for Team 3 at Bhawanipatna					
		Chachikana	Th. Rampur	Kalahandi	Kandha
		Udiguna	Th. Rampur	Kalahandi	Kandha
05.11.09		Phatu	Pottangi	Koraput	Kandha
		Bedaguda	Pottangi	Koraput	Kandha
		Khamara	Nandapur	Koraput	Paraja
		Masuri	Nandapur	Koraput	Paraja, Kandha
		Pustiguda	Th. Rampur	Kalahandi	Kandha
		Jatangpada	Th. Rampur	Kalahandi	Kandha
		Mundumaha	Daringbadi	Kandhamal	Kandha
		Gunjigaon	K. Nuagaon	Kandhamal	Kandha
06.11.09	Ledriguda		Laxmipur	Koraput	Kandha
	Biriguda		Laxmipur	Koraput	Kandha
		Parjapuki	Dasmantpur	Koraput	Kandha
		Padeiput	Dasmantpur	Koraput	Kandha
		Sorisbondel	Th. Rampur	Kalahandi	Kandha
	Surguguda		Kotogarh	Kandhamal	Kandha
	Tuaguda		Kotogarh	Kandhamal	Kandha
07.11.09	Leding		Bandhugaon	Koraput	Interaction at Koraput
	Kupakhal		Bandhugaon	Koraput	Interaction at Koraput
	Pipalpadar		Narayanpatna	Koraput	Interaction at Koraput
	Pilibori		Narayanpatna	Koraput	Interaction at Koraput
		Punjam	Lanjigarh	Kalahandi	Kandha
		Sindhibhata	Lanjigarh	Kalahandi	Kandha
	Tidipada		Tumudibandh	Kandhamal	Kutia Kandha (PTG)
	Dangarpada		Tumudibandh	Kandhamal	Kandha
08.11.09	Presentation by ITDA Malkangiri & partner NGOs for Team 1 at Malkangiri; interaction with Collector, Malkangiri.				
		Chitapari	K. Guma	Malkangiri	Holva, Bhumia, Paraja
Presentation by ITDA Gunupur, Rayagada & partner NGOs and DPMC members for Team 2					
		Kenduguda	Gudari	Rayagada	Kandha
Presentation by ITDA Parlekamundi & partner NGOs for Team 3					
	Tumalo		Guma	Gajapati	Saora
09.11.09		Dhakadrasi	Mathili	Malkangiri	Kaya, Bhumia, Holva
		Amlabhata	Khairput	Malkangiri	Kandha, Gadaba, Paraja & Bonda
	Konkoroda		Nuagada	Gajapati	Saora

Orissa Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Programme  
Joint Review Mission: November 2-17, 2009: *Main Report*

		Gangapur	R. Udaigiri	Gajapati	Saora
		Kaneda	Bissamcutak	Rayagada	Kandha
		Asadha	Muniguda	Rayagada	Kandha
10.11.09	Presentation by ITDA Nawarangpur & partner NGOs for Team 1 at Nabarangpur				
		Ekori	Papadahandi	Nabarangpur	Bhatra
		Sirisi	Papadahandi	Nabarangpur	Bhatra
		Barguda	Kasagumuda	Nabarangpur	Bhatra
	Nidhigudi		Nuagada	Gajapati	Saora, Lanjia Saora (PTG)
		Kutudukupa	Chandrapur	Rayagada	Kandha
		Chetanpur	Chandrapur	Rayagada	Kandha
11.11.09		Chindiguda	Jharigaon	Nabarangpur	Bhatra
		Tarabeda	Jharigaon	Nabarangpur	Bhatra
		Gumiguda	Mohuna	Gajapati	Saora
		Kantamal	Kashipur	Rayagada	Kandha
12.11.09	Convergence of all the Team members at Bhubaneswar				
13.11.09	Stakeholders meeting				
14.11.09	Report writing				
15.11.09	Report writing				
16.11.09	De-briefing with OTELP in the morning; wrap-up meeting with Govt of Orissa (Odisha) in the late evening.				
17.11.09	Further debriefing with OTELP; departure of team members				

## Community & Rural Institution Development

*Deep Joshi*

1. The project aims at empowering tribal people by organising them into sustainable CBOs; linking them to mainstream institutions like government agencies, banks and fair markets; providing land to the landless under existing laws and schemes; sustainably enhancing the productivity of available natural resources; creating additional livelihoods for households without adequate land; and fostering a favourable policy environment. Progress has been made in each of these since the previous JRM and particularly noteworthy is the progress made in settling land in favour of the landless. The quantum of land so settled, however, remains modest, and in most cases inadequate to support a family. At least in one of the districts, namely Kandhamal, the process of recording rights has not been taken up in Reserve Forest areas. There are similarly instances where rights of farmers not residing within the boundaries of a village (but living in adjoining villages) have not been recorded. Once the present momentum peters out recording of rights will fall by the way side. ***The Mission recommends a review of land ownership and all the left-over issues pertaining to the settlement once the current process of land distribution and recording of rights is completed.***

2. Land productivity depends *inter alia* on soil moisture through the year since crops can be grown only as long as there is moisture in the root zone. Since widespread irrigation is not feasible in the project area and rainfall, though high, occurs mainly during the three monsoon months, reducing rainwater runoff from every inch of land through *in-situ* measures is the key to enhancing the moisture regime across the terrain. *In-situ* harvesting of rainwater extends soil moisture beyond the rainy season and makes production of useful bio-mass feasible. This is not being paid adequate attention. As in classical watershed programmes of earlier years, the focus is on discrete structures to reduce harmful effects of rainwater runoff, harvest runoff and utilise water from springs and streams. *In-situ* harvesting of rainwater needs to be systematically incorporated in village level planning processes so that there is less or no runoff at all points in the watershed and the local soil moisture regime improves. It goes without saying that the best watershed development strategies are those that minimise runoff in the first place rather than those that harvest and store it and dispose it off safely. This can also lead to enhanced productivity of all the elements, especially soil, water and sunshine, regenerate the soils and local micro-ecology and enhance the carrying capacity of the landscape. Most personnel working in the field, whether in NGOs or at the ITDA have limited exposure to this emerging perspective in the management of rain-fed areas through integrated natural resource management strategies. The planning process in villages is generally led by people engaged in farming and they would naturally clamour for irrigation and measures to protect their land from heavy runoff. Given the limited finances in the project, opportunities for irrigation and safe disposal of runoff, both very capital intensive, would be taken up first; other interventions, especially those focusing on increasing rainwater infiltration across the terrain, thereby minimising runoff, ensuring retention of soil moisture for longer periods after the rains, reviving perennial springs and stream-flows, rejuvenating soils through microbial action due to the presence of moisture in soils and enhancing the productivity and carrying capacity of the entire landscape would be left out. Bringing about such a perspective is a key challenge before the project, as well as a great opportunity since abundant finances are now available through schemes like NREGS and BRGF which seek such investment opportunities. ***The Mission recommends bringing on board, through sustained expert inputs and exposure, the latest perspective, knowledge and know-how on integrated natural resource management strategies to foster economic growth with ecological security.***

3. The project has taken up a few activities in agriculture, such as SRI and various activities in collaboration with ICRISAT. A coherent and across-the-board agriculture productivity enhancement programme does not, however, exist. Even without/before making capital investments, there is much room for enhancing the productivity of crops farmers already grow. In fact, new crops like groundnut, being introduced by the project may not be the most suited interventions for communities unfamiliar with the ways of the market where they have traditionally been exploited. A variety of low input-intensive and low production cost cereals such as millets, oilseeds like sesame and mustard and pulses like black gram, various beans and lentils could be introduced. There is also scope/need for seed treatment/selection/replacement. Homestead development has a huge potential. Focused attention is needed on enhancing productivity of various farming systems, especially agriculture and livestock rearing. ***This needs to be incorporated in the annual planning process at all levels in the project.***

4. There is limited opportunity for non-farm enterprises and skill based employment in the project area as the economy is largely agrarian and subsistence-oriented. There are, however, opportunities in rearing small ruminants, especially goats, as sources of livelihoods for the landless and need to be developed systematically as enterprises. Processing of farm and forest produce is another, though more modest, livelihood source that can be developed. Various Terminalia tree species, especially Terminalia tomentosa seem to grow naturally in the forests in this region. Rearing of tasar silk worms is a potential new activity that may be taken up.

#### **CBOs & Capacity Building**

5. The project has so far formed 349 VDCs, 846 VLSCs and 777 Village Level Financial and Social Audit Sub-Committees across the project villages; 248 VDCs have been registered and are eligible to receive project funds. The project has promoted or adopted 3,732 SHGs, mostly of women, and 6,789 Users' Groups. ***In some cases there have been reports about delays in the registration of VDCs (as Societies under the 1860 Act) as the BDO has to certify the bona fide and certify that there is no other Society bearing the same name.***

6. The Mission witnessed high level of excitement among the people it met in villages. Regular government presence being thin in these remote villages, many said this was the first time they had experienced the government as a development agency. A few among the CBOs were articulate and knowledgeable about the project even as there were many who stayed in the background.

7. As the CBOs have to carry out project-related tasks and report to the project and the WDT members are mostly not conversant with the local dialects, there is a tendency to promote the literate as community mobilisers, leaders and volunteers. Interaction with the community then occurs through these people. This can unwittingly create gate-keepers, introduce differentiation in hitherto relatively homogenous communities, inhibit transparency and eventually hurt the sustainability of the CBOs beyond the project phase. ***In this respect the recommendation of the previous JRM about introduction of rotational leadership remains relevant and needs to be pursued and continually monitored. Simultaneously, training needs to be imparted on issues of democratic governance in CBOs and inclusion of the most marginal and least vocal.***

8. Extremely low levels of literacy, especially among women, in the project villages inhibits proper record keeping and may affect transparency with regard to financial transactions. ***While some progress has been made in implementing the recommendation of the previous JRM, much more needs to be done.***

9. The quality of WDT personnel is highly variable and generally poor. There are very few engineers and agriculture/veterinary science graduates among WDT members

and even otherwise among NGOs. The fixed composition of the WDT including the disciplines of engineering, agriculture, micro-finance, livestock, forestry and capacity building needs to be re-examined. In any case, the existing WDT personnel in most cases can hardly be called experts and lack diagnostic and design capability; they can at best promote known recipes/solutions. This is in good measure responsible for the lack of integrated resource management perspective pointed out earlier. Ideally, a team comprising of agriculture engineers, agriculture graduates and persons trained in Community Development would best serve the purpose. Of course, everyone working in villages must be able to engage sensitively and empathetically with poor people and such orientation can be brought about through training. ***The Mission recommends a review of this situation, especially in the Phase II areas.***

10. There is a large contingent of village level workers, seemingly as per the design. There is one Community Mobiliser (CM) at the level of a VDC who reports to the FNGO; there is a Secretary for each VDC who reports to the VDC; there are six (including one for marketing) Village Volunteers (VVs) for each VDC (one to three villages). These are local youth, with education levels varying from 8<sup>th</sup> standard to 12<sup>th</sup> standard. The CM gets paid Rs 2,000 a month, the Secretary Rs 750 a month and the VVs Rs 300 a month. While they variously serve as links between the WDT and the village community, their effectiveness as change makers and accountability to village communities is questionable. While VVs are from the same village, the CM generally is from another village and lives in one of the villages where s/he works; how some one can manage in Rs 2,000 a month remains a mystery (it perhaps reflects the level of unemployment and the value people assign to cash income). It seems the extension and community mobilisation work in villages ought to be done by the WDT members and other village functionaries/volunteer(s)/community resource person(s) should be chosen by the people, including the level and mode of payment of remuneration, if any, as and when the need arises. ***The Mission recommends a review of this arrangement pertaining to grassroots engagement, especially in Phase II areas.***

#### **Village Development & Livelihoods Plan (VDLP)**

11. Entry Point Activities have been completed in Phase II villages. VDLPs have been prepared in all 113 Phase II villages in the old districts and have been initiated in the new districts. While VDLPs are being made through participatory processes, the content largely is driven by a menu of concrete activities/interventions, such as diversion structures to create irrigation, water harvesting structures, structures to mitigate the harmful effects of rainwater runoff, etc. There is limited capacity in WDTs to guide village communities to develop comprehensive natural resource development and livelihood plans based on a diagnosis of the ground situation and people's vision/aspirations that would address the needs of all, including the rights of future generations. ***Several NGOs during the past couple of years were involved in assisting district administrations, including in Orissa, prepare perspective plans under BRGF. Since planning is an on-going exercise, the project might commission their services to build the capacity of WDTs in developing perspective plans.***

12. Though the VDLPs are supposed to be perspective plans for the villages/watersheds without regard to sources of funds and services, and while the needs are in some cases identified, concrete plans largely focus on what can be done within the framework of the resources available under the project. Since other government departments are not involved and they have their own procedures for allocation and implementation, it is not possible to incorporate resources and services potentially available from other departments. ***Instances of convergence are largely few and far between and reflect individual initiatives by government officials and FNGOs.*** We shall address the issue of convergence in a later section.

13. Project funds as per the AWPB are transferred to the account of the VDC (registered as a Society under the Societies Act 1860) operated by the President,

Secretary and Treasurer. While detailed accounts of the VDC are maintained by the Secretary, ***the very poor literacy in the project villages comes in the way of true transparency.***

### **Programme Management**

14. The eight member team at the ITDA is headed by the PO (PME) and includes seven Subject Matter Specialists (SMS) in Agriculture, Engineering, Micro Finance, Community Mobilisation, Forestry, MIS and Finance. It was envisaged that the team would provide thematic support to the WDTs and assist in bringing about convergence and networking with resources institutions. Presently much of the time of the team is spent in approving specific projects and reporting. The two broad areas of work of the team are project management, which has largely an inward focus, and providing thematic support to the WDT, which has a largely outward focus. While Finance and MIS primarily serve the first function, the others primarily serve the second function. There is a need to review the composition and the modus operandi of the team. ***Community Development and Organisation, Agriculture and Agriculture/Natural Resource Engineering are the key knowledge areas in this project and may be strengthened so that effective thematic support can be provided to WDTs. Further, the three knowledge streams must be able to work in an integrated way.***

15. A District Planning and Monitoring Committee (DPMC) chaired by the Collector has been created to facilitate coordination with other government agencies. It is supposed to meet once a quarter. It does not seem to be functioning uniformly across districts. In any case, there are several such committees in the district, all chaired by the Collector. ***A more effective problem solving mechanism would be quarterly review by the Collector with the PA (ITDA), the PO (PME) and all the SMSs so that coordination issues receive focused attention of the Collector who can initiate corrective action with the concerned agencies. A similar review at the block may be chaired by the PA (ITDA).***

16. The project has been using assistance from experts in a variety of fields. Using external expert inputs, especially in process-oriented themes with on-going relevance, such as gender mainstreaming, requires in-house capacity to direct and absorb such inputs. It is not clear the project has always had the internal capacity to use the inputs.

17. There are major anomalies in the remuneration and administrative arrangements at various levels.

- i. The remuneration of the SMS recruited on contract varies across disciplines, with remuneration ranging from Rs 15,000 to Rs 25,000 for persons with the same designation and same responsibility in their respective domains/disciplines. This cannot be conducive to team building.
- ii. The remuneration for contracted support staff working at ITDA and PSU has not been revised and seems well below that offered to those deputed from the government and for similar work in the open market.
- iii. There is no difference in either the remuneration or the designation of Subject Matter Specialists between the PSU and the ITDA even though the former is expected to play an integrating role.
- iv. There is an overlap between the roles played by the PME function and the MIS function at the PSU level as both deal with project information flowing from the field.
- v. The remuneration of the WDT has not been revised and is grossly inadequate to attract quality professionals. This is also grossly out of line with other similar projects being implemented by the government, such as TRUPTI and OCTMP.

- vi. NGOs do not receive any support for infrastructure and administration (by way of infrastructure, they have been provided a computer without accessories). Since these are charities that depend on donations and funded projects, it is out of place to expect that they would have an establishment to support a funded project. It was stated by some of the NGOs that they are forced to meet some of the genuine overheads by overstating expenses under the Capacity Building head.

**18. The Mission recommends a review of the above issues pertaining to remuneration and administrative arrangements.**

**19. Selection of FNGOs for the second phase has thrown up issues about the methodology followed for selection.** This was brought up by several NGOs in the course of the JRM, including three not working in the project who made a representation to the Mission. It seems some of the stronger and better known NGOs with relevant experience have either not been selected or are playing marginal roles while others with little or no prior relevant experience have been chosen. Some NGOs have been allocated more than one block while others reportedly were told that only one block can be allocated to one NGO. Only a few were earlier working in the project villages allocated to them and there are instances where NGOs with significant and relevant work in a given set of villages were not given those villages. Most have recruited new staff for the WDTs. It seems field checks were not carried out to assess the prior quality of work of the NGOs and they were assessed on the basis of their submissions (along criteria already made public). NGOs, even the shortlisted ones, were not required to make presentations. While this has no relevance for the project now as the selection is complete, ***the process should be critically reviewed as the lessons would be useful for other similar projects in future.***

#### **Effectiveness of Targeting**

20. The project provides for seeking out and working with the most vulnerable. Its translation on the ground, however, depends a great deal on the processes followed. As the entire population is very poor, there is a danger that the most vulnerable might escape attention. The Mission came across instances of widows not borrowing from SHGs even as others had borrowed; a person afflicted with leprosy not being attended; another with a cleft lip not sought out, etc. Without facilitation, SHGs, VDCs and VLSCs may not seek out the most vulnerable. Also, since the priority and focus of the majority is on the large investments the project brings for physical works, ***the question of seeking out the most vulnerable can fall through the cracks unless specifically highlighted; even those left out might believe that the project is for the landed.*** Finally, widespread illiteracy and the resultant language barrier inhibits project personnel from interacting with the poorest as they are least likely to speak Oriya and generally stay in the shadows. ***The Mission recommends that special attention be paid to this issue not only in quantitative monitoring but also while training personnel, volunteers and CBO leaders.***

#### **Development Initiative Fund**

21. The previous JRM had recommended setting aside 25 percent of the DIF for initiatives to assist the vulnerable families. This has been done, proposals from the field for the use of the fund have been invited and initiatives such as providing assistance for home improvements and drinking water and sanitation have begun. ***The Mission recommends increasing the allocation for this purpose to 50 percent*** so that meaningful livelihood activities can be taken up for the landless as they do not benefit from land and water resource development activities where the allocation per family is of the order of Rs 50,000. Towards that end ***the Mission recommends development of model livelihood projects for the landless, such as goat rearing units, leaf plate making units, etc. Opportunities for combining the***

***fund with other government programmes to benefit the landless and other vulnerable groups must also be explored.***

22. The guidelines for the use of Community Infrastructure Fund now require that the communities contribute 50 percent towards construction of common infrastructure, such as buildings for the storage of WFP food grains (used later for other purposes by the community). Since such infrastructure is often created in the beginning of the project when full rapport is yet to be built with the community, getting such contribution is difficult in new project villages. The Mission recommends that such contribution be reduced to 15 percent as was generally the case in Phase I villages.

### **Monitoring & Evaluation**

23. Data entry into the computerised M&E software was delayed as the previous MIS Manager resigned and there was no one looking after the portfolio for eight months. Data during that period was entered into spreadsheets. There is a full time MIS manager now, data entry has been resumed and is progressing well. Data entered into the Spreadsheets is now being uploaded into the software. The previous JRM had recommended that arrangements be made with the software developer for maintenance support and updating of the software. This made no sense as data had not been entered and would be done once data has been fully uploaded and the software has been tested.

24. Besides quantitative monitoring, the project would benefit a great deal from qualitative monitoring. This might best be done by creating mechanisms for the NGOs to carry out participatory review of each other's work through joint field visits and reflection. This would also lead to dissemination of innovations and experiences across watersheds.

### **Procurement Support Team (PST)**

24. The PST set up under the DFID TA has assisted the PSU to bring on board a range of expert inputs to develop the Sustainability Strategy, Strategy for Rural Financial Services, Gender Mainstreaming, etc. Some of these inputs, especially in marketing, seem to have taken the problem solving route rather than capacity building route and it is not clear the solutions provided by them would be sustained and form a base for further work.

25. The DFID TA comes to a close in January 2010 though almost 75 percent of the TA funds remain unspent.

26. DFID has not yet formally responded to the request of the Government of Orissa for extension of its support beyond March 2010. The DFID representative suggested that alternate arrangements need to be made to explore IFAD financing arrangements to fill the funding gaps beyond March 2010.

### **Convergence**

27. The project area is characterised by complex ecology, deep-seated poverty and remoteness and acute lack of infrastructure. The target population is socioeconomically isolated, is acutely vulnerable and has poor access to basic services. The activities initiated and investments being made by the project can at best be a beginning in the long road to socioeconomic transformation of the target population and ecological security of the region. With this perspective the previous JRM had made a strong plea for systematic convergence of the project with government programmes like NREGS, BRGF, various welfare schemes, etc. Convergence remains sporadic and dependent on the initiatives of individual district officials. For example, in none of the villages visited had any one got more than 15 to 25 days' work under NREGS and no where had NREGS or BRGF funds been leveraged to take up watershed development activities.

28. There was little evidence of collaboration with other development departments, including the schemes of the ITDA itself (which could be used to take up road construction work jointly with NREGS). Forests play a key role in the livelihoods, livelihood security and ecology of this region. In fact, under PESA, the elected Panchayats and Gram Sabha are assigned a key role in forest management. While Van Suraksha Samityas have been formed in more than 200 villages, their say in forest management remains marginal. True participation of local communities in managing government forests around their villages is a great opportunity to rejuvenate the forests, enhance local livelihoods and remove the sense of alienation among the tribes. Sound development of the micro watersheds taken up by the project in any case requires close collaboration with the forest department as forests form a significant and ecologically critical part of the watersheds.

29. Several NGOs felt the ITDA and the project management need to take a more proactive role in bringing about convergence. As one NGO pointed out, NGOs resent having to run around chasing lower level revenue, forest and other functionaries when the same are part of the government and therefore more likely to be amenable to requests from the ITDA/Project Management.

**30. *The Mission recommends systematic efforts to bring about convergence. Since most government programmes are now implemented at the Gram Panchayat (GP) level, the Mission recommends that the arrangements with the FNGO partners be extended to neighbouring micro watersheds not covered by the project so that entire GPs are covered.***

31. The quality of SHGs and general conditions in a few villages visited by the Mission where the FNGOs had been working prior to the inception of this project was markedly different from those in villages taken up under this project. This makes it clear that engagement by the FNGOs would be necessary in the project villages beyond the life of this project to bring about meaningful and sustainable changes. It is therefore important that the FNGOs continue to be supported to carry forward the work initiated under this project.

### **Policy initiatives**

32. As per present policy, the VDCs are required to pay revenue for stones and sand collected by them for the construction of physical assets under the project, such as diversion weirs, boulder checks, community buildings, etc. The Mission recommends a review of this policy to grant exemption in the project area. It seems an unnecessary imposition where the materials are being collected for own use by the inhabitants.

33. Those working on various project activities can take up to Rs 10 out of their wages in the form of WFP rice, presently priced at Rs 10 for 3 kg. That purchasing the rice is optional needs to be publicised in view of the fact that the government now sells up to 25 kg rice to BPL families at Rs 2 a kg (over 75 percent of the project beneficiaries are BPL households). The revenue realised from the sale of WFP rice is credited to the community fund, which generally would benefit those who have land because the fund would be used for the upkeep of the irrigation and conservation structures while the landless also do the work and contribute to it when they buy the WFP rice.

### **Knowledge Management: Learning and Innovation**

34. Knowledge Management (KM) activities are building up in the project through formal and informal systems. The PST supported under the DFID TA facilitated the development of a number of subject matter publications and strategy papers including newsletters, CDs, manuals, guidelines as required by the project. All these constitute the formal KM systems within the project. Informal systems of knowledge management within the communities include learning through FFS, exposure visits, on-

field support, group interactions through meetings, SHG fairs at different levels, street plays, *kala jatha* and theme based video shows. Further learning also comes in the form of training provided by WFP in the techniques of food storage, etc. ICRISAT has also provided training and on-field support through its consultants on legume and oil seed farming technologies.

35. It would be useful to promote systematic interaction among NGOs working in the project to exchange experiences through periodic workshops and cross-visits.

### **Exit, Sustainability & Growth Strategy**

36. As recommended by the previous JRM a study by WASSAN to develop exit strategies has been commissioned. WASSAN presented a draft of their study at the debriefing workshop. It was clear from their presentation that the project would need to develop and carry out detailed action plans and the WASSAN study can only serve as a guide. Indeed, an outside agency can only develop broad frameworks and those engaged in the project have to translate them into concrete action plans.

37. Fundamentally, sustainability and growth would require continued engagement by the NGOs in the project villages and with the CBOs. It is not clear how many of the NGOs would continue working beyond the project period without support for their continued engagement. Convergence with other government schemes would ensure that work continues in these villages to carry forward the initiatives taken by this project in the post-project phase.

38. As earlier stated, convergence would be aided greatly if entire Panchayats were covered by the project, which is not the case presently. Panchayats are the planning and administrative domain for many key government schemes, such as NREGS, BRRGF, etc. and have a key role in many social sector schemes, like SSA, NRHM, etc. Therefore, expanding coverage to the entire Panchayat by involving the NGOs would aid the cause of sustainability and growth.

## **Fiduciary Aspects & Procurement**

**Sudhir N. Muralidharan**

### **1. Financial Management**

1.1. VDC & VLSC Balances : ITDAs transfer funds to the VDCs and through the VDCs to the VLSCs on the basis of the AWPB. However, these funds are not fully spent in the period they are budgeted for and they accumulate over a period of time. The cumulative balance of VDCs and VLSCs as on March 31,2009 is Rs. 240,885,461 or USD 5.125 Million. This also represents over 25 % of the IFAD Loan and 9 % of the total project cost. The balance has not changed materially on September 30,2009. It is even more worrisome that this amount is not fully represented by the bank balances available with VDCs and VLSCs. The shortfall in the bank accounts is to the extent of approximately Rs.210 lacs or USD 450,000.

1.2. FNGO Advances : ITDAs release funds to FNGOs mainly for capacity building trainings and exposure visits. Funds are not fully spent in the period they are budgeted for and they accumulate at the FNGO level. The cumulative balance with FNGOs as on March 31,2009 is Rs.20,940,151\_( USD 450,000 approx). In many cases, the Mission observed that the amount available with the FNGO exceeded the entire annual budget for 2008-9. The balance has increased to Rs.28,789,192 ( USD 612,500).

1.3. VDF Deposits: VDCs/ VLSCs deduct a fixed amount from labour payments towards VDF. While verifying labour payments, the Mission found that in several VDCs/VLSCs, the a cheque was made out in the name of the User Group leader for the entire gross labour wage as per Muster Roll. The entire amount was drawn from the bank of the VDC or VLSC and the net amount ( after deduction of Rs.10 per 3 kg of rice) was handed over to the labourers and acknowledged by them. The amount deducted against food grain is supposed to be deposited in a separate VDF bank account maintained by the VDC. However, the Mission observed that these amounts were not deposited or deposited late in most cases. In fact the project is not in a position to quantify the shortfall in deposit of VDF.

1.4. WFP Contribution : The Project does not account for the value of food grains provided by the World Food Programme though the same is part of project cost. To the extent of food grains provided to the Project so far, the project expenditure is understated.

1.5. Beneficiary Contribution : The Project has accounted for Rs.58,755,030 ( USD 1.250 Million) as beneficiary contribution during 2008-9. This includes the beneficiary contribution from the inception of the project till 31-3-09. Beneficiary contribution is drawn from individual case records maintained by VDCs / VLSCs which break up the estimated cost into project contribution and beneficiary contribution. It does not represent the actual amount contributed by beneficiaries and rather represents the estimated contribution receivable from beneficiaries. The project has no mechanism to ascertain actual beneficiary contribution.

1.6. Interest on Bank Deposits : Interest income on bank deposits maintained at the VDC/VLSC , FNGO and ITDA levels amounting to Rs.18,324,891 ( USD 390,000) from the inception of the project until 31-3-09, was accounted for in 2008-9. It is not clear whether, these figures have been drawn from bank statements of these bank accounts and whether the entire amount for all project accounts and sub accounts have been accounted for.

1.7. Staff Advances : Advances to staff at PSU and ITDAs as on 31-3-09, stood at Rs.693,531 ( USD 14750). During the year, the balances at ITDAs were much higher. The Mission observed that advances were not settled for long periods of time and fresh advances were given to employees who were yet to settle old advances. Contrary to instructions, unsettled advances were not deducted from salaries.

1.8. FNGO Records : On the basis of random verification of FNGO records, discussions with internal auditors and perusal of internal audit reports, the Mission observed as below-

- Several FNGOs maintained huge cash balances and made heavy cash payments, specially, as advances to staff.
- Training expense vouchers were normally accompanied by a standard set of bills from the same vendors- for food, stationary, vehicle hire , Xerox etc. The bills very often totalled up to exactly the limit prescribed for that training by the PSU. Most often photocopies of attendance sheets were enclosed. Photos and training reports were not available for verification. There was no certification of any kind by the PO (CB) of the ITDA. The Mission has no conclusive evidence that-
  - The training took place
  - The quality of the training was acceptable
  - The participants as per attendance sheet actually attended the training
  - The expenses shown against the training were actually incurred
- In the case of exposure visits, the Mission was informed that vehicle hire charges could be charged at actual levels. FNGOs seemed to take full advantage of this diktat and charged exorbitant amounts as vehicle hire charges. The Mission also observed that no confirmation of the visit was available from the head of the institution visited. There was no certification of any kind by any ITDA staff. There is very little evidence that the visit actually took place.
- Huge cash advances were made to WDT members and other FNGO staff. Advance registers were not maintained and there was no way to monitor whether these advances are settled on time or settled at all. Advances were settled by submitting bills for exposure visits and trainings, the authenticity of which has been discussed above.
- In some cases, training costs in excess of limits laid down by the PSU, were incurred. No approval was available for verification.
- It was obvious from the VDC resolutions that FNGOs had excessive influence over the program implementation at the grassroots level. In some cases, it was recorded in resolutions that FNGOs have procured materials and given them to the VDC/VLSC. The FNGOs, as the Mission understands, is supposed to facilitate the empowerment of the tribal beneficiaries and not empower themselves.

1.9. VDC/VLSC Records : On the basis of random verification of VDC/VLSC records, discussions with internal auditors and perusal of internal audit reports, the Mission observed as below-

- Asset Registers, VDF Registers and Stock Registers were not maintained / updated in many cases.
- Work estimates were not available in many cases
- VDF deductions were made at more than Rs.10 per 3 kg in some cases

- VDF deposits were not made at all in some cases and were made after long delays in some cases.
- The space provided for signature/ thumb impressions in the Muster Roll was insufficient and they were found to overlap making it impossible to verify them.
- In some cases signatures/ thumb impressions for recipients of labour payments were missing
- In many cases supporting bills were not available for materials purchased.
- In several cases the labour payments as per cash book did not agree with that as per Muster Roll.
- In several cases, Muster Rolls were not signed by President/ Secretary of the VDC/VLSC and by the WDT engineer.
- Even in cases where receipt of materials were entered in the Stock Register, there was no way to verify the issues as the issues could not be correlated with the Bill of Quantities.
- The columns provided on the reverse of the Muster Rolls for work measurements and material consumption details were almost never filled out.
- The Mission did not see any case where the ITDA officials had certified the work measurements or the quality of the infrastructure built.
- Internal auditors have noted that in several cases, excessive transportation charges were paid for materials.
- VDCs did not maintain advance registers for advances made to VLSCs. This made monitoring of VLSC advances difficult.
- From verification of VDC/ VLSC records, it was obvious that WDT engineers and WDOs did not function effectively as control points to ensure that the community gets the full benefit of funds spent on creation of infrastructure under CIF and Land & Water management. Their lack of effectiveness, exposes the program to large gaps in internal controls which could lead to diversion of materials purchased for the program, diversion of VDF amounts deducted from labour payments and poor quality of works undertaken under the program.

1.10. Capacity Building at VDC/VLSC level : Despite numerous trainings conducted by FNGOs for VDC/VLSC functionaries in the area of book keeping and accounting, adequate capacity is still absent at these levels. This casts serious doubts on the quality of training imparted by FNGOs. There is no point in spending money on training of VDC staff unless there is visible improvement in book keeping capacity.

1.11. Financial Support Assistants : Financial Support assistants (FSAs) have been engaged through a CA firm to provide hands on training and hand holding support to VDC/ VLSC staff. The Mission understands that these FSAs are of uniformly low calibre and have been ineffective so far. Many of them do not even have a commerce background and are totally at sea when it comes to accounting and book keeping. They do not report to ITDAs and the Mission is not clear as to who actually supervises their work and is accountable for their outputs..

## **2. Procurement.**

2.1. Bulking of requirements: The PSU has not bulked requirements of location equipment like survey equipment, computers and furniture etc for centralized procurement as required by the IFAD Procurement Guidelines and Schedule 4 of the Loan Agreement. Instead the PSU has allowed ITDAs to procure these items locally. Consequently, the Mission observed that a survey equipment supplier had quoted different prices to different ITDAs for the same survey equipment. However, the Project

Management was of the view that centralized procurement was not practical owing to the distance of the ITDAs from the PSU. They also felt that since ITDAs were independent registered entities, they could undertake their own procurement.

2.2. Procurement Procedure :. While verifying procurement of computers at the PSU, the Mission observed that frozen a particular brand rather than generic specs before procuring the computers under a DGS&D rate contract. This is contrary to IFAD's Procurement Guidelines. The Project has limited procurement capacity and awareness of IFAD's Procurement Guidelines is limited.

### **3. Disbursements.**

3.1. The Mission was not provided with accurate, credible and verifiable data on disbursements by financier, expenditure by component and reimbursement from IFAD by category.

### **4. Counterpart Funds.**

4.1. Status of counterpart funds : The IFAD loan is delivered to the project through the budgetary allocation from the Government of Orissa to the Department of ST & SC.. Since the amount transferred to the project is not bifurcated between loan and counterpart funds, the extent of shortfall in the counterpart funding, if any, cannot be clearly identified. The total commitment of counterpart funds under Section 3.05 of the PLA is USD 9,567,000. In addition to the amounts received from IFAD as loan and as grant, the GoO has transferred USD 16.185 Million to the Project, partly to pre finance expenditure to be claimed and reimbursed by IFAD.

### **5. Audit**

5.1. Appointment of Project Auditors : The project auditors were appointed for a 3 year term in 2006-7. The project could not provide IFAD's NOC for audit TOR or for appointment of auditors for verification by the Mission.

5.2. Programme Financial Statements (PFS) : The PSU and ITDAs did not submit PFS in standard IFAD reporting formats for audit. The audit TOR clearly states that the auditor has to express an opinion of PFS as per IFAD formats.

5.3. Quality of Audit Report:. The audit report for 2008-9 was not of acceptable quality. The report did not address the following areas mentioned in the TOR.

- Use of IFAD funds as per provisions of the PLA
- Timely release and proper utilization of counterpart funds
- Procurement of goods and services as per provisions of the PLA
- Adequacy of fixed asset records maintained by the project and regularity of physical verification of assets
- Proper accounting of food grain assistance received from WFP
- Adequacy of supporting documentation as evidence of project expenditure
- Reconciliation between IFAD/GoO disbursements and amount received by the Project
- Eligibility of expenditure claimed through SoEs.

Further, the auditors failed to highlight the fact that VDC balances as per ITDA books were not reconciled with balances as per VDC/VLSC Cash Books and bank Pass Books. The auditors have given an unqualified audit opinion, whereas, this point alone justifies a

qualified opinion. The Mission cannot comprehend how the Project made final payment to the auditors when the audit report did not address most points in the TOR.

IFAD places a high degree of reliance on programme audit reports and a poorly drawn up audit report can seriously impact IFAD's assessment of the programme financial management capacity. It is noteworthy that the audit fee for the entire assignment covering PSU, ITDAs, FNGOs, VDCs/VLSCs was just over USD 1000.

5.5. Audit Log : The PSU did not submit an audit log for verification by the Mission.

5.6 : Internal Audit : The Project has recently appointed internal auditors for all Phase 1 ITDAs. The process of appointment was neither transparent nor competitive. Prior to this appointment, internal audit was conducted by ITDA FOs. The Mission found their reports highlighted some important issues which were not adequately addressed by Project Management.

## **6. Withdrawal Applications**

6.1. The Mission verified the reimbursement claim aggregating Rs.133,548,752 for the period from April-September 2009. This claim was prepared on the basis of expenditure recorded in the books of accounts maintained by the PSU & ITDAs on the basis of Monthly Progress Reports and did not prima facie include advances made to various project parties.

6.2. IFAD's India Office has rejected 2 Withdrawal Applications ( for the period from 1-4-08 to 31-10-08 and from 1-11-08 to 31-3-09) submitted by the Project in 2008-9 as they included advances made to project parties. IFAD reimburses only project expenditure and not advances. The Project has resubmitted the claim for period from 1-11-08 to 31-3-09 as the Government has informed them that the WA from 1-4-08 to 31-10-08 has already been submitted to IFAD and cannot be withdrawn. As on date, neither of these claims is being processed by IFAD pending clarifications from the Project. It may also be noted that the auditors have pointed out that Rs.14,92,00,767 between the project expenditure as per audited accounts for 2008-9 ( Rs. 40,79,18,492.32) and that claimed from IFAD through SoEs (25,87,17,725). The Project informed the Mission that this represents the amount under claimed by the Project in 2008-9 to be adjusted against amounts over claimed by the Project from IFAD in previous years.

6.3. The Project used to claim amounts released by the PSU to other project parties as expenditure up to 31-3-09. IFAD used to reimburse the same under the impression that only expenditure was being claimed. The lacuna was discovered in 2008-9 and Withdrawal Applications for that year were rejected by IFAD. However, the excess amount claimed and reimbursed by IFAD under Loan and Grant in earlier years is estimated at Rs. 125,026,683 or USD 2.660 Million. Details are given below:

<b><u>Details</u></b>	<b><u>Amount (Rs.)</u></b>
Expenditure as per audited accounts from 2003-04 to 2008-09 ( after adjusting depreciation)	826,939,639
Expenditure claimed from IFAD for the same period	951,966,322
<b>Excess Claim cumulative up to 31-3-09</b>	<b>125,026,683</b>

## **7.Compliance with Loan Covenants**

7.1.The Mission observed the following non compliances with loan covenants.

- Section 3.02 (b) : As per this section, the PSU was required to submit a draft AWPB for 2009-10 for approval of the Fund on or before 1-2-09. The draft AWPB was submitted for approval of the Fund in March 2009.
- Section 4.01 and Clause 16 of Schedule 3 : As per this section, the PSU is required to establish and maintain an appropriate information management system within 180 days of loan effectiveness. As per information provided by the PSU, this was done in August 2008.
- Section 5.01 :As per this clause, the PSU has to deliver unaudited financial statements to the Fund within 4 months of the end of the financial year. Unaudited accounts were not submitted to the Fund.
- Section 5.02 (b) : Under this section, the PSU is required to submit an audit report to the Fund containing a separate opinion on certified SoEs and other matters mentioned in Section 9.03 of the General conditions. The audit report did not cover these points.

	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Date</b>
<u>Section 11.6 of Schedule 3</u> : Under this section, the ITDA is responsible for final inspection of infrastructure works and for preparation of BoQ. The Mission did not find adequate evidence of this being done consistently by the ITDA		
<b>Recommendations</b>		
<u>VDC/VLSC balances</u> : Urgent steps need to be taken to reconcile the VDC / VLSC balances as ITDA books with those as per VDC/VLSC Cash Books and bank statements. The recently engaged internal auditors may be assigned the task of reconciling the VDC/VLSC bank accounts. Each VDC/VLSC must have funds enough to undertake 3 months work as per plan and the excess money must be recalled to the ITDA or adjusted in future disbursements to VDCs.	PSU & ITDAs	By 31-1-10
<u>FNGO Balances</u> :FNGOs must be allowed to retain only funds required for 3 months execution of work under the Capacity Building component. The Mission understands that there is a State Government directive that the entire annual allocation under Program Management component must remain with the FNGOs. The excess funds must be recalled to the ITDA or adjusted in future disbursements to FNGOs.	PSU & ITDAs	By 31-1-10
<u>VDF Deposits</u> : Shortfall in VDF deposits out of cash drawn for labour payments must be identified VDC wise and those responsible should be asked to compensate the shortfall immediately.	PSU & ITDAs	By 31-1-10
<u>Procurement</u> : Wherever possible, requirements must be bulked and centralized at the SPMU. IFAD's procurement guidelines must be followed without exception. The awareness about IFAD's Procurement Guidelines must be increased at ITDA level.	PSU & ITDAs	With immediate effect
<u>Compliance with loan covenants</u> : The PLA is to be complied with in letter and spirit under all circumstances.	PSU	With immediate effect
<u>Audit</u> : IFAD is advised to reject the Project Audit Report for 2008-9 . The Project is advised to appoint a special auditor for 2008-9 through a fair and competitive process using the QCBS method. The auditor should not be paid unless the CFO certifies that all points as per IFAD approved audit TOR are covered in the report.	PSU	By 31-1-10
<u>Withdrawal Applications</u> :The CFO , IFAD's India Office and CAAA must meet immediately to sort out the impasse relating to WAs submitted by the Project for 2008-9 and for 2009-10. The proceedings must be minuted and acted upon forthwith. The IFAD India office, in consultation with RFMO-IFAD HQ must inform the Project on how the excess claims reimbursed to the Project in the past will be regularized or adjusted.	CFO, IFAD India Office	By 31-12-09.

## **Rural Microfinance & Gender**

### **Sandhya Tamrakar**

1. The Joint Review Mission for the programme "Orissa Tribal Empowerment and Livelihoods Programme" was held from November 2 to 17, 2009. The review mission was suppose to review and assess the implementation processes for addressing the Phase I MTR recommendations for Phase II, as well as progress of actions taken on the recommendations of the previous JRM. It was also to review existing programme implementation mechanism, programme expansion issues, assess extent of progress, and emerging issues in relation to the progress of programme components.

2. The specific areas gender strategy for gender mainstreaming, Proper utilization of Rural financial services and sustainability of CBOs, as look are follows

- ◆ **Rural Micro Finance**
- ◆ **Livelihood enhancement (Income generation Activities )**
- ◆ **Strengthening**
- ◆ **Health and nutrition**
- ◆ **Collective Marketing**
- ◆ **Sustainability**
- ◆ **Gender**

3. Overview of Self Help movement - Self help as a tool for economic, social and political empowerment. Social and Economic empowerment as two important wheels of the SHG. This will cover the genesis of Self help movements World over, in India in General and Orissa in Particular OTELP. Basic object of Rural Micro Finance SHGs are the methodologies of motivating people to form self help groups, group dynamics, need for cohesion, best practices in SHGs, guidelines of various agencies on the best practices (MYRADA, NABARD etc), and record keeping of the groups, meetings, minute taking, democratic decision making, issues in SHG leadership, social and economic empowerment and SHG as a tool of empowerment.

4. The present report is based on 9 days field visits to three district as Kalahandi, Gajapati & Raygada interacting with about 39 SHGs. Issues discussed with the SHGs included on Group Formation, capacity building, savings and credit as group activities, entrepreneurship and empowerment, importance and methodologies of maintaining group records, minute books, savings book, democratic decision making, dealing with apathy, and conflict resolution processes.

- Interest calculations, loan management, revolving funds utilization, good and bad practices, bad loans recovery, portfolio management, financial discipline, rules and regulations.
- Enterprise Promotion- covering idea generation, Need for enterprise promotion for SHG, consumption versus production credit, concept of an enterprise and business failure and viability
- Financial sustainability of the SHGs screening, business planning, financial analysis, and exposure to functional areas of business like production, finance, marketing, time value of money, evaluation of business ideas marketing: This will cover product, price, place and promotion. There will be live marketing exercises, selling practice, inventory control etc.

## Observations

5. Women SHG were actively participating covering 100% households in most of the villages in Phase I & II.
6. **Maintenance of Books:** Because of illiteracy SHG books was not proper in some villages there is difference in personal saving pass book. The groups continue to depend on the community mobilizer for book keeping. In order to ensure sustainability for strengthen the capacity of group members. In this regard targeted training programm of SHG members. Beginning of IGP such as Collective Mkt group enterprises, individual business, and management of funds. More concentration for the SHG member to empower in IGP. Activity wise Yearly planning which was select or priority by the Group. Need based /Potential IGP selection Plan for Execution, Marketing and Repayments & Benefits.
7. **Promotion for Sustainable approaches:** Most of SHGs have collectively taken up economic activities. Though some SHGs have taken up issues like banning liquor in their hamlets Most of SHG met during visit unclear about the purpose of group forming, besides saving small sums and taking up economic activities as a group (e.g rearing goats and collecting vegetables and other crops). Inter loaning within groups is sporadic even when SHGs had idle cash. Group funds in some cases have been used to take up group activities without proper accounting for the same. Very few groups demand for funds for economic activities from VDCs /Bank. Group member remain afraid of taking bank loans and ignorant about the banking system.
8. **By the IGP (Collective Marketing) Benefits or dividend of the products** should be distributed to each in a year and it was the main focus to distribution of benefits for these women became more confident and empower they take decision for own & plan for their own and family they plan for future business, their purchasing power & living standard will automatically upgrade.
9. **Rotational Leadership in VSC/SHG :** Presence of Women are unequal in VDC and except one no were we get the executive member were representative .However the participation and rotation of female should implement in Phase I,II villages, so that women is become improve the participation. Facilitate women to articulate their needs in VLSC to achieve gender balance Empowerment and gender mainstreaming strategy for the project should come immediately. Rotational leadership among CBOs including SHG to ensures the level of transparency.
10. **Gradation of SHG:** Gradation of SHGs are in place, however, the SHGs qualifying to be Grade A may be awarded with certificates / batches etc., in a celebrative way so as to encourage other groups to perform better. Due capacity building inputs (training/ exposures etc.) are to be taken up for different graded groups based on field reality. By this concentration to upgrade and build capacity Building Programme (Trainings) conduct in Village/Block level and prepare a parameter's to define Grade A,B,C. and Identified group willing some demarcation such as batch, certificate etc in and to upgrade conduct level of trainings programme.
11. **RFS Linkages:** Linkages by the SHG 80% funds being unutilized in the group capital while some villages the funds are utilized completely but repayments required because of dependency of book writing they were not much aware their funds for utilization and timely repayments. Concert finance Officials/SMS should be more regiment and transparent.
12. **Need Assessment Plan:** To utilization of RFS strengthening for skill development activity it should be in a proper way firstly village/SHG wise need based

training exercise, availability & distribution of funds, management, Duration. Second is Risk cover. The process of Business Development Plans as recommended in previous JRM also the mission recommended to implement immediate at least phase I villages to accomplished them .

**13. Reporting System:** The previous JRM had observed the software NABYUKTI developed by the NABARD should adopt to suit for the book keeping and manage accounts in a better way.

**14. Convergence:** Access and linkage with government schemes By Participatory workshop & Seminar with Line Dept involving Banker's and RFI. Group demands from the following NREGA, BRGF, NRHM and various Govt. schemes. It is observed that Bank linkages continue to be minimum because of repayments procedure improper in saving A/c bulk of amount and credit of RF was slowly repaid by the member. So more concentration to the inter loaning and proper fund management system of the group.

**15. Livestock/Pisces culture Promotion by the SHGs:** The promotion of goatery among the SHGs as Income Generation Activity which is has also picked up as in all the SHGs, it was said to be the most demanding activity among the tribal community and it gives continuously return to the individuals . With the large scale promotion of goats among the SHGs, there is need to ensure the timely support system in terms of medical care to the animals. Promoting health camps and vaccination has helped towards reducing the animals. Providing better fodder to improve them more. Breed improvement is only by one SHG which was sustainable improvement and returns more varieties of goats and poultry are being promoted in the project .Along with the introduction of new varieties, the project also needs to try out in improving the productivity and quality of local breeds. Bread improvement also include in this intervention by the convergence from line dept. The fishery promotion is very less in the projects area only few Ponds for fish rearing seems to be more focusing in livelihood intervention. And also focus to the fishery nursery as a IGA for groups it's a short term and low cost activity which gives maximum returns. The availability of water harvesting structures it may be apply for such nurseries, wherein the fingerlings could be improved variety for cultivation.

**16. Insurance** is one of the important needs for the IGA, so safe their investment and risk cover in corporate to the insurance and mobilization among the SHG.

**17. Vegetable cultivation:** The promotion of vegetable growing by the some of groups. It is another continuous source of income which requires more training about the promotion of improved early growing variety and focus to natural manure there is a need for promoting bio compost pits across in all the project areas. Vegetable cultivation practices for enhancing their income gradually. There is a strong need to promote good practice on vegetables. Through convergence of dept adopt new mechanics of agri tools for best practices.

**18. Horticulture Promotion** by the Groups: The horticulture plantation of mango is done by the SHG in Kalahandi District the plantation was good with the protection to each plant. For long term returns proper irrigation system should required in season. More concentration for new species and mix plantation which sustain by the nature should apply for long term intervention for the continuous income source. Nursery raising by the SHGs is a very good income generating activity and they need trained in developing grafted varieties of different horticulture species. Promotion of Forestry species in same plots for fuel wood and timber also required for sustainable approach. Arrange some exposure visit for such intervention which could apply suddenly by the community.

**20. Strengthening:** The Programme has institutional strengthening system in between PSU, ITDA, F-NGO, VDCs and SHGs. It seems to be gaps in this coordination, mainly

between the ITDA members and the F-NGOs, which could be observed during the field visits. It is also seen that the Subject Matter Specialists (SMS) was responsible for technical inputs to the organizations for strengthened in their field. They would be more responsible what actual need from the community at the field level, especially the Phase I villages, there is a strong need for the inputs from the Agriculture, Microfinance and Institutional Building SMSs. These members need to disseminate the knowledge resource to the various CBOs in the project. Illiteracy of group's required pictorial IEC materials IEC material in local language was better learning process, it locate in some of villages in programme area and require more exposure visits and good demonstrations to upgrade them immediately.

**21. Exposure** visit for Phase II villages to strengthening the Group and adoption of the process.

**22. Beyond business-** Nutrition and Health also require for integrated development; women issues, health, IMR, MMR, nutrition education, women rights and human rights, role of women in local institutions and SHGs as tools for social and political empowerment. Which seems in project area very less. Groups required more focus in the meetings and raise issues with the convergence of ICDS, Health Dept or NRHM projects.

**23. Collective Marketing** has been well institutionalised in the programme villages. Community members have started selling the surplus products through collectivisation. Weighing system has been institutionalised. Barter almost stopped. People in the community are marked with level of confidence for marketing with enough negotiation skill. Excellent web based database of surplus products available for marketing in the programme villages has been developed. However, this trend is to be carry forward to ensure the continuity of the benefits of collective marketing. The capacity of the staff from F.NGOs and ITDAs are to be strengthened to promote collective marketing in length and breadth. Marketing cadres developed need further handholding support to sustain the early reflection of collective marketing at the community level. Similar cadres are to be ensured in other watersheds of the OTELP.

24. Convergence with other marketing agencies in the state & districts seems to be weakest link to ensure sustainability of the collective marketing initiatives. The SHGs and CIGs associated in collective marketing are to be oriented on first level value addition of the segregated products to fetch better price. SHGs / CIGs are also to be oriented to promote entrepreneurship at the community level.

25. Availability of funds under Rural Financial Services (RFS) has impacted the promotion of collective marketing in the programme villages. Funds have been mobilised to promote collectivisation of products, but the potential of collective marketing of various products is still not optimally captured. Huge funds under RFS component are lying idle at the VDC level, which can be optimally used by the SHGs to enhance collective marketing. These of course require quality training, exposures, hands on support etc, where, ITDA to take lead to strengthen the capacity of WDTs and volunteers to facilitate the process effectively.

26. It is observed that benefits accrued by the SHG through different income generating activities are not being distributed to the members, rather this gets merged with the group funds. The SHGs are also not clear, whether the benefit should be shared among the members. At times they depend on others to meet their financial requirement or compromise with their requirement but the benefits are kept untouched. Programme should orient the SHGs for effective use of benefits accrued by different activities.

27. Road side shops promoted by MART for collective marketing are to be up-scaled in all programme districts. Similar initiatives are to be organised by the programme to

show case the products with due trade mark of their product at different levels such as District Melas, Adivasi Exhibition at the State level, trade fair etc.

### **Key Recommendations**

28. In some villages RFS are utilized completely in other the amount is not utilized in full. The literacy level of the tribal is very low they depends on external book writers, the capacity of field staff is also seems less.

Maintenance of Books: It was seen that major difference in personnel saving book and Minutes books. Currently the book keeping is being done by the Community mobilizer which was engaged and paid by the FNGOs administration cost . Only in few SHG they paid from their own savings. There is a strong need to concentration more for record keeping.

29. Rotational leadership is not yet started even in phase one villages it seems to focus to implement in these villages at least.

SHG wise need based training exercise and exposure visit required.

In order to enhance the skill of rural artisans mega clusters are to be include in the programme

30. Through collective marketing, the decision making at the group level has improved tremendously due to the involvement of community members at all steps of livelihood promotion. It is observed that benefits accrued by the SHG through different income generating activities are not being distributed to the members; rather this gets merged with the group funds. The SHGs are also not clear, whether the benefit should be shared among the members.

**31. Training Need and Strength Assessment** has been carried out however, technical assistance is required in field level. The process of Buisness Development Plan is also recommended by last JRM should be extended more in the Project area. SHG wise need based training exercise and exposure visit required.

**32. Nutrition and Health** also require for integrated development; women issues, health, IMR, MMR, nutrition education, women rights and human rights, role of women in local institutions and SHGs as tools for social and political empowerment. This seems in project area very less. The level of health related awareness among the CBOs remains poor .lack of health awareness programme in the villages. In Rayagada district some of villages have major problem about proper vaccination, before inception of project MMR and IMR is in critical condition. And there is no vaccination for children's about six months. Greater efforts is needed to creat awareness about health hygiene and sanitation, address nutritional security to improve a better health services. Promotion of kitchen garder to enhance nutrition, safe drinking water is also necessary for good health. Groups required more focus in the meetings and raise issues with the convergence of ICDS, Health Dept or NRHM projects. People are more sensitized on Mother and Child Care , Family planning , Anganwadi , New knowledge of cultivation , application of manure for increased production etc

Need of strong coordination support system. These members need to regularly field visit and follow up the activities. Concentration to strengthening the different institutions (WDT,CM,SHG).

## Natural Resource Management and Livelihoods

### Ganesh Neelam

1. The Joint Review Mission for the programme "Orissa Tribal Empowerment and Livelihoods Programme" was held from November 2 to 17, 2009. The review mission was suppose to review and assess the implementation processes for addressing the Phase I MTR recommendations for Phase II, as well as progress of actions taken on the recommendations of the previous JRM. It was also to review existing programme implementation mechanism, programme expansion issues, assess extent of progress, and emerging issues in relation to the progress of programme components.

2. The specific areas the expert on Natural Resource Management and Livelihoods had to look on are:

- ◆ Land and water management
- ◆ Agriculture
- ◆ Aquaculture & Livestock
- ◆ Community forestry, NTFPs & agro-forestry:
- ◆ Health and nutrition
- ◆ Women and NRM
- ◆ Capacity building
- ◆ Innovation, learning and knowledge management
- ◆ Exit cum sustainability strategy:

3. OTELP has been largely promoting natural resource base for the ST and SC communities in the most remote pockets of South Western Orissa. The programme has been specifically implemented in the most backward districts of the state and has been able to create a positive impact on the livelihoods of the communities through resource creation (land and water). The core focus of the programme is on ensuring food security and enhancing livelihoods of the ST & SC communities with the watershed development approach. This broadly seems to be a good start and now needs an intensive livelihood focused approach to ensure the improved quality of life for the ST & SC communities in sustained manner.

4. It seems that the programme mainly in the Phase I (completing 5 years) has mostly concentrated on the physical infrastructure development with the promotion of various CBOs to implement the same. The major time of the programme has been in resource creation, which is common in all conventional watershed development programmes implemented under different government schemes (DPAP, NWDPR, etc). This focus on physical infrastructure during the core project period (3-4 years) has to a large extent sidelined the focus on improving the rainfed farming system and allied livelihood interventions during that time, which could had been a focus area simultaneous to physical interventions. This focus is now being brought in the programme (Phase I) in the remaining two years with the promotion of new crop varieties, improving agricultural practices and developing horticulture and animal husbandry. There have been efforts towards strengthening the key livelihood sectors for the community. **However, a focused approach towards taking up the important livelihood interventions does not seem visible in the programme presently. The teams have been trying hard, but with the present plans it looks behind achieving the desired results.** There is a need for intensive livelihood focused strategy to ensure improved quality of life.

5. It is felt that under the programme (Phase I), the focus on agriculture and allied livelihood interventions should now be on well defined campaign mode with well defined plans for each year and then specific to season and crops. All teams along with the various CBOs should be involved in stabilizing the production of key crops (paddy, millet, niger) for food security and introducing new crops to enhance income levels and nutritional security.

Resource organizations strong on agricultural interventions should be involved in quality planning process and capacity building. Only with a rigorous and well defined planning approach could the programme be able to achieve its goals of livelihood promotion for the most disadvantaged communities. Quality plans for each season should be developed and implemented through the VDCs. The planning process before each crop season would help in understanding the proposed crop area under different crops and support required in terms of inputs such as seeds, fertilizers and technical inputs to the farmers. **The CBOs to provide such backward-forward linkages along with introducing community service providers should be promoted.** It is recommended that the teams are provided with such on-field training for one season through known resource institutions working on livelihood promotion in the region. Quality IEC material needs to be developed in local language.

**6. The learnings of Phase I need to be strongly taken in consideration during the Phase II, which has started about 2 years now. The basic objective should be implementing an *Integrated Natural Resource Management (INRM)* approach, which looks after development and management of the resources simultaneously.** The most important aspect is to promote agriculture development along with the creation of water resources. **Priority needs to be given on the paddy and millet crops and enhancing its productivity would help promoting the programme in much better manner. The strategy should be to integrate both the development and management simultaneously rather than creating the resources all together and then planning its utilization. The second key strategy needs to be developing linkages with the NREGS in all the Phase I and Phase II project villages.** There needs to be strong emphasis on making all the stakeholders understand the linkage options and promote the same with well defined responsibilities at each institutions level. NREGS work for soil and water conservation, wherein maximum labour is involved should be undertaken for new activities in Phase I watersheds (as presently about half of the village falling within the watershed seems to be treated under the programme). In the Phase II villages, the VLSC and VDCs with facilitation from the F-NGOs and ITDA need to develop the microplans (plans from the developed watershed plan could be culled out) and submit it to proper authorities for approval. In such a way the funds for physical activities (land leveling, bunding, earthen dams, stone bunding, etc) under OTELP would reduce and these could be used for promoting the livelihood activities. The NREGS linkage presently looks to be slow and it is suggested that the teams need to act fast and take up NREGS for creation of assets for the community rather than focus on road construction. Maybe the teams are provided about 2 days training on key concepts in NREGS and systems to develop microplans and link them with respective authorities. Exposure visits to resource organizations such as SPS, PRADAN, etc. involved in developing such microplans should be organized

7. All the project areas are the fragile rainfed areas, wherein the dependence on rainfall is the key towards agriculture promotion and other livelihood interventions. The dependence on forest resources is also quite high and in some places surpasses agriculture. **In such fragile rainfed areas, there is a strong need to ensure that the rich biodiversity available with the tribal communities in not disturbed to a large extent.** Disturbing the biodiversity would also result in problems being faced under Climate Change. Qualitative support towards stabilizing and enhancing productivity of key crops would be the best support for the community and also strengthening the ecological resource base. **There is a strong need to understand the local conditions and only introduce the most suitable and adaptable crop varieties in the region.** One needs to strongly look that with the promotion of improved varieties, chemical pesticide applications do not increase up substantially in the region. The vegetable promotion could encourage the farmers to go for chemical pesticide and this could destroy the local biodiversity of the region and also have associated health problems. **Therefore, there is a strong need to promote bio pesticides and fertilizers to combat the pests and enhance production.** The rich diversity within the rainfed areas need to be conserved the maximum

and for such the organic practices should be expanded at maximum level with all the community members. Integrated rainfed farming system approach needs to be promoted across all micro watersheds with immediate effect.

**8. Coordination System Strengthening:** The programme would achieve its desired outcomes mainly with the strong coordination support system among the different stakeholders. The key stakeholders mainly for ensuring quality implementation and institutional strengthening are the PSU, ITDA, F-NGO, VDCs and SHGs. There seems to be gaps in this coordination, mainly between the ITDA members and the F-NGOs, which could be observed during the field visits. The Subject Matter Specialists (SMS) meant to provide the technical inputs to the organizations need to be strengthened in their subject areas. This could be further strengthened through capacity building and exposure inputs to similar ecological conditions. Looking at the field areas, especially the Phase I villages, there is a strong need for the inputs from the Agriculture, Microfinance and Institutional Building SMSs. These members need to proactively disseminate the knowledge resource to the various CBOs promoted in the project and the WDT members in a systematic and well defined manner. Some of the SMSs are really strong and understand their subject quite well.

9. There is also a strong feeling that the monthly interaction system between the ITDA and F-NGOs need to be revamped. Present interaction system of one day, which is mostly administrative (exchange of data information), needs to be changed for a 2 days interaction programme. The first day could be dedicated for the activities undertaken in the present system and **second day could be designed for specific focused activity such as agriculture promotion, SHG books management, institutional strengthening, etc. Every month a subject could be selected and this can be facilitated by an expert or the specific SMS.** This would enhance the linkages between the stakeholders and also improve the knowledge base important for field implementation. Subsequently, there also is a strong need for each SMS to have a good understanding about the other subjects underway in the project. This presently seems to be less and there is a need for well designed interaction mechanism among the ITDA members itself. **These specific plans would help in better coordination and provide strong inputs to the field implementation and strengthening the different institutions promoted through the programme.** The programme should define the costs based on the interventions specific to the local conditions. The costs for physical interventions should be per ha and per household based basically with the type of activity. Cost norms for watershed implementation in such a terrain should be increased and only then a quality model of watershed development in high rainfall areas could be developed and promoted. Quality resource institutions should be linked to the programme to ensure qualitative knowledge resource flows in and strengthens the complete system. The partnerships should be long term and not assignment specific. OTELP could also join a few related forums such as Rainfed Network, Watershed Forum to gain wider knowledge resource.

**10. Land and Water Management:** The watershed development activities undertaken in the project for soil and water conservation are largely of better quality and serving the purpose they have been promoted for. This is clearly visible in the Phase I project villages. The approach followed towards ridge to valley treatment has been beneficial in the project areas and this could be seen from the soil conservation in uplands and increase in water flow in the streams. There is a strong feeling among all the members (SMSs and F-NGOs) that the considerable reduction in shifting cultivation (*podu*) is a very good sign. **However, one needs to understand that *Podu* has been an integral livelihood support system of the tribal communities for decades and their main nutrition crop millets was mainly produced in this land type. Now with the reduction of *Podu*, which is a very good symbol for forest protection and regeneration, there is a strong need to understand whether the same is having some negative impact on the livelihoods of the tribals, mainly with relation to the nutrition. It is recommended that the team undertakes an internal detailed study on the impact (positive and negative)**

**of shifting cultivation mainly in the phase I villages. There is a strong need to understand the end results of shifting cultivation.** Land leveling is prominent activity seen across all the project areas, this has happened through the improved water availability by the interventions. The farmers are investing a lot of their human resource on the leveling process. However, there seems to be technical problem in the leveling process. **The farmers are cutting the slopes too straight, which later on could have problems of scouring or slides. Thus there is a need for the technical team to explain the farmers, the techniques of land leveling and terracing specifically.** The main problem lies in the hills, which are cut by the farmers to convert in agriculture fields and this to a large extent disturbs the hill stability. Thus, in the Phase I villages, wherein extensive land leveling and terracing is underway, there is immediate need to educate the farmers on the process and ensure that in the coming period there is no problem of land scouring in the project villages.

11. Water availability in project villages has improved and this is visible by the increase in groundwater baseflows. The farmers looking at the availability of water have gone in land improvement and vegetable promotion on a good scale. **However, the water management still seems to be an issue of concern.** There presently does not seem to be much focus on promoting better water management practices and it is a need to provide inputs to the farmers in terms of better use of land and water resources. Improving soil fertility and increasing the micro nutrients in the soil is very important to keep the soils alive. **The land preparation for agriculture, mainly vegetable along with flood irrigation is also leading to land erosion. Though not prominent presently, this could intensify as in some areas, the farmers are going for triple cropping. In such situation it is strongly recommended that water management concepts need to be introduced in the project areas (drip and sprinkler irrigation).** The VDCs could be made the resource agency by promoting this as a business enterprise and they also provide the technical know how for installation and management. **This can become a good IGA for the VDC as a whole.** There is a need to strongly focus on the land preparation and water management aspects in all the project villages as the availability of water resource has encouraged the farmers to go for intensive cropping.

12. The physical structures to be created in the project should be implemented systematically and with quality. The specific locations for structures should be defined both with the geological understanding as well as civil aspects. **Low cost water harvesting structures should be promoted at appropriate places and it is strongly recommended to develop understanding on the geology of the watershed, basically to know the recharge and discharge zones, which is very important to define the physical structures.** Some of the structures created in the Phase I watersheds do not seem to be created at relevant location. The structure meant for storage of water resource is helping in percolation and thus no water is available at the end of monsoon in the same. **Instead of using heavy amounts for concrete structures, the programme should work out promoting innovative and reliable physical structures.**

**13. Diversion based Gravity Resource Promotion: In all the project villages visited, the promotion of diversion based gravity flow water distribution (drinking water and irrigation) has done wonders. It could be clearly visible in terms of impact of such interventions both on health and hygiene as well as irrigation promotion.** The soil and water conservation resources have been able to augment the water availability at the source, which is now tapped to provide water to the community. The channels developed to carry the water in some villages are pucca ( concrete and underground PVC pipelines) and in some it is temporary canal system. **The mission would like to strongly recommend the promotion of diversion based irrigation and drinking water systems across all villages, wherever the potential is prominent. These systems need to be of permanent nature and the team needs to investigate and promote as far as possible the permanent solution for the gravity based**

**water supply (mostly piped water).** The temporary structures carrying the water resource need a lot of management, which may be difficult to manage by the User Groups. **Also there is a strong need to formalize such User Groups, as the informal nature though fine presently may not be advisable to continue. There needs to be defining of norms for water usage and also water use charges to be collected (per crop or per hour basis). The formal structure for the User Groups and its linkage with the VLSC/VDC would ensure long term sustainability of the created resources.** In the Phase II project villages, it is recommended to locate such resources right at the beginning of the project and implement them systematically. **As in the Phase I, the budget distribution for such resources was not systematically placed, it is suggested that such resources should be given maximum priority compared to the other physical activities in the project.** Promotion of such resources, which largely solve drinking water and irrigation issues, would create a major dent in the development process.

**14. Agriculture Development:** The programme as in most of the watershed focused programmes has been actively involved in promoting physical activities (soil and water conservation) in the first 4-5 years. With this focus, the core focus towards enhancing crop productivity has moved out of the radar of the teams substantially. Demonstrations undertaken in last 2 years with promotion of new crop varieties (in fairly small numbers) have shown encouraging results and seem to be the focus by the teams. There has been a definite positive output in terms of enhancing crop productivity especially in paddy through the project support and this has also led to increase in months of food security. **However, a strong feeling is that there needs to be extensive focus on the promotion of improved agriculture across all the project areas, especially the Phase I villages. The approach should be in form of a campaign mode towards promoting improved cultivation practices for enhancing productivity in main crops such as paddy, millet and niger.**

**15. Systems for Rice Intensification (SRI)** seem to be showing good results as the productivity has nearly doubled to the traditional practices. This now need to be expanded in a campaign mode across all locations (even in the Phase II villages) through strong planning process. The farmers need to be trained, exposed and provided with the necessary support system (weeders) to upscale the activity substantially. **The idea of promoting a service provider who has understood the methodology completely could be tried out in the project areas. The service providers could guide the remaining farmers in terms of the methodology adoption and inputs for pest problems and other aspects. This methodology could be easily adopted in their other crops such as millets (ragi, small millet, fox tail millet, sorghum, bajra, etc) and there could be substantial increase in yields, which will provide them year round nutritional food availability.** The production in main crops (paddy, millet and niger) needs to be stabilized with immediate effect and this could be only done through the promotion of SRI like methodology and introduction of improved seeds suitable to the region (only composite and self pollinated and not hybrid varieties). **There is also a need to develop a strategy towards seed storage. The present practice of seed storage normally damages them and also results in less germination. The systems of seed storage scientifically need to be introduced with the farmers so that quality seeds are always available for crop promotion.**

**16** The demonstrations for groundnut do not seem to be serving the purpose meant for. **The demos are not been undertaken systematically and the management of the plots is a major concern.** Across all the demonstration plots, there does not seem to be a system of doing the demos scientifically. **As the major purpose of demonstrations is to convince the larger community on adoption of certain crop types (in this case groundnut), this does not seem to be serving the purpose. It is strongly recommended that the demonstrations should play a major positive impact on the community and they need to be implemented accordingly.** Inputs from experts seem

to be limiting factor and this is then not reaching the community on timely basis. The purpose of demos is not at all only seed supply and this needs to be understood at all levels to ensure the desired impact in the field. This also calls for strong involvement of ICRISAT in promoting the demonstrations and upscaling the same across the project areas. Millets and Niger apart from paddy form the main crops in the region. Each household has lands under these crops and the lands are mainly the uplands and *podu* lands under such crops. There are nearly 4-5 types of millets grown by the farmers and millet seem to be an important component of their diet providing the nutrition. Paddy does not provide the desired nutrition and all of the nutrition comes from millets. Looking at this importance for millets in the region, it is highly recommended towards promoting a programme on millet promotion across the region. Such a focused programme would resolve the major problem of nutrition deficiency and improve the health situation. The core aspect of millet promotion should be seed promotion (improved quality) and improved cultivation practices such as **Systems for Millet Intensification (SMI)**.

**17 Vegetable cultivation** has picked up like anything with the advent of irrigation water. Most of the households have got themselves engaged in vegetable cultivation. With the promotion of vegetables new crops are being introduced and the concept of involving SHGs to take up vegetable nursery preparation and then selling the saplings to the farmers is doing quite well and this could be expanded across all areas. The problem presently lies in strengthening the farmers and SHGs in improved cultivation practices for the different vegetable varieties. **There is a strong need to promote good practice agriculture on vegetables and for this the farmers need to be exposed extensively along with building their capacities.** Farm management with vegetables is the most critical activity. Presently flood irrigation is leading to soil erosion in the vegetable fields and it is clearly visible that this may lead to erosion problems on large scale. **Thus there is a need to promote better land and water management practices. Promoting low cost drip irrigation (IDE) should be demonstration under Development Initiative Fund (DIF). The drum and bucket drip systems would help substantially in the vegetable fields (both in mainland and homestead).** There is a need for promoting and upscaling biocompost technologies across all the project areas. The remoteness of the project villages certify them to be by default organic and now with the introduction of vegetables, which have the major pest problems (brinjal, cauliflower, etc) there could be chances of chemical pesticides coming in the areas. It has already started in few villages and this may lead to similar problems of pesticide use as we see in the irrigated areas of the country. Therefore, promotion of biopesticides and organic composting technologies (vermicompost, compost pits, etc) needs to be taken up at war-footing level, as vegetables have already come up in the area in a good scale. Low cost vermicompost pits could be promoted, which cost not more than Rs. 500/structure.

**18 ICRISAT Linkages:** ICRISAT's partnership for the programme is one of the good steps to promote improved agricultural crop varieties in the rainfed regions. This fits in quite well with the mandate of ICRISAT. However, there seems to be a strong missing link with the partnership. One is not very much clear on the introduction of groundnut in the hilly tracts for the tribal communities. This is a totally new crop and is tried to be promoted as a leguminous crop. Overall it does not seem to be quite successful, at least the demonstrations are of low quality. It is strongly felt that as ICRISAT works on millets, the first programme would have been promoting improved varieties of millets. Simultaneously leguminous plants such as pigeon pea, black gram and chick pea could have been promoted on large scale in the last two years. This does not seem to be picking up and thus there is a strong need to look at the modifications in the approach towards working on key crops for the region and introducing new varieties for the same.

**19 Livestock Development and Management:** Across the projects the activity of promoting cattle health camps and vaccination has helped considerably towards reducing the animal deaths. The promotion of goateries among the SHGs as Income Generation Activity has also picked up as in all the SHGs, it was said to be the most demanding

activity. With the large scale promotion of goats among the SHGs, there is need to ensure the timely support system in terms of medical care to the animals. The para vets promoted under the project would need a lot of handholding and grooming. They also need to be linked to the VDCs, so that the service to the community as a whole is continued for long term. New varieties of goats and poultry are being promoted in the project (Sirohi buck and Banaraja poultry). Along with the introduction of new varieties, the project also needs to try out in improving the productivity and quality of local breeds. The introduction of Black Bengal would be more suitable to the area and this need to be undertaken systematically. Fodder promotion also needs to be enhanced substantially and the teams would also need to research on the use of the crop residue for the animals (mainly millet straws), maybe the options of promoting dual purpose crops could be worked upon (sorghum, maize, legumes), which could give crop produce as well as fodder for the cattle. There are various such varieties promoted and these could be utilized. The project also needs to look at the integrating the cattle within the farming system of the households and the main activity could be promoting better use of cattle manure in the farmlands and providing better fodder for the cattle. The fishery promotion seems to be moving in right direction. The project may try to introduce the fishery nursery preparation as IGA for some groups. The availability of water harvesting structures could be done for such nurseries, wherein the fingerlings could be bred and then provided to individual farmers for cultivation.

**20 Forestry Management and FRA:** The project villages selected under OTELP are mostly surrounded by forests (Reserved or Revenue). Nearly 20-30% land in each of the watershed comes under forest. The shifting cultivation undertaken in such forest lands has reduced substantially and the communities have also form a committee to manage the forests along with the forest department. There is a protection committee to look after the forests and ensure that no tree felling happens. However, there is still tree cutting in the areas, as could be seen within the watersheds for people carrying wood on heads (fresh cut trees). The JFM needs to be more proactive and also ensure that the forest department provides them proper recognition for management of the resources. Sensitization of the foresters needs to be done through the project to provide complete cooperation for the JFMs. There has been substantial focus on nursery promotion for forestry plants and the plantation has also been undertaken. However, in the forest land when the forest people undertake plantations, they do not seem to refer to the JFM committee in terms of species selection and other aspects. The forest department can adopt the SHGs to develop nurseries for their forest species and this could be an IGA also. The community also seems to be broadly afraid of the forest department and they fear of getting jailed, if they go for cultivation in forest lands. Mechanisms of NTFP collection from the forests and the linkages with the department need to be clearly defined. Presently there does not seem to be limited focus on such aspects. SHGs could also be encouraged to undertake nursery of NTFP species and these could be planted in the watershed areas as block plantations.

21 Under the FRA, the reactions are mixed as some community members have got the patta lands. There still is a major chunk of community (mainly landless) who have yet to receive their pattas and the documents have been submitted long back (Kalahandi example). The patta lands under FRA are being presently distributed to the community and under the project, such lands need to be identified and treated systematically. As such lands would mostly be the sloping lands; there is a need for defined soil conservation interventions for them. Promoting irrigation resources for such lands is also important, so that the farmers could earn better results.

**22. Horticulture Promotion:** The horticulture plantation mainly of mango is done on patches of fallow land (village fallows). The plantation seems to be good with the guard protection to each plant. The plantations seen were basically those planted in this monsoon, so the problem of survival is not an issue. It would be critical during summers to provide the irrigation support to the plantations and pitchers could be used for the same. This could become a good income generation activity for landless households for supplying the mud pitchers to the horticulture plantations. Plantations undertaken in slope lands need

to be well protected against soil erosion. Presently vetiver has been tried out, but the stone bunding on the downslope side of the plants would be more beneficial. These bunds would strengthen the slope and help in good growth of the plants. The team is suggested to visit the Wadi programme of BAIF in South Gujarat, which is in similar hilly terrain. The plantations are being carried out scientifically. It is strongly recommended that the plantations are not undertaken in places wherein bigger tree shadow could obstruct the growth of the horticulture plants. The horticulture promotion could be a mix of 2-3 species across the project areas, which are well suited to the region (mango, cashew, aonla, guava, etc). One of the best things happening is the linkage with NABARD under the Tribal Development Fund to promote Horticulture Development. Few organizations have already tied up with the programme. OTELP could play a strong role towards developing the partnership with NABARD to link all the project partners under the TDF and this could provide a great support to the programme in terms of promoting large scale horticulture and then looking towards the processing of the produce in the coming few years. Nursery raising by the SHGs is a very good income generating activity and they need to be trained in developing grafted varieties of different horticulture species. On the borders of the horticulture plots, the forestry species comprising of fuel wood and timber could be promoted. Best could be promoting some NTFP trees on the borders, which may produce in a period of 4-5 years. Intercropping within the horticulture plots is a must and should be undertaken with mainly leguminous plants such as black gram. Mulching activity needs to be promoted within the horticulture plots with the grasses and crop residue. Cashew processing units as seen in Gajapati should be expanded to become a good IGA for the SHGs

**23 Institutional Strengthening and Capacity Building:** Through the programme vibrant institutions have been promoted in all the micro watersheds. There have been strong efforts in strengthening these institutions. Capacity building trainings at all levels have been undertaken through resource person and the facilitating organizations. There still is a lot of scope to well define the approach towards capacity building of the community, more specifically the institutions promoted in the programme. Specific capacity building modules need to be developed for resource management, crop promotion (all seasons), book keeping, village planning, etc. There is a strong need to provide intensive trainings to the ITDA and F-NGOs, which should be a combination of field as well as class. Sending the teams outside the state for trainings is a good strategy, but it is felt that more emphasis could be laid towards imparting practical field trainings to the team members by the resource persons in well defined time frame. Cross learnings among the ITDA and F-NGOs, which needs to be well planned, itself would help in generating valuable knowledge resource and improve the quality of implementation in the field. The CBOs promoted in Phase I would need lots of hand holding support towards understanding the O&M of the resource base as well as placing them strongly in front of government agencies to take up work for their villages.

**24 Knowledge Management:** The Agricultural Resource Centres being promoted in the project villages seem to be quite a good idea. The proposed plans for creating knowledge centre with IEC material and agricultural implements are an excellent step to keep the community update on the cultivation practices. Now the team needs to develop quality IEC material in local language, mainly the farmer friendly PoP for different crops being undertaken. Few case studies of active farmers, who have done very good demonstrations could also be developed and placed in picture form as well as text. There is a need to ensure that the centres are functioning well and for this maybe an individual could be trained to take care of the resource centre and also promote the knowledge within the village. A local youth could play this role quite well. There is a need to ensure that the resources are created well before the promotion of the centres, otherwise they may be just like a storage room for implements and other things. It is also felt that the present cost per centre is too less (Rs. 6,000/village). There is a need to increase this budget or else the IEC material should be promoted from other resources and placed in the resource centre. The community mobilizers and WDT members need to be encouraged to write down small case

studies on their learnings in the respective projects. Such practices should be encouraged at scale and maybe the PSU organizes writeshops for the different stakeholders to capture good quality case studies and document them as knowledge documents. These resources would be quite valuable to the project.

**25 Targeting Landless and Most Vulnerable:** The core focus of the programme is working with most disadvantaged section of the community (ST&SC). This has been quite well achieved in the programme as nearly 70% of the population is the tribal communities and rest being the SCs. In the programme 23.48% hhs are landless and there have been steps to address the livelihood problems of these sections. IGAs have been promoted for these sections and in some cases; it has been supportive to provide them a livelihood resource base. The best thing happened has been the landless have got good opportunity to do wage labour during the physical implementation and have been able to earn on an average Rs. 25,000 in 3-4 years period of physical implementation. This money has been invested in purchase of assets (mainly gold). Now after the support for wage labour has been completed in the projects (Phase I), the landless seem to have come back to the same positions as they were before the project. Some of the landless households interviewed and within this landless household headed by a woman, gave not so good picture in terms of their livelihood promotion. These landless are still involved in wage labour for earning their livelihoods. There are plans to provide them with DIF, but it has yet to be streamlined and taken up at a scale. Goatery promotion is something, which has been planned across in terms of providing livelihoods to the landless. However, one needs to critically analyse the needs of the landless and develop plans to see how they could have quality livelihoods. Suggestions on the same would be developing livelihood plans for such households with activities such as goatery, entrepreneurships, pitcher making, honey bee promotion, etc. A lots still needs to be done to bring the landless and most vulnerable hhs actively in the programme and support their livelihoods. Focused approach towards this should be defined and implemented.

**26 Nutrition and Health:** The promotion of drinking water and sanitation across most of the project villages is one of the best things happening towards improving the health and hygiene. Such activities need to be undertaken across all the watersheds and converging the same with the Rural Water Supply-Sanitation should be actively taken up at all levels. The availability of water and sanitation facilities at the doorsteps has eased a lot of pressure on the women. In terms of nutrition, the promotion of vegetables in the homestead has helped to a large extent. The community has a good habit of growing various vegetables in the backyard to support in Kharif season and this is being streamlined through the project support by introducing new varieties. Suggestion is to bring in leafy vegetables with the kitchen garden ambit and promote the same on large scale. This would add a lot of nutritional support to the households. Apart, the staple food of millets is providing the households with nutrition. However, there has been no systematic process towards understanding how much is being taken by the households through their food habit as nutrition support. It is strongly recommended that the programme looks understanding the present food habits and nutritional intake and promoting strategies to introduce better nutrition through leafy vegetables, fruits, millet dishes, etc. This to a large extent will help in improving the nutritional status of the households, especially women and children.

**27 Piloting Few Innovations:** There are various innovative pilots, which the teams could try in their project areas and there is a need to encourage such innovations, which the team could come up with and pilot. Some of the innovations, which could be looked upon are:

Promoting the development of new dishes of millet with support of nutritional expert. This could be taken up as a pilot with the SHGs and introduced as a nutritional diet intake system for the households especially for the new born babies and mothers.

The region is by default organic with no application of pesticides and fertilizers in the fields. Now with the promotion of vegetables, there maybe problems of increase in chemical organic commodity promotion. Land Class Classification, cashew processing (boilers), honey bee promotion

**28. Conclusion and Key Recommendations:** Overall the programme since its beginning has been able to focus on the livelihood promotion of the ST&SC communities. The approach towards conservation and development of Natural Resources, along with promoting its utilization seems to be the apt approach towards resolving livelihood issues of the marginalized communities. The resource creation through watershed approach in the Phase I project villages has to some extent improved the agriculture development and promoted allied livelihood initiatives.

The programme could had looked towards developing innovative models of Integrated Watershed Development with modifications in guidelines meant for conventional watershed programmes. The terrain selected for programme implementation is hilly with an average annual rainfall exceeding 1,500 mm and thus the common approach of fixed costs and designed watershed area will not hold good to ensure the desired results of sustainable livelihood promotion. In the Phase I, the approach has been to focus on soil and water conservation treatments (this also has not been done in the complete watershed, which means the selected watershed is not treated completely) during the major project period. This resulted in thinking of the production enhancement systems along with sustainability strategy during the end stages of the project period. If the programme would had developed a comprehensive approach to look at resource creation and management simultaneously with the core focus on livelihood enhancement, then the results would had been encouraging along with opportunities to demonstrate quality models to replicate on large scale.

The programme should now in the Phase II project villages look up for demonstrating innovative and comprehensive models for livelihood promotion of the ST&SC communities. There are various examples of promoting the Integrated Natural Resource Management approach, which looks comprehensively towards resource creation and management. The teams should be exposed to such models for strong understanding and implementation in their respective areas. There is also a lot, which needs to be done towards enhancing the capacities of the team at different levels. A well defined system to train and expose the members (ITDA and F-NGOs) is needed and for this support from Resource Organizations (mainly known NGOs working on watershed development) should be roped in.

There is lots of scope for innovation in the programme and the flexibility approach as in most of IFADs programme should help a lot in promoting such innovations. The programme could be able to develop good quality models for Rainfed Areas, which cover maximum land in the country along with the most backward communities. The present approach of breaking the project period in defined phases should be looked upon critically. There actually needs to be an integration of activities right from beginning. The Exit Strategy should never come in the end of the project cycle, but should be looked upon right from the beginning and towards this the community strengthening efforts should be in place. The team should work together actively and the key roles lie with the social scientist, agriculturist and engineer to ensure that their roles are integrated with each other.

**The key recommendations to the teams based on the detailed field visits and interactions with different stakeholders are:**

- Promoting a Integrated Natural Resource Management based approach for watersheds with focus on developing quality models for rainfed areas

- Intensive and campaign mode focus on promoting agriculture production across the Phase I villages. Crop planning season wise should be undertaken along with the community and this should be implemented through the VDCs and SHGs.
- Improving fertility of uplands in all project areas, mainly the newly terraced lands through application of micronutrients, green manure and biocompost. These lands newly brought under cultivation should be enriched substantially.
- Ensuring the better use of irrigation resources by introducing low cost water management systems (drip and sprinkler systems) along with defining the formal structure to the various Water User Groups. The management of the resources should be well defined and institutionalized
- Promoting LEISA technology across the region to ensure that the chemical pesticides do not get much attention in this by default organic region
- Focus on promoting Paddy stabilization strategy through the introduction of SRI across all the MWSs along with intensifying focus on Millets and Niger across
- Upscaling low cost water harvesting measures such as 5% model, small farm ponds and diversion structures across the programme villages
- Initiating the development of detailed village level implementation maps with mapping of all treatment measures in different land types.
- Dual purpose crops for fodder and grains should be promoted to intensify animal husbandry.
- Promoting and strengthening of village youths as community resource persons or service providers to provide timely support to the community on all livelihood aspects. These youths should be merged within the institutional structure of VDCs or Cooperatives.
- NREGS linkages with good quality plans should be on priority for all the teams. The VDCs could be trained to develop the plans and approach the relevant government department.
- Partnerships with good resource organizations to provide quality inputs during programme implementation at all levels. There could be a consortium, which could be partnered with for support.
- Exposure to all the team members, with cross learnings among teams as well as to resource agencies within the region

## **Annexure I**

### **Excerpts from Interaction with Teams (PSU, ITDA, F-NGOs)**

- Low cost and easily maintainable land and water management structures should be promoted for better sustainability
- Focused capacity building inputs should be provided after completion of land and water management assets on its use for crop production
- Crop wise production enhancement plan should be prepared for the farmers of each asset created under land and water management projecting an income for atleast three years
- The production enhancement plan for both Kharif and Rabi season should be prepared in each village (with each farmer in the village) projecting the crop wise total land to be brought under cultivation and total volume of production to be achieved. This shall further be consolidated to identify the crop clusters and accordingly the backward and forward linkages could be planned.
- The business development plan should not be a precondition to access the credit from the revolving fund for agriculture purposes
- Demonstration of crops/practices/technologies should be done more systematically and each demonstration to be linked with a group of farmers for adoption with regular onfield supervision.
- Extension of on-farm and off-farm interventions should be made effectively through social marketing using IEC materials. Agriculture Resource Centres

(ARCs) promoted by the project should be used for this purpose by issuing regular crop bulletins centrally during each initial stage of cropping season

- Training to the farmers should be conducted through the farmers field schools or similar models instead of class room training. Atleast two lead farmers in each village should be identified and promoted to run the FFS effectively in their village
- More remuneration (at least 2 to 3 times more than the present) for WDT members in order to obtain and retain qualified and experienced personnel. Performance based annual increments or incentives may be considered. Well defined remuneration also for the SMS at ITDA level
- Additional WDT (engg.) for 3 years during the main implementation phase to ensure timely completion of works without compromising the quality.
- Delegation of administrative and financial power to FNGOs for approval of labour oriented works (e.g. bunds, trenches, land development etc.) to save considerable time.
- The Agriculture resource center should be at VLSC level and more funds are to be diverted for more equipments and IEC materials in stead of fixed amount of Rs.18,000/-.
- WDT accounts at FNGO level instead of FSA at FNGO level
- Funds under RFS and capacity building (for primary stake holders) are to be calculated on the basis of households/ SHGs in stead of per ha. cost.
- Focus on improving crop productivity in uplands which were earlier grown on hill slopes (shifting cultivation patches) to ensure food & nutritional security-in rain-fed condition
- Focus on diversification of cropping pattern- from paddy to cash crops (with improved variety of seeds with minimum chemical fertilizer) in irrigated conditions
- Introduction of low cost drip irrigation systems (drum kit/ bucket kit) in vegetable fields/ backyard garden to increase water use efficiency and better productivity.
- The treatment planning is to be integrated with land use planning/ crop planning.
- Village volunteers (to be selected from the community having skill & interest in respective fields) are to be intensively trained and viewed as service provider and their remuneration should be from the community and not from the project.
- Establishing mechanism for collection of user's fee only for irrigation/ drinking water structures without formalizing the distribution mechanism, as they are having a sustainable distribution mechanism.
- Emphasis on Cross learning- within & outside the projects
- Developing training modules on different themes by PSU
- Federation of VDCs at FNGO level with concrete guidelines for utilization of village development fund
- Strengthening the SHGs and their systems through regular trainings. Quality book keeping and making the SHGs understand on financial transactions and use of funds is very important. There are local literate youths (8<sup>th</sup> to 12<sup>th</sup> pass) who could be trained to write the books for the SHGs along with doing the internal audits on regular basis.

## Annexure II

**Meeting with ITDA – Kalahandi and F-NGOs (Antodaya, Gram Vikas and Gramin Vikas Trust):** On 4<sup>th</sup> during the first half of the day a meeting was organized with the members of ITDA and F-NGOs working in the 2 blocks (TH Rampur and ----) of Kalahandi. The head ITDA presented the overall progress of the district during 2009-10. However there were many gaps in the presentation as it was not compared with the annual work plan for the year 2009-10 and also with the work done in the previous years. There were also problems in some data information overall. Here also lots of focus was given on numbers and those also mostly analysed on the FNGO basis. It would have been better to focus intensively on the CBOs promoted in the project and build on the presentation across

the same. Think there is a strong need to improve upon the communication aspect among the ITDA (though a few were good in communication)

The presentations from the Subject Matter Specialists (SMS) also were not much convincing overall. The framework used for the presentation was unable to provide the mission the targets set and also compare with the information for previous years in the programme. Just to give an example, the agriculture SMS presented the impact in terms of increased area brought under each crop. However he did not have any information on the total crop area under each crop type during particular season. In such a scenario it was difficult to analyse the actual improvement if any has happened through the project.

The FNGOs presentation was broadly good, wherein they also focused on the numbers in terms of achievements and targets achieved. Again there was no opportunity to compare with the actual plans and earlier years. They focused on the activities undertaken (mostly in numbers) and financial utilizations.

Apart from Antodaya, no other member in the team was able to place the learnings and issues from the programme in Phase I. Based on the detailed discussion on this front, various issues came up and those seem to be of serious nature for the programme.

- The first point which came up was on the retention of staff members at the WDT with the FNGOs.
- Trainings provided to the WDT with FNGOs seem to be less. Specific example is Veterinary, yet to be appointed
- Delays in payment system to the VDCs and then to the community members for the work done
- Forest Right Act conversion of the lands in name of the community is the most poorest in the region. For last 3 years they have filed the requests and still there has been not result on the same.
- Fundings seem to be less for specific activities

**Meeting at ITDA, and F-NGOs (SWWS, JKP, PEACE, GRAM VIKAS and CCD):** On 8<sup>th</sup>, a meeting with all the members of ITDA and key members of F-NGOs was organized to get a overall understanding on progress in the last year. The District Collector chaired the meeting for some time and provided his inputs in terms of the opportunities for convergence being looked upon (the DC was earlier the Head of ITDA). In the meeting the teams presented the progress during the year with main focus on the quantified information resource. The organizations also presented on the progress in their respective project, but main focus in all the presentations was on providing quantified data rather than looking at the learnings and issues during project implementation.

## Tribal Development & Empowerment

Vincent Darlong

### INTRODUCTION

1. Orissa has one of the largest variety of tribal communities (62 tribes, forming about 22% of state population) which are at various stages of socio-economic development. At one extreme are the groups which lead a relatively secluded and archaic mode of life, keeping their core culture intact, while at the other extreme there are communities which are almost indistinguishable from the general agricultural communities. The OTELP works in 7 districts (Koraput, Malkangir, Nabarangpur, Kalahandi, Kandhamal, Rayagada and Gajapati) in selected blocks where the tribal population is fairly high but are generally with very low human development index. These districts have tribal groups that are considered to be particularly vulnerable, officially designated as PTGs, such as the Bondas, Lanjia Saora, etc., while others such as Kandha, Saora, Bhumi, Gadaba, Paraja are somewhat agricultural communities with dependency on forest products. The five districts with lowest level of human development are Malkangiri, Kandhamal, Gajapati, Koraput and Nabarangpur<sup>4</sup>.

2. The present report is based on the secondary data provided by the project as well as discussions with OTELP, ITDAs, FNGOs and interactions with the communities during the field visits in 3 districts, viz. Koraput, Malkangiri and Nabarangpur. The broad contour of 'tribal development' under OTELP are envisaged by achieving two key objectives of empowerment and livelihoods security/improvement.

3. Empowerment in OTELP is both process oriented and action oriented. While empowerment is really achieving rightful social justice, empowerment as both process-oriented and action-oriented could be understood from different dimensions. From tribal development perspectives, at least four different categories of empowerment are critical, viz. (a) Social empowerment; (b) Political empowerment; (c) Economic empowerment; and (d) Gender empowerment. The tools to measure Tribal Empowerment in the Project Villages have to be designed. We may also say that empowerment will happen due to (i) Socio-economic Development and (ii) Legal and Constitutional Provisions.

4. **Social empowerment.** OTELP has achieved the first step of social empowerment by emphasising to reach out to those who are socially excluded and marginalized. These include the Landless, Women, and Poorest of the Poor, Physically Challenged, PTGs and other vulnerable persons and women-headed households. The Project terms these categories as destitute. Social empowerment in tribal perspectives could also mean broad spectrum of processes and activities that ensure economic, political, and gender empowerment with equity and justice along with proper appreciation of rights and entitlements.

5. **Economic empowerment.** Economic empowerment can be seen in terms of increase in the Household Income, Savings of the SHGs, Village Development Fund and mobilization of Resources for Development Interventions other than the ones envisaged in the Project. It can also be seen in the context of land allotment to the landless under various provisions of the central and state acts. Access to credits, finance,

---

<sup>4</sup> Orissa Human Development Report, Govt of Orissa & UNDP, 2005.

banks, goods and services of the government and other agencies are all part of the measurable components of economic empowerment.

6. **Political empowerment.** Political empowerment is related to the numbers of people from various CBOs like VDCs, SHGs etc. who have been elected to the Panchayats as Panchayati Raj Institution (PRI) functionaries as a result of social empowerment. The extent of participation of the communities from the Project Villages in the Panchayat Gram Sabhas and Palli Sabha could be indicative of the political empowerment. Peaceful and democratic ways of demanding their rights and entitlements could also be considered as the processes of political empowerment.

7. **Women's empowerment.** As part of the empowerment processes, the OTELP is also mandated to demonstrate the various processes and strategies for the women empowerment. The Women's Empowerment Process is measured in terms of their representation in VDCs, WDCs, and CFMECs etc. apart from their overwhelming presence in the SHGs. It is heartening to see that many of the women are in the VDCs as also in the local governance or Panchayats. Many of the women are also engaged as community health volunteers and community mobilizers, besides assisting the SHGs as Book Writers. The women's voice continue to be strong in anti-liquor campaigns, forest protection, sanitation, health awareness, etc.

8. The Project has not been able to document the Empowerment of the tribal Communities in the context of the structural relationships within the village and in the Panchayat. However, the Project is closely working with the Integrated Tribal Development Agency in addition to having close linkages with tribe-specific development agencies such as the Bonda Development Agency in Malkangiri district.

9. The Legal Education of the tribal communities could be another important component of the Empowerment Process. OTELP does not appear to have given due importance on legal education, which could have been patronized much under the policy initiatives component of the programme.

10. The Process of Empowerment could also get reflected in the Conflict Resolutions. The Project has not indicated any conflict within the villages or outside. The Conflicts are generally associated with the Leadership, Governance and Management of Resources and Decision Making Processes. This means that the empowerment process has been smooth and effective.

11. The Process of Tribal Empowerment is going on in the Project Villages in multiple ways – by a) including those who are Socially Excluded like the PoPs, PTGs, b) Socio-economic development, c) Resource planning, d) Gender Empowerment, e) Participation in Local Self Government and by f) Constitutional Provisions ( PESA, NREGA, RTI, FRA etc ) and National Tribal Policy. SHGs have given the women both social and economic empowerment. Till date 3732 SHGs have been formed with cumulative savings of INR 719 lakhs, of which INR 436 lakhs alone were mobilized since the last JRM. As a result the Average Household Income has also gone up by about 50-80% higher on an average.

12. In order to sustain the Empowerment of the Tribals, what is needed is the strong presence of the Community Leaders, preferably supported or backed by appropriate NGOs and ITDAs. The ITDA should interface and facilitate more with OTELP in nurturing the leadership among the tribal communities. Unfortunately, much remains to be done by the Project in promoting, mentoring and nurturing the emerging leaderships among the tribals with appropriate attention both for quality of leadership development among the communities and also having interface with NGOs, Panchayats, Govt Departments to sustain the efforts of empowerment.

## TRIBAL ENTITLEMENTS/RIGHTS

13. **Land Right.** The Land Rights of the Tribals are very fundamental in nature as the Sustainable Livelihood and Culture and Identity issues can be largely associated with the issue. The base-line data suggested that the extent of landlessness in the Project Villages is about 24-27%. In fact, as much as 70% of tribals in programme villages could own less than standard acre of cultivable land. The Project needs to carefully understand whether the existing land laws in the state sufficiently protect the tribal land vis-à-vis the operation of the Land Acquisition Act and Tenancy Act etc. particularly in emerging situations where lands are being acquired for mining and other industrial development despite PESA. It is recommended that the Project should keep a Tab on the Land Transfer and Alienation in all the Project Villages and prepare a status report to indicate how the issue of Landlessness is taken up. The Project should also vigorously follow up for provision of land to the landless under the various land acts and schemes of the Govt of Orissa.

14. **NTFP.** The Non-Timber Forest Products (NTFPs) help in sustaining the rural lives for half the long drawn year, particularly among the tribal populations in Orissa. The NTFPs policies in Orissa are regulated or de-regulated by the NTFP (Procurement and Trade) Policy 2000 and the Orissa Grama Panchayats (Minor Forest Produce Administration) Rules, 2002. The NTFP Policy of 2000 vests on the *Gram Panchayats* (GPs) the authority to regulate the purchase, procurement and trade so that the primary gatherers get a 'fair price for the NTFPs gathered by them'. Although kendu, bamboo and sal seeds continue to be under government monopoly, 68 other NTFPs, such as tamarind, honey, myrabolans, etc, have been kept under the control of *Panchayats* throughout the State. There would be no requirement of trade and transit permit, no levies and no royalties for these 68 items. The new policy abolished the 'leasing system' and *Panchayats* were given the power to register the traders at local level and to monitor their function especially with regard to price.

15. In order to ensure the payment of fair procurement prices of the NTFP to the primary gatherers, Government of Orissa on 12th October 2001 has brought out a resolution (No.16467/F&E dated 12.10.2001) relating to price fixation mechanism of the NTFP. The resolution came out as a modification over the earlier notification dated 9th July 2001 (Notification No.20665/SSD) through which the existing state level price fixation committee was dissolved and instead a system of price fixation at the district level has been introduced. The resolution says that the District Collector is empowered to fix the minimum procurement prices with respect to all the NTFP items including 68 Minor Forest Products. In this regard District Collector shall consult DFO (Territorial), District Panchayat Officer, District Welfare Officer, Local representative of TRIFED, the local representative of the Orissa Forest Development Corporation Ltd. and the local representative of the Women and Child Development Department. Although the above changes made are quite encouraging, it is too early to assess its efficacy for which it has been made.

16. The abolishment of monopoly control of the state with the enactment of NTFP (Procurement and Trade) Policy in 2000 besides raising aspirations and hopes among the primary collectors for an enhanced income, it was also expected to meet the spirit of PESA (Extension of Panchayati-raj to Scheduled Areas; one of the progressive Act conferring rights and authority of management of local natural resources to Gram Panchayats) by empowering the Gram Panchayats (lowest unit of self-governance) in regulating procurement and trading of NTFPs.

The Gram Panchayats were conferred with the authority to regulate the trade of NTFPs. However, in the absence of supportive actions by the state such as, creation of market yard and storage infrastructure, establishment of market information system, technical & financial strengthening of Panchayati-raj Institutions (PRIs), achieving the outlined objectives of the policy has been a distant reality. Further, the policy relating to some

NTFPs which assumes utmost significance from the perspective of providing livelihood to the poor continues to be revenue oriented. All these demystify the so called 'de-regulation' intention and pro-poor/pro-tribals commitment of the state. OTELP has also promoted Collective Marketing for certain NTFPs (such as Hill broom, Karanja, Mahua). However, field experiences showed that much needs to be done as even under the changed policy environment, NTFP collectors remained marginalized, deprived of fair incomes and continue with an insecure livelihood.

17. It is recommended that OTELP should carry out massive awareness education on the various provisions of the NTFP policy 2000 and other relevant rules and regulations of forest produces and products. In convergence and collaboration with the ITDAs and other government line agencies, OTELP should facilitated in creation of supportive actions for NTFPs and other tribal products such as creation of market yard and storage facilities and establishment of market information system along with technical support to the communities for strengthening CBOs and PRIs.

18. **FRA.** The Project has tried to mobilize the villages to settle forest land under the Forest Land Rights Act (FRA) in many villages. Forest Land Rightht Act is a landmark Act to mitigate the historic injustice on the tribals. The OTELP should monitor on a regular basis the status of the enforcement of the FRA in the programme villages and should keep the details of the application filed from each of the programme villages. The Local NGOs should be given the responsibilities to ensure the implementation of the FRA. The NGOs the JRM met did not discuss this issue . At the Dist. Level, there should be regular networking meetings to monitor the progress of the implementation of FRA. If required, the Project should provide Legal Aid to tribals who may be needing it to get the Forest Land. It is recommended that all eligible families get Pattas as per the provisions of FRA.

19. **PESA.** It is important that the VDAs, VDCs, VLSCs etc promoted by OTELP should have greater organic linkages with the Palli Sabha / Panchayats. OTELP and NGOs have to facilitate that all these CBOs work in a concerted manner to strengthen PESA. Under PESA, the decisions taken by the Gram Sabha/Palli Sabha of the Panchayat have a lot of bearing on the implementation of various Govt. Schemes like NREGS, BRGF, NHM and a host of schemes supported by the Govt. of India and Govt. of Orissa for Planning, Implementation and Monitoring. The Project should encourage the CBOs and NGOs to organize the Social Audits to ensure transparency and accountability as per the provision of PESA. The Key Challenges are to ensure effective the functioning of Palli Sabha/Gram Sabha and raise relevant issues. For this, 100% participation of the members is required which has not been possible so far. It is recommended that empowerment of tribals should be aligned with the provisions of the PESA through massive awareness and legal education programmes.

20. **Targeting.** The OTELP should carefully review if all the identified poor households have been included in the CBOs particularly the SHGs. Field visits and interactions indicate that in some programme villages OTELP could be doing better in targeting for which the facilitating NGOs also require appropriate sensitization. The overall requirements are the need (a) to Consolidate of Watershed Activities with Mobilisation of Resources from Government and other Sources; (b) to build up local Institutions involving capable people from the VDCs, VDAs, SHGs, as well as to transform many of them as Service Providers; (c) to have more Rights-based Lobbying and Advocacy in support of the Tribals for more Empowerment and Entitlement.

21. **PTGs.** The interventions for the PTGs appear to be almost similar to the interventions for any other advanced tribal communities. It is recommended that since the PTGs are special groups of tribals, OTELP may review its interventions for the PTGs and also attempt more alignments and convergence with PTG specific development agencies (such as Bonda Development Agency) of the Government of Orissa so that such

agencies are influenced to adopt and replicate the best practices of OTELP in tribal empowerment and development.

22. **Internal Displacement and Distress Migration.** The scale of distress migration has gone down after the OTELP intervention. It livelihood options of the people have increased. From its base-line, OTELP may also follow up village wise records of distress migration. OTELP may also prepare document to indicate potential tribal areas within the programme villages that might come under future mining and industrialisation in order to address potential future internal displacement. The functionaries of PRIs also needs more capacity building to understand and act under the provisions of the PESA to safeguards their interest.

23. **Conflict Resolution and Peace Building.** The OTELP in its presentation and documents has not raised any issue of political and ideological conflicts, although reported Maoist movement in certain blocks under Koraput district. However, it is important to follow up if there would be any potential conflicts over Natural Resource Management, Leadership, Decision Making Process, sharing of benefits, equity issues, etc.

24. **Convergence.** The Mission during its visit to the Villages has noted down the efforts for Convergence. In almost all villages, there have been some activities undertaken through NREGS. However, potential for convergence with NREGS, NRHM, NRLM, NHM, ITDAs, various line departments of the GoO remained grossly under explored or under utilized in which OTELP and facilitating NGOs could do more. However to have successful implementation of NREGs, the areas that require more intense follow up includes:

- ◆ Job Cards to all the deserving Households
- ◆ Demanding Work like Land and Water Management/Watershed Management (Land Development, Tank, Canal, Wells etc.) in Gram Sabha/Palli Sabha as NREGS is demand driven. Also demand work for development of private agricultural land.
- ◆ Demand more works under horticulture and forestry plantations.
- ◆ Dialogue with Panchayat pradhans to mobilize NREGS in favour of those who need employment.
- ◆ Make an effort for 100 days of employment; demand for payment when works cannot be allotted as per existing rules.
- ◆ Ensure timely payment.
- ◆ Organize Social Audit for transparency.

## CONCLUSION

25. *Achieving empowerment and enhancing livelihoods are the core aspects of tribal development in the present programme. The action areas for empowerment are inclusion of socially excluded disadvantaged groups such as the landless, women-headed households and the PTGs/PVTGs; socio-economic development, natural resource development, gender equity and empowerment, participation in Local Self Government and implementation of various Constitutional provisions such as those envisaged in PESA, NREGA, RTI, FRA as well as allotment of land to the landless under the provisions of the various land Acts and schemes of the Government of Orissa (such as OPLEA, OGLSR, Vasundhara and Mo Jami Mo Dhia). Evidence of political empowerment is seen in the process of participation of members from VDCs, SHGs, etc. in the Palli Sabha and statutory Panchayats, thereby strengthening PESA. Resources need to be mobilized from NREGS, BRGF, NHM, NRLM, etc. for substantially. These processes can be further strengthened by expanding coverage of SHGs and federating them, mobilizing and converging resources from government schemes at the Panchayat, ensuring 100 days' employment under NREGS to every eligible individual (against current average of 20-30*

days only), ensuring timely land *pattas* under FRA to all the eligible families, ensuring job cards for all, securing social welfare schemes (eg. old age pension) for all the eligible elders and networking the various service providers and volunteers in and across villages. Also, more specialised attention is needed for the PTGs along with convergence with specialised agencies such as the Bonda Development Agency. Overall, the tools to measure Tribal Empowerment in the Project Villages are to be designed adequately and in an appropriate manner.

## SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

26. The following recommendations of the Mission may be addressed by OTELP on priority basis:

- 1) **General.** OTELP may design an innovative tool or methodology to measure Tribal Empowerment in the Project Villages, including women empowerment; use the tool to measure the processes and achievements of empowerment.
- 2) **Legal literacy.** OTELP may design a broad strategy and curriculum for enhancing the legal literacy of the tribal communities particularly on PESA, FRA, land rights, RTI, land acts and schemes (OPLEA, OGLSR, Vasundhara, Mo Jami Mo Dhia) and also increase awareness on various provisions and schemes of the Central and State Govt (particularly on NREGS, BRGF, NHM, NRLM, NHM, etc.).
- 3) **Documentation.** OTELP may design a monitoring and tracking system of information on (a) land allotment to landless under OPLEA, OGLSR, Vasundhara, Mo Jami Mo Dhia; (b) land under FRA; (c) data on distressed migration; (d) data on internal displacement (due to social conflicts and developmental consequences); (e) tribal and landless youths being trained and gainfully employed.
- 4) **PTGs.** OTELP may review its current interventions on the PTGs whether or not more specialized and innovative interventions are needed for this section of most vulnerable tribal communities as compared to the rest of the slightly advanced tribal communities. A specialized socio-economic status survey may also be done for the PTGs.

.....

## **Climate Change**

**K.S. Murali**

### **Impacts of Climate Change**

1. Global warming poses threats to weather systems and more so for the pattern of monsoon. The monsoon in the Indian context is very important as 72% farmers are dependent on monsoons. Any change in the country's rainfall pattern impacts agriculture and hence the country's economy and food security. Yet global warming poses serious threats to the weather system that is known for its uncertainty and makes it more undependable. This can potentially affect millions of small, marginal and poor farmers and all those who depend on agriculture in the country. IFAD supporting and investing on agriculture projects worldwide and in India must effectively address climate change impacts on its projects and suggest options for its mitigation.

2. The following climate changes will occur in the next 50 years:

- The average surface temperature will rise by 2-4 °C
- Marginal changes in rainfall expected in monsoon months
- Large changes during non-monsoon months
- Number of rainy days set to decrease by more than 15 days
- Intensity of rains projected to increase by 1-4 mm/day
- Cyclonic storms likely to increase in frequency and intensity.

3. It is predicted that the semi-arid regions of Western India are expected to receive higher than normal rainfall as temperatures soar while Central India will experience a decrease between 10 to 20 percent in winter rainfall by the 2050s. Though there may be disputes about the forecasting models and the accuracy of the predictions but in many parts of the country, the impacts of climate change are already being felt. Two of the most obvious impacts are on agriculture and health. Other impacts will be on biodiversity, especially the coastal and mountain eco-systems that have the potential of affecting the large human populations dependent on them.

### **Agriculture**

4. Agriculture will not only be affected adversely by an increase or decrease in the overall amounts of rainfall but also by the shifts in the timing of precipitation. Agriculture will be worse affected in the coastal regions where agriculturally fertile lands are vulnerable to inundation and salinisation. Standing crops in these regions are more likely to be damaged due to cyclonic activity. In Rajasthan, a 2°C rise in temperature was estimated to reduce production of pearl millet by 10-15 %. Changes in the soil, pests and weeds brought about by climate change will also affect agriculture in India. For instance, the amount of moisture in the soil will be affected by changes in factors such as precipitation, run-off and evaporation.

5. Creation of irrigation potential has been a major key to India's agricultural development, production stability and food security. Apart from the monsoon rains, India has depended on the Himalayan rivers for centuries for its water resource development. Temperature increases associated with global warming will increase the rate of snow melting and consequently snow cover will decrease. In the short term, this may increase water flow in many rivers that may in turn lead to increased frequency of floods, especially in systems where water carrying capacity has decreased due to sedimentation. In the long run, however, a receding snow line would result in reduced water flow in the rivers. Under the climate change scenario, the onset of summer monsoon over India is

projected to be delayed and often uncertain. This will directly affect not only the rainfed crops but water storage too, placing stress on the irrigation water. Since the availability of water for agriculture would have to face tremendous competition for alternate uses, agriculture would be under greater strain.

6. Practically all soil processes important for agriculture are directly affected by climatic factors. Changes in precipitation patterns and amount and temperature can influence soil water content run-off and erosion, workability, temperature, salinisation, biodiversity, and organic carbon and nitrogen content. Changes in soil water induced by global climate change may affect all soil processes and ultimately crop growth. An increase in temperature would also lead to increased evapo-transpiration, resulting in the lowering of ground water table in places. Increased temperature along with reduced rainfall may lead to upward water movement, causing accumulation of salt in upper soil layers.

7. Organic matter content, already rather low in most parts of the county, will continue to remain low but climatic change through temperature and precipitation mediated processes may affect its quality. An increase of 1°C in the soil temperature may lead to higher mineralization but nitrogen availability for crop growth may still decrease due to increased gaseous losses. Biological nitrogen fixation under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> may show an increase provided other nutrients are not strongly limiting. The change in rainfall amount and frequency, and wind may alter the severity, frequency and extent of soil erosion. These changes may further compound the direct effects of temperature and CO<sub>2</sub> on crop growth and yield.

8. As such, most crops in India, even in irrigated environments, are very sensitive to climatic variability. Climatic variability considerably affects the nation's food security, despite the impressive development of the irrigation potential. In the field and regional situations it is not easy to quantify the impact of climatic variation on food production due to the impact of the changing technologies used. India had a record harvest of 75.5 Mt wheat in 1999-2000 an increase of 5 Mt over 1998-2000, with almost the same technology level. The change was largely due to the cool weather during January to March 2000 that was favourable to grain formation and filling. Such variations in food production would be much larger in paddy, pulses and oilseeds, where a large portion of the cropped area is rainfed. The gluts and shortages of rice, onions and potatoes in recent times, apart from policy and mismanagement, could be due to the effects of climatic variability.

9. According to the National Communication, agriculture productivity will be affected due changes in temperature and rainfall, Rise in CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in atmosphere and increased occurrence of pests and disease. Wheat yield is projected to decline from 4 percent to 24 percent in different regions; while rice yield will generally decrease with the rise in temperature. The doubling of CO<sub>2</sub> and warming (3°C) accompanied with reduction in rainfall will lead to reduction in yields of several dry-land crops and the loss in farm-level net revenue is predicted. There is a serious danger that climate change in the form of more extreme droughts, floods and storms, sea level rise and more intense rainfalls will undermine development interventions, millennium development goals and increase poverty.

### **Adaptation: The Approaches and the Issues**

10. Adaptation in natural or human systems is "a response to actual or expected climate stimuli or their effects, which moderates harm or exploits beneficial opportunities". Adaptation is a broad concept and can be used in a variety of ways. Adaptation to the (expected) negative impacts of climate change generally takes place in two ways: anticipatory (before the impacts take place) and reactive (as a response to initial impacts). In natural systems, adaptation is reactive by definition. In human systems adaptation can be both anticipatory and reactive and can be implemented by

public and private actors. Private actors include individuals, households, communities, commercial companies and other actors such as NGOs. Public actors include government bodies at all levels.

11. It is important to the understanding of adaptation are the notions of disaster risk reduction (DRR) and contextualizing vulnerability within it. DRR, simply put, relates to the people and institutions involved in preparedness, mitigation and prevention activities associated with extreme events. These include hazard forecasting and immediate relief efforts for major disasters resulting from floods, cyclones and, in some cases, pollution events.

12. In relation to climate change, vulnerability relates to direct effects such as more storms, lower rainfall or sea level rises that lead to displacement and to indirect effects such as lower productivity from changing ecosystems or disruption to economic systems. With the poor being more directly dependent on ecosystem services and products for their livelihoods, the vulnerability of natural systems has profound implications. Any consideration of the need for adaptation to help poor communities to adjust to the effects of climate change must take account of all of these different forms of vulnerability. Of course, exactly how climate change impacts will affect different people in different places is largely unknown—one of the many uncertainties that surround the climate change debate. This is because of the uncertainties inherent in specifying these impacts and because the vulnerability of people will be affected by many things beyond climate change.

13. Central to the understanding of vulnerability is the concept of resilience. The resilience of poor people represents their ability to withstand the impact of the abovementioned trends and shocks absorbing them while maintaining function. Resilience varies greatly from household to household even in one locality. It is determined by two characteristics of peoples' livelihoods: the assets they possess and the services provided by external infrastructure and institutions. Both the assets and the services are extremely broad in their scope. Assets include the amount and quality of knowledge and labour available to the household, the physical and financial capital they possess, their social relations and their access to natural resources. External services includes those provided by flood control, coastal protection and other infrastructure, transport and communications, access to credit and financial systems, access to markets, emergency relief systems and others. For many poor people in developing countries, access to these external services is extremely limited, so that their resilience is in large part a reflection of the local asset base. Strategies to strengthen the resilience of communities, and specially poor communities, should be based on the most effective combination of measures to secure and enhance the community's asset base and measures to provide improved external services. What is the best balance in any one place needs to be determined through effective assessments of local needs and capabilities.

### **Orissa and its vulnerability to Natural disasters**

14. Orissa is a state on the eastern seaboard of India, located between 17° 49' and 22° 36' North latitudes and between 81° 36' and 87° 18' East longitudes. Though there are no specific climate change impact studies made in Orissa, Orissa often faces onslaught of natural disasters, particularly the drought, floods and cyclones. Orissa has experienced 17 floods, 19 droughts and 7 cyclones since 1965. The losses of human lives and assets have been associated with these disasters. The loss of assets and properties has been ever increasing. An estimate indicates that the property loss during 1971 was to the tune of 105 crores and it is seven times higher in 1980 and almost 10 times higher in 1990. Western Orissa has been chronically drought prone but over the years, Bolangir districts did not face a drought as they managed forests and water harvesting structures. Such experiences need to be replicated across other districts for

preparedness and adaptation. However, they still need to face the aridity scenarios that might affect agriculture productivity due to climate change. Floods are another concern for Orissa with 482 km long coast line that often experiences cyclones and storm surges. Super cyclone that hit Orissa during 1999 resulted in unprecedented loss of lives and property. The total loss was estimated at Rs 50,000 crore. Orissa being a coastal state and already facing the natural disaster such as floods and drought may have to gear itself to address the sea-level rise arising out of global warming.

15. About 70 percent of the total cultivated areas in the state are prone to drought. These areas lack not only irrigation facilities but also receive scanty rainfall. In some areas, rainfall, though plenty, is erratic. The severity of drought is measured by crop cutting experiment, and accordingly declaration of drought area is made. Though Orissa receives an average annual rainfall of around 1,500 mm, there are wide variations from year to year. Less than 1,100 mm of rainfall occurred seven times since 1951—in 1965, 1974, 1976, 1979, 1987, 1996, and 2002. All these are marked as severe droughts years, wherein the drought caused considerable reduction in kharif rice production. This suggests that there is at least one severe drought year in every decade, thus underlining a high degree of vulnerability of the state to drought.

16. Like drought, flood is also a major concern for Orissa. The state has a number of major rivers – Mahanadi, Brahmani, Baitarani, Rushikulya, Vansadhara, Budhabalanga, Subarnarekha, and others. Heavy rains in the upper catchment area as well as unusual rainfall in different districts cause flood in all major river systems of the state. Floods cause heavy damages to life and property. The problem is further accentuated when flood synchronises with high tides. This is because during high tide it becomes difficult for floodwater to enter into the sea, thereby affecting coastal areas heavily.

17. Floods and drainage congestion affect the lower reaches along the Subarnarekha River. Rivers Rusikulya, Vansadhara, and Budhabalanga also cause occasional floods. The entire coastal belt is prone to storm surges, which are usually accompanied by heavy rainfall, thus making the estuary region vulnerable to both storm surges and river flooding. A few districts, in west Orissa, occasionally face flash floods too.

18. Orissa suffered from a series of heavy cyclones, mostly occurring during September–November, with the worst sufferer being Balasore district. Before independence, a major cyclone occurred on 22 September 1885 (with a loss of around 5,000 human lives), another on 31 October 1931 (killing around 20,000 human beings, mostly in Balasore), and two in October and November 1942. Being repeatedly devastated by cyclone, the people of coastal Orissa made little effort to cope with disaster and were to see their economic condition deteriorate day by day. Recently the state has faced two severe cyclones: one in 1971 and the other in 1999, the latter being so severe that it has been termed as Super Cyclone.

#### **Disaster Management in Orissa**

19. A number of initiatives have been taken by the state through planned interventions to combat natural disasters. During the First Five-Year Plan, river valley projects were initiated and Flood Control Boards constituted for major river basins like Mahanadi and Brahmani to counter flood hazards. To mitigate the impact of drought, the Drought Prone Area Programme (DPAP) was introduced in the early 1970s. In the cyclone prone areas, Early Warning System (EWS), cyclone shelters, and other protective measures have been introduced, particularly after the devastation of the 1999 Super Cyclone in the state.

20. In the 1990s, the frequency of drought declined, but a major drought occurred in 1996. The drought of 1996 focused attention on the need for employment assurance, and as a result, the Employment Assurance Scheme (EAS) was introduced. Some of

these programmes were, however, ad-hoc in nature and did not have a long-term perspective.

21. Long-term measures included DPAP that did not have much success mostly due to lack of an integrated approach. The watershed development approach, based on community participation, appears to be an appropriate approach to tackle droughts.

22. According to one view (Pradhan 2003), the annual rainfall has no relation to drought. The annual rainfall may be more than adequate but if it is not equally distributed during different seasons, there is every possibility of crop failure. This also reinforces the argument for revival of community based traditional water harvesting structures. In Orissa, since more than two-thirds of the cultivable land is utilised for paddy, drought usually refers to failure of paddy crop. Several types of traditional paddy varieties were cultivated in the state in the past. Some of them had better climatic and regional adaptability and reduced risk of crop failures. However, varieties of paddy have considerably got reduced in recent times. High-yielding and high input varieties, usually, have risk of crop failures.

### **Strategies for Adaptation:**

22. Though the strategies specifically for flood, drought and cyclones are being made and continuously being amended, but these measures may have to be designed to address climate change related disasters. In this regard, many measures could be undertaken depending on local conditions and locally available infrastructure

23. Development of alternative livelihood options:

- Diversification of livelihood activities, based on local resources, value addition, marketing and skill development. These options could include ecosystem management and livelihood option in addition to agro-processing, dairy and medicinal plants cultivation under agri-horti-forest systems.
- Strengthening non-resource based livelihoods is another priority to upgrade skills to secure jobs outside the regions areas such as tailoring, retailing, and other entrepreneurship.

24. Integrated agriculture and water management practices

- Use of saline tolerant crop varieties
- Cultivate short cycle crops
- Less water intensive crop varieties that have market acceptability,
- Appropriate horticultural crops/ varieties
- Double cropping systems with soil enriching crops
- Better soil and water conservation practices
- Promote drip/sprinkler irrigation with packages of crops and farming systems

25. More macro level interventions include pollution control for improving sustainability and productivity of natural ecosystems as they change, and more stringent implementation of forestry and agriculture policies.

26. Interventions of organizations such as community level institutions such as PRIs should aim to strengthen them to consider climate change information in decision-making. This will also be supported by promotion of mechanisms to facilitate participatory and gender-inclusive decision making that includes inputs from micro-level institutions (at village, block district, state levels). Disaster Risk Reduction committees should be formed at village levels.

26. Efforts should be made to strengthen banking systems and improve access to it particularly for vulnerable people such as women and marginalized sections of the communities. Other interventions include strengthening early warning systems for drought, cyclones and floods for specific areas, and using decentralized and easily accessible information. Village communication systems through media such as public address system, wireless, community radio, PA system can support this.

27. Specific efforts for education and skill building in the related livelihood options, information and experiences on adaptation, and awareness of disaster management programs and insurance products targeting vulnerable populations in the communities will be an advantage.

**Vulnerability to drought:**

28. The severity of these impacts on the rural households, depend on several factors that govern the ability of these households to cope with the changes in climatic patterns. These factors include, inter alia:

- dependence on agriculture and the extent to which household income is being generated from agriculture and allied activities
- extent to which the individual/ household is involved in non-agricultural activities for income generation
- endowments and household assets that enable the individual/ household to tide over conditions of economic distress
- ability to diversify cropping pattern and intensity
- ability to migrate (temporary/ permanent)
- presence of strong community structures influencing awareness of the people regarding drought-related government schemes

29. Several of these factors are in turn governed by aspects such as access to markets, institutional mechanisms, road connectivity, level of education, possession of technical skill sets etc. Studies concerning differential vulnerability of Women and men due to different assets, capacities and access to resources should also be undertaken.

30. Prioritized initiatives from the above activities should build on the base line programs to add value to key initiatives, and perhaps most importantly strengthen co-ordination among these initiatives through the SDMAs, Shared Learning Dialogues and local district management committees. Interventions will be prioritized on sound operational model and sustainability. These efforts will result in an integrated portfolio of effective practices to enhance adaptive capacity of most vulnerable women and men in these and similar flood coastal areas.

**Recommendations on Mitigation and Adaptation options for OTELP**

31. Orissa Tribal Empowerment and livelihood Project was initiated in 2004 year and is in its consolidation phase now. The project is operational in Kandhamal, Gajapati, Koraput districts. Keeping in view the backwardness of the region and the climatic vagaries these districts experiences the following climate change mitigation and adaptation options are recommended:

32. The districts vary with respect to their rainfall patterns. Most of the districts in the region are completely dependent on agriculture, more particularly rice cultivation. However, the irrigation facilities are not adequate. Rice is staple food crop apart from other minor millets that are consumed such as ragi, bajra and wheat. Enhanced carbon dioxide concentrations that induce nature of global warming though is expected to enhance rice productivity, but subsequent increase in temperature will reduce rice and wheat productivity. In the next 50 years, it is expected that 1-2 degree rise in average temperature, which is expected reduce rice productivity by 10-15%. Therefore it is

suggested to encourage cultivation of minor millets such as ragi, jowar and others that were cultivated traditionally. However, technologies that may be available with agricultural universities in the country could be adopted to enhance the productivity of these minor millets and many recipes that can be prepared that are acceptable to communities at large. A care should be taken to undertake cultivation/domestication where possible of C4 plants.

33. Although it is difficult to switch to other crops that are considered staple such as rice, until such transformation is complete, several other measures of cultivation of rice and wheat could be adopted. Cultivation of rice is generally in by flooding conditions. Now the techniques are available to cultivate the rice consuming much less water without flooding. This could be adopted and diffusion of such technologies could be immediately undertaken. A farmer in Gulelu (in Semiliguda block) village is successfully cultivating SRI method of rice cultivation irrigating once a week. This practice reduces methane emissions considerably from the rice field.

34. The OTELP project is vigorously implementing soil and water conservation practices. One of the additional measures suggested is to enhance the soil carbon content in the soils through application of organic manures in sufficient quantities and practicing measures that retain organic carbon in the soils. Storage of organic carbon in soils contribute greatly to enhanced water retention capacities of the soil apart from enhancing the options for mitigating the climate change impacts.

35. Solar lighting options are already considered in the project, though are commendable, but the cost of such options are to be reviewed. Alternatively there several biomass and biogas energy options are available that could be effectively used. Across India several such renewable energy options are already demonstration, one such demonstration is in Karnataka under Biomass Energy Rural India (BERI) project supported from GEF. More specifically Koraput district, receives over 1300 mm of rainfall has reasonably high biomass in the village common lands and biomass from agriculture byproduct. Model villages could be set up to use biomass in the village to energize pumpsets for irrigation, lighting and flour mills wherein production, utilization and grid management can be made locally for use of local energy requirements and to contribute to the requirement of the state.

36. Another renewable energy option is biogas. There is an example of such unit in Gulelu village in Semliguda block of Koraput district, though not operational. Revival of such biogas options could help the farmers to light their houses with the gas and domestic cooking as well. Alternatively, community biogas could be encouraged.

37. Integrated village biomass development options. If the villages are to be made self reliant in energy, biomass and food crops, effective planning of villages to grow crops, cultivate trees and undertake agroforestry options are essential. Use of village common lands for planting and using these plantations for various energy and biomass requirement purposes should be initiated. The project is currently using JFM model for enhancing the biomass productivity, however, if the village community undertakes some of these activities takes voluntarily to plant trees along the road, in the habitations, homestead gardens and other common places, it would be helpful. Such an opportunity exists in Beheraguda and Ghuli, wherein the community is enthusiastic to plant trees through their nursery and creating ponds for irrigation.

38. Enhancing the motors using for irrigation pumps is another option that could be undertaken. Most of the irrigation pumps are less efficient and work at suboptimal levels of around 25%. There are retrofitting devices that enhances the efficiency to 40%. The project can undertake this option to enhance the motor efficiency and reduce the recurring costs on electricity. Ministry of power in Orissa is doing a similar exercise which could be involved in the project areas for the same purpose.

39. Livelihood diversification is another important issue that needs to be undertaken carefully that are climate friendly and culturally acceptable. Weaning the community away from use of natural resources is one of the easier options adopted in most natural resource management programmes. However, it is intended that natural resources must be used but sustainably and economically. Most of the Self help programmes and entry point activities delve on projects that may have negative impact on environment. Exercise should be taken to minimize impacts or adopt latest technologies that have no impact on the environment.

**ICRISAT-IFAD Grant Fund**

**Dr G.J.Patra**

**Consultant, ICRISAT Project.**

**Phase I Blocks (Visited 4 villages)**

1. A Self help group comprising of ten members started a Cashew Processing unit in the village T. Abasing of gumma Block of parallakhemundi ITDA by installing simple opening machines. MART is promoting the produce and the FNGO CCD is helping the members in procurement of the raw materials of the people.

2. In the village Tamula of the above block the project has been operating since six years. All the people of the village are ST (Soura) The people have formed 15 SHGs in the watershed. The members of the SHG vary from 15-20. The U.G comprising of 18 members cultivate by using the water supplied after constructing of a check dam. Another SHG members started the goatery the procuring goats from central cattle Breeding firm chiplima Sambalpur. The landless people have joined in different SHGs. The local prevailing wages in less than the Government and labourers benefited by the project work. The education of the children of the village to continuing. There is a school upto the class VIII with a hostel for the girl students. The quality of teaching is fare as understood from the student's ability. The villagers requested for a school compound wall. There is a tap with gravity flow water in the school. The number of bathrooms and latrines are not sufficient of the existing strength of the hostel. Migration of the labourers from the village has reduced. Shifting cultivation is still existing through the intensity has reduced. The villagers drink water from the tubewells. The user groups wanted timely supply of inputs for their cultivation.

3. The ICRISAT Interventions has been well accepted by the farmers and the farmers preferred ground nut Devi (ICGV91114) variety and started producing formal seeds for the economic enhancement Besides in formal seeds of pigeonpea varieties Asha ,Kamica and Laxmi are being produced by the farmers. They have grown 4.40 ha of groundnut breeder seed in the village Tahajung by active support of CCD FNGO/ during the rainy seasons; 2009. The Groundnut Variety Devi has been grown in an area of 9.30ha by 66 farmers spread over 14 villages of 10 blocks in Gajapati, Kalahani and Koraput districts for the production of breeder seed. The nucleus seeds for the purpose were supplied by the ICRISAT. The crop has been monitored by the state level team comprising of Director, OSSCA, ADR (Seeds), OUAT, Breeder (groundnut) OUAT and the officers of OTELP. The seeds after harvest and due processing would be procured by the Orissa seeds corporation for Foundation seed production. This intervention supported by ICRISAT under IFAD grant project 954 world benefit farmers for the economic enhancement and better livelihood of the tribal farmers.

4. In the village Kankoroda of Nuagada block there are 5(five) SHGs are functioning. The members do seasonal business goatary and apiary. Four check dams have been constructed by the VDC and 25Ae of land have been brought under cultivation. The farmers grow rice during rainy and mustard and vegetables during post-rainy season. Besides 4 wells has been dug for drinking water purposes. Three tanks have been constructed for water harvesting and life saving irrigations. After development of irrigation the shifting cultivation has been reduced. Migration of 123programme has been stopped and they work in their own area. All the children are in habit of going to schools. Some have admitted in the colleges.

5. In the village Nidhigada of Nuagada block, the FNGO PEACE is associated in the programme. There are 3 SHGs are functioning in the watershed, the number of members vary from 15-20. The groups started functioning since 2005. The VDC has constructed a check dam along with 200m diversion channel which benefited the farmers to irrigate 20-30ae of land. The villages have planted cashew and mango in the hilly slopes. The members of one SHG group started making scented phenyl and detergent and other two groups members are doing seasonal business. All house hold family have there own kitchen garden in which they plant banana, papaya, drumsticks, turmeric etc along with some vegetables. They have also constructed a channel to divert flow water during rainy seasons.

#### **Phase II Blocks. (visited seven villages)**

6. In Chalamput village of semiliguda block, The FNGO TSRD is supporting the programme. The inhabitants are gadaba tribe. They have formed 4 SHGs and have the programme of grocery, diaries and wanted for a herbal garden. The soil of the area is laterite and the farmers grow ragi, vegetables. The people live in the houses of less ventilation. The SHG members agreed to construct environmental friendly houses and wanted smokless Chullahs. Groundnut trial indicated the scope of its cultivation with 8-10 pods/plants. But the pods were eaten by the wild animals. Pigeon pea trial indicated that crop can be grown profitably. The member of SHG started a nursery in which Cashew, Bamboo and flower (Merigold) seedlings were raised. The villages Khamara and Masuri are adjacent to each other and the inhabitants are paraja tribes. These are come under Nandapur block of Koraput disttict. There are 14 and 8 SHG in those villages respectively. The FNGO TSRD is operating in these villages. In both the villages two nurseries have been functioning by the SHG members and the seedling of Bamboo, Cashew and flowers have been rised. The FNGO will lift the seedling on Payment for their plantation 124rogramme.

7. Two villages, namely podaiput and parajapuki are under Dasmantpur block of Koraput district. In the farmer village their were old 4 SHGs and there are dispute due to none matching of the accounts. New 4 SHGs were formed and they are engaged in seasonal business. There are 16 landless families in farmer village and are engaged in podu cultivation. The FNGO CYSD is associated with the programme in these two villages. Rice is the main crop in rainy season and Niger during post rainy season. Black gram varieties were supplied to the farmer village through ICRISAT intervention and the crop is in pod setting stage. Vegetables are grown in the kitchen garden of the villagers. The tribes are "paraja" in both the villages. VDCs have been formed in both the villages and the BDP have been prepared after PRA exercise. The VDC have started construction of a percolation tank in the village Podia put and they have plantation programme with tomato as the intercrop. Improved variety of tomato (BT10) has been grown by some farmers on agri-business purpose. In the hamlet village Chignamali there is one old SHG with 14 members and two new SHGs were formed with 12 members each. There are still 6 landless families are existing. The villagers have kitchen garden and one farmer grow nice variety Lalat under SRI method of cultivation. The SHG has completed in the near by nala under EP activity and planted mango seedling on both side land and they have the programme of a check dam on the nala.

8. In the village Gangapur of R.Udayagiri block of Gajapati district-5 3SHGs were formed with the assistance of SWWSII. The inhabitants are 'sabar' tribe. There is a free flow water tank and can irrigate about 10acres of land. One road with stone patching has been done under NREGS since a year. Maize is grown in the area and hybrid seed supplied by business people on credit and collect maize grains on their own fixed cost. The SHG members purchased goats and a UG has prepared a channel for irrigation. There is no electric supply to this watershed through the pods have been erected by the electric organization.

Visited the village gumiguda of Mohona block of Paralakhemundi ITDA which is being associated by FNGO Gram Vikas. There are 60 households in 3 hamlets. All the villages have formed 4 SHG. Villagers have constructed latrines with their own by partial help from the FNGO. The latrines would come to use after the flow irrigation is made available.

9. A Pigeon pea farmer's participatory trial of ICRISAT project was conducted and it is in pod setting stage. Four varieties have been included in the trial. There are 5 trials under these watershed different villages. Besides 12 trials on groundnut have been conducted by the active participation of the farmers. The villagers have plan of construction of a check dam and the sight is yet to be finalized.

#### **Recommendations:-**

- ◆ Maize is the main crop in R.Udayagiri and Nuagada block but the business people supply hybrid seeds which the farmers cannot use for the subsequent years. Hence arrangement may be made for this supply of composite varieties for seeds for their use for 3-5 years.
- ◆ Niger and mustard are grown extensively in the southern districts of Odisha. Since Niger and toria are self-incompatible crops, the SHGs should be supplied with apiary units for getting more income from honey and higher yield from the crop.
- ◆ Groundnut has been cultivated since long in Gajapati, Kalahandi & Kandhamal. The soils are suitable and pods per plant vary from 15-30. Hence seed production programme should be intensified in these districts during rainy season for getting more income as the cost benefit ratio has been worked out 1: 1.7. Besides this would solve the seed problem to some extent of the state.
- ◆ Turmeric is grown in Kandhamal and Koraput mostly under organic farming situation. Hence SHG group should promote for its export and the FNGO and RNGO should assist them in this programme.

**Annex II A**

**Consolidated Agreed Actions and Dates**

<b>Agreed actions</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Agreed date</b>
<b>Overall assessment of project implementation</b>		
1. Review quality of personnel engaged in villages and enhance quality through periodic capacity building	PSU, ITDA, NGOs	By Mar 2010
2. Seek expert inputs on Integrated Natural Resource Management strategies	PSU, ITDA, NGOs	By Jun 2010
3. Introduce systematic convergence with various government schemes	GoO, PSU, ITDA	By Mar 2010
<b>Livelihoods enhancement</b>		
4. Induction of efficient water use techniques like low cost drip & formalising norms for User Groups	PSU, ITDA, NGO	Jun 2010
5. Use of only PVC pipes in flow irrigation systems and conversion of earthen channels into PVC	PSU, ITDA, NGO	On going
6. Promotion of SRI, SMI and LEISA as a campaign	PSU, ITDA, NGOs	Jun 2010
7. Linkages with NABARD, NHM, Horticulture Department to promote horticulture in all villages	PSU, ITDA, NGO	Jun 2010
8. Tree forage and fodder promotion	PSU, ITDA, NGO	Jun 2010
9. Intensive Homestead Development	ITDA, NGOs	Jun 2010
<b>Rural Financial Services &amp; Gender</b>		
10. Further need based training for IGAs and exposure visits for the SHGs; benefit sharing of interest earned by SHG.	PSU, ITDA, NGO	On going
11. Rotational leadership among SHG and other CBO on priority basis.	PSU, ITDA, NGO	Jun 2010
<b>Tribal and PTGs development</b>		
12. Ensuring land <i>pattas</i> under FRA, OPLEA, etc. to all eligible households among the target groups in all Phase I villages & at least 50% in Phase II villages	PSU, ITDAs, NGOs	Sep 2010
13. Ensuring 100 days' employment under NREGS at least in 50% of Phase I villages	ITDAs, NGOs, VDCs	Jun 2010
14. Specialised action plan prepared for the PTGs like the Bonda in consultation with State Level Organisation (e.g. Bonda Development Agency) for reorienting their special empowerment and development needs.	PSU, ITDA, NGO	Jun 2010
<b>Climate Change</b>		
15. Awareness training on various aspects of climate change for the project staff, NGOs and communities (at least key leaders) with a training manual prepared.	PSU, ITDA, NGO, VDC	Jun 2010
16. Promotion of minor cereals like millets, sorghum and tuber crops.	PSU, ITDA, NGO	Jun 2010
<b>Project Implementation Performance</b>		
17. Review the remuneration structure at all levels and support given to NGOs and remove the anomalies	GoO & PSU	Jan 2010
18. Review the WDT composition and placement of other village level workers to enhance quality of personnel working in villages	PSU, ITDA, NGOs	Jan 2010
19. Review the district-level coordination mechanism to enhance convergence	PSU, ITDA	Jan 2010
20. Allow flexibility in the use of funds between land & water development & others sectors where funds for the former are provided drawn through convergence	IFAD, PSU	Mar 2010
21. Re-allocate budgets to provide for continued TA support in the event of withdrawal of DFID TA	IFAD, PSU	Jun 2010
<b>Fiduciary</b>		

22. Urgent steps need to be taken to reconcile the VDC/ VLSC balances against ITDA books as per VDC/VLSC Cash Books and bank statements through external firms of CAs engaged by ITDAs as internal auditors.	PSU & ITDAs	By 31 Mar 2010
23. Pending VDF deposits must be identified VLSC-wise and deposited in VDF account	PSU & ITDAs	By 31 Jan 2010
24. A refresher training must be conducted about IFAD's Procurement Guidelines at all levels	PSU & ITDAs	By 31 Mar 2010
25. The Project is advised to appoint Statutory Auditors for 2009-10 through a fair and competitive process using the QCBS method. CFO must certify the completeness of audit report as per approved TOR prior to payment.	PSU	By 30 Apr 2010
26. ICO official dealing with finance and procurement must visit the Project and review the relevant procedures to further strengthen and streamline IFAD procedures	IFAD India Office	By 31 Mar 2010
<b>Exit Strategy</b>		
27. Develop detailed action plans to implement an exit-cum-sustainability and growth strategy based on WASSAN study	PSU	30 Jun 2010

**Minutes of the Stakeholders Workshop  
13<sup>th</sup> November, 2009  
IMAGE, Bhubaneswar**

The Stakeholders Workshop as a part of the Joint Review Mission, November 2009 was conducted on 13<sup>th</sup> November, 2009 under the chairmanship of The Principal Secretary, ST & SC Development Department and Chairperson, OTELP. The ITDA officials, FNGO Representatives, members of the resource organizations, mission members and PSU members attended the workshop.

The Programme Director, OTELP welcome the mission members, dignitaries and participants with his introductory address which is followed by the introduction by the participants. The PSU, OTELP has made various publications on agriculture production, collective marketing, new letter, communication strategy etc which was inaugurated by the Principal Secretary, ST & SC Development Department and Chairperson, OTELP.

The Team leader, IFAD Representative and DFID Representative made their observations from the review and filed visit to the programme villages. The major observations are on ensuring convergence with other mainstream development programmes to have sustainability of the efforts and an efficient withdrawal of the programme from the villages. Capacity building of the partner NGOs and staff along with the communities are to be further strengthened. Efforts for the sustainable production enhancement from agriculture and allied activities to be strengthened and programme management issues like remuneration to the project staff working at various levels with FNGOs, ITADAs and PSU needs to be reviewed and enhanced.

The resource organizations engaged by the PSU through DFID TA made presentations on the following areas:

- Impact Assessment of OTELP Phase I programme villages: Sambodhi, New Delhi.
- Sustainable Exit Strategy: WASSAN, Hyderabad.
- Upscaling of Solar Electrification intervention under OTELP: CTRAN, Bhubaneswar.

In the post lunch session of the workshop, the participants were divided into five groups for a group discussion and deliberation on the following issues:

- Production Enhancement from Agriculture & Allied Livelihoods Activities
- Sustainability of the land & Water Management interventions made.
- Promotion of SHG and micro enterprise
- Improvement of Land Resources of the Landless received land through various schemes/ acts of Govt.
- Convergence

Each group presented their summary of the discussion and suggestions for bringing improvements in the respective areas.

The list of participants attended the stakeholders are presented below:

SI No	Name & Designation
1	Ashok Kumar Tripathy, Pr. Secy, ST & SC Deptt.
2	Deep Joshi, Mission Leader
3	Vincent Darlong, IFAD
4	Deepak Mohanty, PD, OTELP
5	Supriya Pattanayak, DFID
6	S.K. Panda, R&AO, OTELP
7	Sandhya Tamurkar

8	K.K.Raika, PO (PM&E), Gajapati
9	Darshan Kumar Sahoo
10	Debdash Mohapatra
11	Gopabandhu Behera, President
12	Akssus, B. Cuttack, Rayagada
13	Ramesh Chandra Jena, MART
14	Sridhar Kumar Sahoo
15	Meghananda Nanda, MART
16	Girish Chandra
17	Mohan Kumar Bal
18	H.K. Behera, PA, ITDA, Paralakhemundi
19	Ramulu Achari, MFO, OTELP, Pkd
20	Prasanna Maharana, CYSD, Koraput
21	Debananda Das, WDT Social Jagruti
22	Prasanna Kumar Dash, WDT, PRADHAN, Balliguda
23	Sanjeeb Kumar Sahoo, PO (CB)
24	Tara Prasad Tripathy, WDT, Social, PRADHAN Balliguda
25	Er.Sk. Khurshid Ali, WDO, OTELP, PKD
26	Surendra Panda, PIA, SWWS, Pkd
27	Rajendra Panda, MIS(Executive)
28	Salem Gamango, PO (CB), Kalahandi
29	Madhusmita Sahu, MFO, Kalahandi
30	Bijay Kumar Satpathy, PIA, Gram Vikash
31	Manas Ranjan Kar, OTELP, Gunupur
32	Bantu Haldar, A.O, Bhawanipatna
33	Subrat Kumar Sahoo, FNGO,
34	Umakanta Nayak, FNGO, Representatives, Th.Rampur
35	Prasanta Kumar Sahu, PIA, Rep. PEACE, Mohana, Gajapati
36	Debadutta Rout, MIS (Executive), OTELP, Gunupur
37	Arjun Sahu, FNGO, Antodaya, Kalhandi
38	L.C. Patra, PA, ITDA
39	S.K. Kar, PO (CB), PSU, BBSR
40	Sanjay Kumar Nahak
41	HariPriya Patra, WDO, OTELP, Kpt
42	Sundarlal Seal, PA, ITDA, Malkangiri
43	Rajendra Majhi, PO (PM&E), Malkangiri
44	Trilochan Parida, MFO, Malkangiri
45	Askhya Kumar Sahoo, WDO, Kalahandi
46	L. K. Udgata Forestry Officer, Kpt
47	E.K.Bakhala, PO (CB), Nawrangpur
48	Susanta Kumar dalai, Forestry Officer, Malkangiri
49	Durga Prasad Tripathy, FNGO, HARMONY
50	M. Muralidhran, MART
51	S.K. Mohapatra, Manager, MIS
52	Prabir Kuamr Patra, MIS(Executive), Malkangiri
53	Tapati Das, MIS (Executive), Nabarangapur
54	Nityananda Pradhan, PARIVARTAN
55	Goutam Barik, (TRAN Consultant)
56	Sabita Samantaray
57	Pravat Satpathy
58	Bishnu Prasad
59	Srabani Dalal, PO (CB), Pkd

60	Sukanta Mohanty, FNGO, SWADESI
61	Surendra Pradhan, JKP, WDT. Agriculture
62	Nabakishore Parida, A.O, Pkd
63	Santosh Kumar Sahu
64	Faguram Marandi
65	Debajyoti Jena
66	Jyohnyarani Patra, MFO, OTELP
67	Rajkishore Panda, WDO, Balliguda
68	Abhimanyu Kanhar
69	Debasis jena
70	Kailash Mohanty
71	Ravindran
72	Ranjan Rout, PRIA
73	Abhisekha Kumar Sadhu
74	Akhil Ranjan Panda
75	Rameswar Sahu, FNGO
76	Tirupati Padhy, FNGO, RASS,
77	A.K.Barik,MFO
78	Biranchi Narayan Rath, PO (PM&E), Koraput
79	Jagamohan Debata, FNGO, Rep. GVT. Lanjigarh
80	Sweta Sarkar, GVT
81	Sidhi Narayan Singha, TSRD, Koraput
82	Ruben Sitaram, AO, ITDA, Malkangiri
83	Pramila Swain
84	R.. Behera, PST
85	Arun Kumar Das
86	A.C Patra, PA, ITDA, Th.Rampur
87	Manabi Rout, PIA, SWWS
88	K.C.Aich, Consultant
89	A.K. Pradhan, SMS
90	Ajit Panda, FNGO. Rep.
91	S.N. Sarangi,
92	Kalyani Mishra, MIS (Executive), balliguda
93	Swarnalata Behera, MFO, Balliguda
94	C.Sai Sudha, Newcocept
95	Sambit Mishra, NCIS
96	Binayak Padhy, MIS(Executive)
97	Pabitra Mohan bara, PO (CB)
98	Ashwani Kumar Tripathy, FNGO
99	Ketra Mohan Khunti, FNGO,ODC
100	Er. Madhu Mishra, Biswa
101	Pradeep Kumar Dal, PRADATA
102	Gajendra Kumar Das
103	Saroj Kumar Das, RCDC
104	Sanjay Kumar Ray, Consultant
105	P. Mohapatra, Sambondhi
106	R.K. Panda, CPSW
107	Harihar Mallick
108	Barendra Mishra
109	A. Rabindra
110	Suresh Pattnaik
111	Pravanjan Mohapatra

